

Author's accepted manuscript (postprint)

Reduced acid deposition leads to a new start for brown trout (*Salmo trutta*) in an acidified lake in Southern Norway

Lund, E., Garmo, Ø. A., de Wit, H. A., Kristensen, T., Hawley, K. L. & Wright, R. F.

Published in: Water, Air and Soil Pollution

DOI: 10.1007/s11270-018-4013-9

Available online: 27 Oct 2018

Citation:

Lund, E., Garmo, Ø. A., de Wit, H. A., Kristensen, T., Hawley, K. L. & Wright, R. F. (2018). Reduced acid deposition leads to a new start for brown trout (*Salmo trutta*) in an acidified lake in Southern Norway. *Water, Air and Soil Pollution*, 229(11): 368. doi: 10.1007/s11270-018-4013-9

This is an Accepted Manuscript of an article published by Springer in *Water, Air and Soil Pollution* on 27/10/2018, available online: <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11270-018-4013-9>

1 **Reduced acid deposition leads to new start for brown trout (*Salmo***
2 ***trutta*) in an acidified lake in southern Norway**

3
4 Espen Lund^A, espen.lund@niva.no, corresponding author, phone +47 47400858, ORCID 0000-0003-
5 4089-9068

6
7 Øyvind A. Garmo^A, oyvind.garmo@niva.no

8
9 Heleen A. de Wit^A, heleen.de.wit@niva.no, ORCID 0000-0001-5646-5390

10

11 Torstein Kristensen^B, torstein.kristensen@nord.no, ORCID 0000-0002-2640-4260

12

13 Kate L. Hawley^{A,C}, kate.hawley@niva.no

14

15 Richard F. Wright^A, richard.wright@niva.no

16

17 ^A Norwegian Institute for Water Research (NIVA), Gaustadalléen 21, 0349 Oslo, Norway.

18 ^B Nord University, Universitetsalléen 11, 8026 Bodø, Norway.

19 ^C Current: Faculty of Environmental Sciences and Natural Resource Management, Norwegian

20 University of Life Sciences, 1432 Ås, Norway. kate.louise.hawley@nmbu.no

21

22 **Keywords:** acidification, acid neutralising capacity, fish, recovery

23

24 **Acknowledgements**

25 The long-term data series at Langtjern would not have been possible without the enthusiastic and

26 dogged efforts of our emeritus colleagues Arne Henriksen, Magne Grande, and Sigbjørn Andersen

27 and the local help of Kolbjørn Sønsteby.

28

29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53

Abstract

Acid deposition has led to acidification and loss of fish populations in thousands of lakes and streams in Norway. Since the peak in the late 1970s acid deposition has been greatly reduced, and acidified surface waters have shown chemical recovery. Biological recovery, in particular fish populations, however, has lagged behind. Long-term monitoring of water chemistry and fish populations in Lake Langtjern, south-eastern Norway, show that around 2008 chemical recovery had progressed to the point at which natural reproduction of brown trout (*Salmo trutta*) reoccurred. The stocked brown trout reproduced in the period 2008–2014, probably for the first time since the 1960s, but reproduction and/or early life stage survival was very low. The results indicate that chemical thresholds for reproduction in this lake are approximately $\text{pH} = 5.1$, $\text{Al}_i = 26 \mu\text{g/l}$, $\text{ANC} = 47 \mu\text{eq/l}$, and $\text{ANC}_{\text{Oaa}} = 10 \mu\text{eq/l}$ as annual mean values. These thresholds agree largely with the few other cases of documented recovery of brown trout in sites in Norway, Sweden and the UK. Occurrence and duration of acidic episodes have decreased considerably since the 1980s, but still occur and probably limit reproduction success.

54 Introduction

55 During the 20th century acid deposition caused environmental damage in large regions of
56 Europe and eastern North America. In Norway, thousands of lakes and streams were acidified, with
57 the resultant loss and damage to freshwater fish populations (Hesthagen et al. 1999). Southern
58 Norway is particularly vulnerable to acid deposition due to the highly siliceous and weathering-
59 resistant bedrock and overburden, and thin and patchy organic-rich soils (Wright and Henriksen
60 1978). Acid deposition in Europe peaked in the late 1970s and has declined sharply over the past 30
61 years (Schöpp et al. 2003), largely as a result of implementation of international agreements to
62 reduce the emissions of acidifying air pollutants (UNECE 2014). Acidified freshwaters in Norway have
63 shown dramatic improvements in water chemistry as a response to declining acid deposition
64 (Skjelkvåle et al. 1998; Garmo et al. 2014; Gray et al. 2016). In many cases, however, biological
65 recovery has lagged behind chemical recovery (Hesthagen et al. 2011; Hesthagen et al. 2016).

66
67 Damage to salmonid fish populations, in particular the brown trout (*Salmo trutta*), in acidified lakes
68 is usually due to recruitment failure. The eggs and young fry are the most sensitive life stages, and
69 they are often exposed to the acidic water during snowmelt (Overrein et al. 1980; Serrano et al.
70 2008). In marginally-acidified lakes stocking with young fish may be successful, but reproduction
71 often fails. Toxicity is largely due to elevated concentrations of inorganic aluminium species (termed
72 here Al_i) (Baker and Schofield 1982; Rosseland et al. 1990). Toxicity of Al_i is ameliorated by dissolved
73 organic carbon (DOC) in the water through formation of Al-humus complexes (Cronan et al. 1986).

74
75 Al_i is mobilized from soils by acidic water. The strong acid anions sulphate (SO_4) and nitrate (NO_3) in
76 acid deposition acidify the soil and mobilize Al_i (Reuss et al. 1990). Acid neutralising capacity (ANC),
77 defined as the equivalent sum of the concentrations of base cations minus the equivalent sum of the
78 concentrations of strong acid anions, is commonly used as a measure of the acidification of
79 freshwaters (Reuss et al. 1987). There was a close relationship between ANC and the brown trout

80 population status in lakes in Norway during the 1980s when acidification was near its peak (Lien et
81 al. 1996). Inclusion of organic strong acids (ANC_{Oaa} ; “organic acid adjusted”) slightly improved the
82 correlation (Lydersen et al. 2004).

83

84 Documentation of chemical and biological recovery in acidified lakes requires systematic long-term
85 monitoring. In southern Norway, Lake Langtjern is one such monitoring site where water chemistry
86 and fish populations have been monitored since the 1970s (Henriksen and Wright 1977; Henriksen
87 and Grande 2002; De Wit et al. 2014). The native brown trout population disappeared around 1960,
88 probably because of acidification (Henriksen and Grande 2002). pH in the lake was generally below
89 5.0 in the 1970s. Since then, the lake has been stocked several times for research purposes with
90 brown trout, brook trout (*Salvelinus fontinalis*) and rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) to study
91 the relative tolerance of various fish species to acid water (Grande et al. 1978). The stocking did not
92 result in natural reproduction in the lake, until recent findings of small, non-stocked brown trout.
93 Here we investigate the recent fish recovery in relation to changes in the water chemistry of Lake
94 Langtjern over the 42-year period 1973–2014.

95

96 Materials and methods

97 The catchment and the lake

98 Lake Langtjern (<https://www.niva.no/en/services/environmental-monitoring/langtjern>) is a
99 small, headwater lake located in Flå township, Buskerud county, about 75 km north of Oslo, south-
100 eastern Norway (Fig. 1). Lake Langtjern has been a site for monitoring and research on acidification
101 since 1972. It is undisturbed from direct human influence and has never been limed. The lake and its
102 catchment are included in several national and international monitoring programs. The lake is 0.23
103 km² with catchment including the lake 4.7 km². The lake is relatively shallow, with maximum depth
104 12 m and mean depth 2 m. The catchment is mixed sparse forest of pine, spruce and birch. Soils are

105 thin and organic-rich podsoles developed on weathering-resistant glacial moraine and bedrock of
106 gneisses and granites. The catchment is 63 % forest, 16 % peatland and 16 % exposed bedrock. Apart
107 from a minor amount of forest harvesting, there is no other human disturbance or sources of
108 pollution to the lake or the catchment. The lake and its catchment including exclusive fishing rights
109 have been leased to the Norwegian Institute for Water Research for research and monitoring
110 purposes since 1973.

111 The lake has three inflowing streams; only the largest of these (LAE02) and the outlet
112 (LAE01) provide suitable habitat as spawning beds for trout. The width of the outlet stream is 1–2 m.
113 The outlet has two dam constructions: an old large stone dam previously used to float timber and a
114 newer concrete dam downstream with v-notch weir installed in 1973 for measuring discharge. The
115 older stone dam restricts free water flow when discharge is large and has an opening at the bottom
116 which allows fish passage both ways at all levels of water discharge. The v-notch weir has a waterfall
117 that effectively prevents any upstream migration of fish. From the lake outlet, it is about 30 m to the
118 stone dam and 100 m to the concrete dam. The main inlet (LAE02) has a width of about 0.5–1 m.
119 Both streams have sections of shallow water, but also some deeper pools. The substrate varies from
120 fine to coarse. Suitable brown trout spawning substrates are more common in the inlet (LAE02) than
121 in the outlet.

122 Deposition data

123 The nearby stations Brekkebygda (1998–2015) and Gulsvik (1974–1997) are part of the
124 national atmospheric monitoring programme run by the Norwegian Institute for Air Research (NILU).
125 Bulk deposition is collected in weekly samples, and volume and concentrations of major ions
126 measured at NILU and reported annually (Aas et al. 2016).

127 Discharge data

128 Langtjern is a station in the national hydrology monitoring programme run by The
129 Norwegian Water Resources and Energy Directorate (NVE). Discharge is measured continuously by
130 water-level recorder at the v-notch weir. The data are reported as mean daily discharge.

131 Water chemistry data

132 Samples for water chemistry have been collected weekly from the outlet since 1973, except
133 during an 18-month period with no funding in 1984–1985. Water chemistry parameters relevant to
134 acidification have been analysed; these include major cations and anions, aluminium species (from
135 1986), and dissolved organic carbon (from 1986). The inlets and the lake itself have also been
136 sampled, but not as frequently or as systematically as the outlet. The monitoring data and analytical
137 methods used are reported annually (Garmo et al. 2016).

138 Fish data

139 Fish catch and stocking information for the period 1906–1971 was derived from log books
140 kept by the local fishermen and other anecdotal information from local people. Beginning in 1972
141 experimental fish stockings and gill net catches were systematically recorded (Henriksen and Grande
142 2002). During the period 2000–2003, investigations were conducted to assess the potential for
143 natural recruitment of brown trout in the lake. In autumn 2000, 216 fertilized brown trout eggs of
144 the Nordmarka (Oslo) strain were placed at potential spawning sites in the outlet (72 eggs in 3
145 boxes) and main inlet (144 eggs in 6 boxes) and then inspected periodically for survival rates to

146 hatching in May 2001. In September 2002, the streams were sampled by electrofishing with a
147 backpack apparatus (Bohlin et al. 1989). In August 2003, the lake was sampled by 9 multi mesh
148 survey nets of 32 m and 4 single mesh nets of 25 m with mesh widths 10 mm, 12.5 mm, 16 mm and
149 22 mm.

150 In August 2010, October 2011, October 2012, August 2013 and August 2014, the outlet and
151 main inlet were sampled by one or two passes of electrofishing, except 2014 when only outlet was
152 sampled. The outlet stream was sampled in an area of ca. 150 m², covering the full width of the
153 stream from the outlet down to the V-notch weir about 100 m downstream. The inlet was sampled
154 in an area of ca. 130 m², covering the full width of the stream from the lake to about 130 m
155 upstream. Length and weight of the captured fish were measured, and the fish then released into
156 the same stream. Young-of-the-year (age 0+) were counted to assess the year specific reproduction.
157 This age class was separated from older classes (>0+) mainly by fish lengths, but also by reading
158 scales samples of some individuals. Gender and sexual maturation were determined only when
159 possible.

160 Statistical methods

161 We analysed for break points in the various data series by means of the software package
162 Change-Point Analyzer ver. 2.3 (Taylor Enterprises, Inc.), where annual means were analysed for
163 significant changes with 95 % confidence level using 1000 bootstraps without replacements. In some
164 series, data were grouped to avoid violation of the assumptions of independent errors.

165 Duration of extremes was estimated by counting days between consecutive measurements
166 of extreme values, assuming the values to be extreme in the period between the actual
167 measurements. We used the thresholds of ANC 10 µeq l⁻¹, ANC_{oaa} -5 µeq l⁻¹, pH 4.8 and Al_i 50 µg l⁻¹.
168 Days between two consecutive measurements were counted if both measured values were below
169 the thresholds for ANC, ANC_{oaa} or pH and above the threshold for Al_i. Measurements were weekly
170 and the expected count between two such values was therefore seven.

171 Results

172 Water chemistry

173 The concentrations of SO_4 in the outlet have decreased sharply since the peak years in the
174 1970s (Fig. 2). This has been in response to the large decrease in SO_4 deposition – from about 40
175 $\text{meq m}^{-2}\text{yr}^{-1}$ in the late 1970s to about $10 \text{ meq m}^{-2}\text{yr}^{-1}$ in the 2010s (Fig. 2). The large decrease in SO_4
176 deposition from 1991 to 1997 corresponds to the decrease in SO_4 concentrations in the outlet from
177 1993 to 2000, with a delayed response of less than two years (Table 1) (Fig. 2). The decreasing
178 concentrations of SO_4 in the outlet have been accompanied in part by lower concentrations of base
179 cations such as Ca, and in part by higher pH and lower concentration of Al_i . The ANC and ANC_{Oaa} have
180 increased, and the water has become less toxic to fish (Table 1). At Langtjern concentrations of
181 nitrate (NO_3) are in the range $1\text{--}2 \mu\text{eq l}^{-1}$, showing lower values in recent decades. Thus nitrogen
182 deposition plays a minor role relative to sulphur in surface water acidification at this site. TOC has
183 increased since the mid 1980s, which is the reason for the slight decline in ANC_{Oaa} in the period
184 2008–2014.

185 The 42-year record of annual SO_4 deposition and mean concentrations of SO_4 , Ca, ANC,
186 ANC_{Oaa} and pH in the outlet had change-points during 1997–2001, with decreased SO_4 deposition,
187 SO_4 and Ca and increased ANC, ANC_{Oaa} and pH (Fig. 2). A second change point was found in 1991–
188 1992. The change-points for ANC and ANC_{Oaa} in 2000 had confidence intervals which included 2002
189 and 2001, respectively. The decrease in SO_4 of $41 \mu\text{eq l}^{-1}$ was associated with a decrease of Ca of
190 $11 \mu\text{eq l}^{-1}$ and an increase of ANC of $28 \mu\text{eq l}^{-1}$.

191 The occurrence and duration of acidic episodes have decreased considerably since the 1980s
192 (Fig. 3). During 1973–1992 in the Langtjern outlet, there were many periods of more than 90
193 consecutive days of $\text{pH} < 4.8$. Before 1995 it was usual to have more than 14 days of $\text{pH} < 4.8$ every
194 year. Then, in the period 1996–2014, there were 11 years without consecutive weekly
195 measurements of $\text{pH} < 4.8$. Periods of $\text{Al}_i > 50 \mu\text{g l}^{-1}$ were more frequent and much longer before

196 1995 than after. Since 1995, only two years had high Al_i periods of 14 days or more. Periods of $ANC <$
197 $10 \mu eq l^{-1}$ were more frequent and of much longer duration before 1990 than after. After 1990, only
198 three years had such periods: 1991, 1994 and 2000. For $ANC_{0aa} < -5 \mu eq l^{-1}$, there were fewer and
199 shorter periods after year 2001.

200

201 Fish

202 According to anecdotal information from the local fishermen and log books on fish catches in
203 Lake Langtjern, the lake lost its population of brown trout during the 1960s, probably due to
204 acidification. This “original” population was a result of several stockings of brown trout since ca.
205 1906 and the natural offspring of these. Gill net catches were relatively good for the first decades of
206 the 1900s, but then very poor in 1967–1969. From 1972, the lake was managed for research
207 purposes and repeatedly stocked with brown trout and also brook trout usually aged 1+ (Fig. 4)
208 (Henriksen and Grande 2002). The last stocking was of 400 brown trout in June 2006. There was no
209 systematic tagging of the stocked fish, but most were fin clipped. The stocked fish were also
210 captured (and killed), usually by use of gill nets each summer, with the last gill net catch conducted
211 in 2011. The gill net catches usually corresponded to the previous stocking of fish, *i.e.* the stocked
212 fish were recognized (by size and fin clippings) in the catches some 2–4 years after release (Fig. 4).
213 Captured fish were mainly marked (fin clipping) confirming recaptures of stocked fish. Unmarked
214 captures, which could be wild or stocked, were very rare and did not point to an ongoing natural
215 reproduction. During the period 1992–2000, recapture of stocked fish was estimated to 20%
216 (Henriksen and Grande 2002). The remaining 80% of the stocked fish usually disappeared after 6–8
217 years, presumably owing to natural causes, but possibly as a result of the acidification. There usually
218 were mature individuals among the captured fish. Probably, there have been mature fish in the lake
219 in varying numbers since the 1970s, but the gill net captures have not indicated any successful
220 reproduction of trout.

221 The studies of possible trout recruitment starting in the winter 2000-01 gave negative
222 results. In May 2001, all eggs in the experimental boxes in the substrate were dead when inspected.
223 At the same time, dead eggs from natural spawning were also observed. The September 2002
224 electrofishing resulted in no catches in the streams. The August 2003 lake sampling by gill nets gave
225 no catch of non-stocked fish. Studies were resumed in 2010, and for the first time recruitment of
226 young brown trout was observed. The electrofishing in the outlet (LAE01) and the major inlet
227 (LAE02) in 2010–2014 resulted in captures of non-stocked brown trout each year (Table 2). These
228 fish were not fin clipped, and they were much smaller than the expected size of the stocked fish
229 from 2006. In 2011, 2012 and 2014 there were electrofishing catches of young-of-the-year brown
230 trout, with fish lengths < 8 cm in August catches and < 9 cm in October. Mature individuals of both
231 sexes, and of both wild (< 27 cm, n=3) and stocked origin (> 38 cm, n=2), were captured in the outlet
232 in 2011 and 2012.

233

234 Discussion

235 The chemical recovery at Langtjern follows the well-documented pattern seen in acidified
236 lakes and streams in many parts of Europe and eastern North America (Stoddard et al. 1999; Jeffries
237 et al. 2003; Skjelkvåle et al. 2007; Futter et al. 2014; Monteith et al. 2014; Rask et al. 2014; Driscoll et
238 al. 2016). The reduced deposition of SO_4 has led to lower concentrations of SO_4 in surface waters. pH
239 and ANC have increased while Al_i has decreased. In addition, TOC has increased, which is a result of
240 increasing organic matter solubility related to lower electrolyte concentrations and reduced acidity
241 (De Wit et al. 2007). Also, concentrations of NO_3 decreased, probably as a combined result of climate
242 warming (less snow cover) and lower N deposition (de Wit et al. 2008).

243 The lag time of <2 years between reductions in SO_4 deposition and decrease in
244 concentrations of SO_4 in the lake observed at Langtjern is also not unexpected, as soil processes such
245 as adsorption and desorption of SO_4 are minor in young, organic-rich soils such as those at Langtjern
246 (Reuss and Johnson 1986). The in-lake processes that also act to dampen changes in SO_4

247 concentrations are also apparently of minor importance relative to the through-flux of SO₄ in the
248 lake (Couture et al. 2016).

249 The fish catches indicate an important qualitative change in the brown trout ecology in Lake
250 Langtjern: the stocked fish now reproduce, *albeit* to a very low extent and maybe not every year.
251 Thus, water quality in the outlet and inlet streams is apparently close to a critical limit for successful
252 brown trout reproduction.

253 The exact year of the first successful reproduction in recent times cannot be ascertained, but
254 we know from the electrofishing that young-of-the-year brown trout were produced in 2011, 2012
255 and 2014 (Table 2). The estimated age of older captured fish suggests that brown trout reproduced
256 also in 2008 and 2009. Gill net sampling, electrofishing and egg exposure experiments indicate that
257 reproduction probably did *not* occur in in 2001 and 2002. The August 2003 gill net sampling in the
258 lake would not have been able to capture potential young-of-year, as they would have been residing
259 in the stream; thus there are no data on the trout reproduction in 2003. Hence, the first successful
260 reproduction was probably in the period 2003–2008.

261 Langtjern is one of a few acid water monitoring sites in Norway at which long-term data
262 record the recovery of the brown trout following reductions in acid deposition. Hesthagen et al.
263 (2011) have documented the revitalisation of the brown trout population in Lake Saudlandsvatn,
264 southernmost Norway. Here the native population was severely depleted, but never completely lost,
265 and was able to naturally reproduce when water quality improved in the 1990s. Similarly, brown
266 trout recruitment became increasingly successful in streams in the River Vikedal catchment
267 (Hesthagen et al. 2001) during the 1990s, *albeit* with occasional setbacks due to acidic episodes
268 (Hesthagen et al. 2016).

269 There are only a few documented cases of recovery of fish populations from acidified waters
270 elsewhere in Europe and eastern North America. This appears to be because of the paucity of long-
271 term data monitoring fish populations, but perhaps also because of factors acting to delay biological
272 recovery in response to chemical recovery. In Sweden, the thousands of acidified lakes have shown

273 chemical recovery since the 1980s (Futter et al. 2014), but there are apparently few lakes in which
274 the long-term data are sufficient to document recovery of fish populations (Holmgren 2014). Valinia
275 et al. (2014) found that in a dataset of 28 Swedish lakes, the roach (*Rutilus rutilus*) population had
276 been lost in 14 lakes due to acidification in the 1980s, but in 2010 it had reappeared in 5 of these in
277 response to chemical recovery. In Finland there has been widespread recovery of perch (*Perca*
278 *fluviatilis*) populations, but the more acid-sensitive roach shows much less recovery (Rask et al.
279 2014). In the United Kingdom two of the 22 sites in the acid waters monitoring network (AWMN)
280 now show recovery of brown trout populations (Malcolm et al. 2014) in response to the general
281 improvement in water quality due to reduced sulphur deposition (Monteith et al. 2014). In the
282 eastern United States long-term monitoring data from 43 lakes in the Adirondack Mountains, New
283 York, show reduced acidity in response to decreased sulphur deposition, but so far there have been
284 no major improvements in populations of brook trout (Baldigo et al. 2016). Likewise in eastern
285 Canada there have been several reports of improved fish populations in acidified lakes and streams
286 of Atlantic Canada (Lacoul et al. 2011) and in acidified lakes near Sudbury, Ontario (Gunn and Keller
287 1990, Snucins et al. 2001).

288 Chemical recovery proceeds along a continuum, whereas biological recovery is often marked
289 by thresholds. There have been many studies of the tolerance of fish species to acidified waters, in
290 particular the brown trout. Empirical data for water chemistry and brown trout populations from
291 synoptic surveys of 1000 lakes in Norway show that there were rather sharp thresholds of ANC for
292 the transition between “not affected” and “reduced” populations, and between “reduced” and
293 “extinct” populations in the 1980s (Bulger et al. 1993, Lien et al. 1996). Fitting a logistic expression to
294 the data explained 54% of the variance. Including organic acids in the expression for ANC_{Oaa}
295 increased the strength of these relationships to 56% (Lydersen et al. 2004). ANC_{Oaa} is particularly
296 appropriate in humic lakes, such as Langtjern. A threshold for ANC_{Oaa} of 8 $\mu\text{eq/l}$ gave a 95%
297 probability for no population damage to brown trout in Norwegian lakes based on the survey data
298 from 1986.

299 Hesthagen et al. (2008)) revisited these thresholds based on a new survey of the Norwegian
300 lakes conducted in 1995. Their analysis indicates that in 1995 the threshold for 95% probability for
301 no population damage to brown trout was ANC_{Oaa} 48 $\mu\text{eq/l}$, substantially higher than the value for
302 the 1986 data. They suggest that the higher ANC_{Oaa} threshold found for the 1995 data might be
303 caused by a lower pH and a higher Al_i concentration at a given ANC value in 1995 than in the 1980s.
304 But this difference could also be caused by the lag times between changes in water chemistry and
305 population status in lakes.

306 Based on the long-term field data from the streams in the River Vikedal catchment
307 Hesthagen et al. (2016) suggest that recruitment of brown trout can give low density of fry at ANC_{Oaa}
308 levels of -18 to -5 $\mu\text{eq l}^{-1}$, increased but unstable densities at ANC_{Oaa} -5 to +10 $\mu\text{eq l}^{-1}$, and steady
309 increase in density at ANC_{Oaa} above 10 $\mu\text{eq l}^{-1}$. They indicate that ANC_{Oaa} of 20–25 $\mu\text{eq l}^{-1}$ is necessary
310 for significant recovery of young brown trout in streams. This value is consistent with the observed
311 fish recovery at Lake Saudlandsvatn (Hesthagen et al. 2011). The UK data of Malcolm et al. (2014)
312 indicate threshold value of ANC_{Oaa} in the range 7 to 38 $\mu\text{eq l}^{-1}$, for 80% probability of brown trout fry
313 present in two of three sampled stream reaches.

314 The data from Langtjern fit this picture. For the period 2008–2014 during which
315 reproduction occurred, the outlet water chemistry mean values of ANC_{Oaa} was 10 $\mu\text{eq l}^{-1}$ (Table 1),
316 the threshold indicated by Hesthagen et al. (2016)) for unstable densities of young brown trout in
317 running water. Further, the mean values for 2008–2014 were similar to the mean values for 2000–
318 2007, suggesting that the conditions were close to the critical limits also prior to 2008.

319 The ANC in Lake Langtjern is not likely to further increase appreciably soon. There is little
320 room for further reductions in SO_4 deposition as levels in 2015 were only 7% of those in the peak
321 year 1980 (Aas et al. 2016). Nitrate makes only a minor contribution to ANC and appears to be
322 declining (De Wit et al. 2008). Thus any major increase in ANC will have to come from increasing
323 concentrations of base cations caused by replenishment of soil base cation pools due to natural
324 weathering, a process that typically takes decades (Hodson and Langan 1999). ANC_{Oaa} , on the other

325 hand, could increase with a decline in TOC. ANCoaa is the organic acid adjusted ANC, where organic
326 acids (TOC) are subtracted from the base cation concentration to give an adjusted, and reduced,
327 ANC_{oaa}. However, TOC concentrations do not show any sign of levelling off and may increase further
328 under a wetter climate (de Wit et al. 2016).

329 The change-points for ANC and ANC_{oaa} in 2000 may explain why the successful reproduction
330 of brown trout started at some point after 2002. Although the estimated change-point in 2000 does
331 not fit with the different investigations indicating no reproduction during 2001–2002, the confidence
332 interval for the ANC change-point was 2000–2002, and the upper limit makes it possible that the
333 positive change in ANC level occurred shortly after the known period of non-successful
334 reproduction. The 1997 change-point in SO₄ indicates that the reduced SO₄ concentration was the
335 main cause for the ANC upward change, although the two changes were not estimated to occur at
336 the same time.

337 ANC is a convenient measure of lake acidification. Toxicity to fish, however, is caused by Al_i
338 and/or H⁺. The recent reproductive success might better be explained by lower frequency, severity
339 and duration of toxic episodes rather than increased mean ANC levels (Baker et al. 1982). In the
340 1980s, Lake Langtjern experienced long periods of low pH, low ANC and high Al_i (Fig. 3). Episodes of
341 pH < 4.8 decreased considerably both in duration and frequency since the peak in 1989, but periods
342 of pH < 4.8 still occur, *e.g.* a possible 15-day period in 2012. If these periods cause mortality in the
343 youngest individuals or the fertilized eggs in the stream substrate, the population would still have
344 irregular setbacks in producing offspring. Serrano et al. (2008) proposed that pH, not Al, is most
345 important for trout survival in organic-rich boreal streams. Juvenile brown trout mortality in such
346 streams was modelled with 80 % mortality during 14 days of pH 4.8. The Lake Langtjern outlet had
347 episodes in 2007 and 2009 where pH possibly was below 4.8 for 63 and 35 days, respectively. These
348 episodes may have inflicted high mortality in several year-classes of brown trout, even though the
349 yearly means for pH were 5.0 and 5.1, respectively. Longer episodes of Al_i > 50 µg l⁻¹ have been few

350 since 1997, but week-long episodes probably occurred in both 2006 and 2007. Such episodes may
351 have caused high mortality in young-of-the-year brown trout.

352 In addition to the water chemistry, habitat characteristics probably limit the brown trout
353 population in Lake Langtjern. Suitable spawning areas are few and the number of spawning fish is
354 low, as the remaining individuals from the stocking in 2006 and 2003 probably only exist in small
355 numbers. The inlet stream (LAE02) has more suitable substrate, but it is also a smaller stream than
356 the outlet. Both streams are subject to winter and summer droughts. Our catches document that
357 successful spawning is occurring. The number of spawners has been higher before, without resulting
358 in successful reproductions. The present reproduction therefore indicates that the change in water
359 chemistry is the crucial factor.

360

361 Funding: Monitoring of water chemistry in Lake Langtjern is funded by the Norwegian
362 Environment Agency and, since 2013, also by the Ministry of Climate and Environment through a
363 grant supporting continuation of long time series. This work was funded in part by the Norwegian
364 Research Council project "Lakes in Transition" (244558/E50) and the Norwegian Institute for Water
365 Research (NIVA).

366 Conflict of Interest: The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

367 References

- 368 Aas, W., Fiebig, M., Platt, S., Solberg, S., and Yttri, K.E. 2016. Monitoring of long-range transported
369 air pollutants in Norway, annual report 2015. *Miljødirektoratet rapport, M-562/2016, NILU*
370 *report, 13/2016*. Norwegian Institute for Air Research, Kjeller, Norway.
- 371 Baker, J.P., and Schofield, C.L. 1982. Aluminum toxicity to fish in acidic waters. *Water Air Soil*
372 *Pollution 18(1-3): 289-309*.

373 Baldigo, B.P., Roy, K.M., and Driscoll, C.T. 2016. Response of fish assemblages to declining acidic
374 deposition in Adirondack Mountain lakes, 1984-2012. *Atmospheric Environment* 146: 223-
375 235.

376 Bohlin, T., Hamrin, S., Heggberget, T.G., Rasmussen, G., and Saltveit, S.J. 1989. Electrofishing - theory
377 and practice with special emphasis on salmonids. *Hydrobiologia* 173: 9-43.

378 Bulger, A.J., Lien, L., Cosby, B.J., and Henriksen, A. 1993. Brown trout (*Salmo trutta*) status and
379 chemistry from the Norwegian thousand lake survey: statistical analysis. *Canadian Journal of*
380 *Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences* 50: 575-585.

381 Couture, R.M., Fischer, R., Van Cappellen, P., and Gobeil, C. 2016. Non-steady state diagenesis of
382 organic and inorganic sulfur in lake sediments. *Geochimica Et Cosmochimica Acta* 194: 15-33.

383 Cronan, C.S., Walker, W.J., and Bloom, P.R. 1986. Predicting aqueous aluminium concentrations in
384 natural waters. *Nature* 324: 140-143.

385 De Wit, H.A., Mulder, J., Hindar, A., and Hole, L. 2007. Long-term increase in dissolved organic
386 carbon in streamwaters in Norway is response to reduced acid deposition. *Environmental*
387 *Science & Technology* 41(22): 7706-7713.

388 de Wit, H.A., Hindar, A., and Hole, L. 2008. Winter climate affects long-term trends in stream water
389 nitrate in acid-sensitive catchments in southern Norway. *Hydrology and Earth System*
390 *Sciences* 12(2): 393-403.

391 De Wit, H.A., Granhus, A., Lindholm, M., Kainz, M.J., Lin, Y., Braaten, H.F.V., and Blaszcak, J.R. 2014.
392 Forest harvest effects on mercury in streams and biota in Norwegian boreal catchments.
393 *Forest Ecology and Management* 324: 52-63.

394 de Wit, H.A., Valinia, S., Weyhenmeyer, G.A., Futter, M.N., Kortelainen, P., Austnes, K., Hessen, D.O.,
395 Raike, A., Laudon, H., and Vuorenmaa, J. 2016. Current Browning of Surface Waters Will Be
396 Further Promoted by Wetter Climate. *Environmental Science & Technology Letters* 3(12):
397 430-435.

398 Driscoll, C.T., Driscoll, K.M., Fakhraei, H., and Civerolo, K. 2016. Long-term temporal trends and
399 spatial patterns in the acid-base chemistry of lakes in the Adirondack region of New York in
400 response to decreases in acidic deposition. *Atmospheric Environment* 146: 5-14.

401 Futter, M.N., Valinia, S., Lofgren, S., Kohler, S.J., and Folster, J. 2014. Long-term trends in water
402 chemistry of acid-sensitive Swedish lakes show slow recovery from historic acidification.
403 *Ambio* 43: 77-90.

404 Garmo, O.A., Skjelkvale, B.L., de Wit, H.A., Colombo, L., Curtis, C., Folster, J., Hoffmann, A., Hruska, J.,
405 Hogasen, T., Jeffries, D.S., Keller, W.B., Kram, P., Majer, V., Monteith, D.T., Paterson, A.M.,
406 Rogora, M., Rzychon, D., Steingruber, S., Stoddard, J.L., Vuorenmaa, J., and Worsztynowicz,
407 A. 2014. Trends in Surface Water Chemistry in Acidified Areas in Europe and North America
408 from 1990 to 2008. *Water Air Soil Pollut.* 225(3).

409 Garmo, Ø., Skancke, L.B., and Høgåsen, T. 2016. Monitoring long-range transboundary air pollution.
410 Water chemical effects 2015. *NIVA-rapport 7078, Miljødirektoratet-rapport M-613*.
411 Norwegian Institute for Water Research, Oslo.

412 Grande, M., Muniz, I.P., and Andersen, S. 1978. Relative tolerance of some salmonids to acid waters.
413 *Verhandlungen des Internationalen Verein Limnologie* 20: 2076-2084.

414 Gray, C., Hildrew, A.G., Lu, X., Ma, A., McElroy, D., Monteith, D., O'Gorman, E., Shilland, E., and
415 Woodward, G. 2016. Recovery and Nonrecovery of Freshwater Food Webs from the Effects
416 of Acidification. In *Advances in Ecological Research, Vol 55: Large-Scale Ecology: Model*
417 *Systems to Global Perspectives*. Edited by A.J. Dumbrell, R.L. Kordas and G. Woodward.
418 Elsevier Academic Press Inc, San Diego. pp. 475-534.

419 Gunn, J.M., and Keller, W. 1990. Biological recovery of an acid lake after reductions in industrial
420 emissions of sulphur. *Nature* 345 (6274): 431-433

421 Henriksen, A., and Grande, M. 2002. Lake Langtjern - fish studies in the Langtjern area 1966-2000.
422 *Acid Rain Research Report 54/02 SNO 4537-2002*. NIVA, Oslo.

423 Henriksen, A., and Wright, R.F. 1977. Effects of acid precipitation on a small acid lake in southern
424 Norway. *Nordic Hydrology* 8: 1-10.

425 Hesthagen, T., Sevaldrud, I.H., and Berger, H.M. 1999. Assessment of damage to fish populations in
426 Norwegian lakes due to acidification. *Ambio* 28: 112-117.

427 Hesthagen, T., Forseth, T., Saksgard, R., Berger, H.M., and Larsen, B.M. 2001. Recovery of young
428 brown trout in some acidified streams in southwestern and western Norway. *Water Air Soil*
429 *Pollut.* 130(1-4): 1355-1360.

430 Hesthagen, T., Fiske, P., and Skjelkvale, B.L. 2008. Critical limits for acid neutralizing capacity of
431 brown trout (*Salmo trutta*) in Norwegian lakes differing in organic carbon concentrations.
432 *Aquatic Ecology* 42(2): 307-316.

433 Hesthagen, T., Fjellheim, A., Schartau, A.K., Wright, R.F., Saksgård, R., and Rosseland, B.O. 2011.
434 Chemical and biological recovery of Lake Saudlandsvatn, a highly acidified lake in
435 southernmost Norway, in response to decreased acid deposition. *Science of the Total*
436 *Environment* 409: 2908-2916.

437 Hesthagen, T., Fiske, P., and Saksgard, R. 2016. Recovery of young brown trout (*Salmo trutta*) in
438 acidified streams: What are the critical values for acid-neutralizing capacity? *Atmospheric*
439 *Environment* 146: 236-244.

440 Hodson, M.E., and Langan, S.J. 1999. Considerations of uncertainty in setting critical loads of acidity
441 of soils: the role of weathering rate determination. *Environmental Pollution* 106(1): 73-81.

442 Holmgren, K. 2014. Challenges in assessing biological recovery from acidification in Swedish lakes.
443 *Ambio* 43: 19-29.

444 Jeffries, D.S., Clair, T.A., Couture, S., Dillon, P.J., Dupont, J., Keller, W., McNicol, D.K., Turner, M.A.,
445 Vet, R., and Weeber, R. 2003. Assessing the recovery of lakes in southeastern Canada from
446 the effects of acid deposition. *Ambio* 32: 176-182.

447 Lacoul, P., Freedman, B., and Clair, T. 2011. Effects of acidification on aquatic biota in Atlantic
448 Canada. *Environmental Reviews* 19: 429-460.

449 Lien, L., Raddum, G.G., Fjellheim, A., and Henriksen, A. 1996. A critical limit for acid neutralizing
450 capacity in Norwegian surface waters, based on new analyses of fish and invertebrate
451 responses. *Science of the Total Environment* 177: 173-193.

452 Lydersen, E., Larssen, T., and Fjeld, E. 2004. The influence of total organic carbon (TOC) on the
453 relationship between acid neutralizing capacity (ANC) and fish status in Norwegian lakes.
454 *Science of the Total Environment* 362: 63-69.

455 Malcolm, I.A., Bacon, P.J., Middlemas, S.J., Fryer, R.J., Shilland, E.M., and Collen, P. 2014.
456 Relationships between hydrochemistry and the presence of juvenile brown trout (*Salmo*
457 *trutta*) in headwater streams recovering from acidification. *Ecological Indicators* 37: 351-364.

458 Monteith, D.T., Evans, C.D., Henrys, P.A., Simpson, G.L., and Malcolm, I.A. 2014. Trends in the
459 hydrochemistry of acid-sensitive surface waters in the UK 1988-2008. *Ecological Indicators*
460 37: 287-303.

461 Overrein, L., Seip, H.M., and Tollan, A. 1980. Acid precipitation - Effects on forest and fish. *Final*
462 *report of the SNSF-project 1972-1980. FR 19-80. SNSF project, Ås, Norway.*

463 Rask, M., Vuorenmaa, J., Nyberg, K., Tammi, J., Mannio, J., Olin, M., Kortelainen, P., Raitaniemi, J.,
464 and Vesala, S. 2014. Recovery of acidified lakes in Finland and subsequent responses of
465 perch and roach populations. *Boreal Environment Research* 19(3): 222-234.

466 Reuss, J.O., and Johnson, D.W. 1986. *Acid Deposition and the Acidification of Soils and Waters.*
467 Springer Verlag, New York.

468 Reuss, J.O., Cosby, B.J., and Wright, R.F. 1987. Chemical processes governing soil and water
469 acidification. *Nature* 329: 27-32.

470 Reuss, J.O., Roswall, E.C., and Hopper, R.W.E. 1990. Aluminium Solubility, Calcium-Aluminum
471 Exchange, and pH in acid forest soils. *Soil Science Society of America Journal* 54: 374-380.

472 Rosseland, B.O., Eldhuset, T.D., and Staurnes, M. 1990. ENVIRONMENTAL-EFFECTS OF ALUMINUM.
473 *Environmental Geochemistry and Health* 12(1-2): 17-27.

474 Schöpp, W., Posch, M., Mylona, S., and Johansson, M. 2003. Long-term development of acid
475 deposition (1880-2030) in sensitive freshwater regions in Europe. *Hydrology and Earth
476 System Sciences* 7: 436-446.

477 Serrano, I., Buffam, I., Palm, D., Brannas, E., and Laudon, H. 2008. Thresholds for survival of brown
478 trout during the spring flood acid pulse in streams high in dissolved organic carbon.
479 *Transactions of the American Fisheries Society* 137: 1363-1377.

480 Skjelkvåle, B.L., Wright, R.F., and Henriksen, A. 1998. Norwegian lakes show widespread recovery
481 from acidification: results of national surveys of lakewater chemistry 1986-1997. *Hydrology
482 and Earth System Sciences* 2: 555-562.

483 Skjelkvåle, B.L., Borg, H., Hindar, A., and Wilander, A. 2007. Large scale patterns of chemical recovery
484 in lakes in Norway and Sweden: Importance of seasalt episodes and changes in dissolved
485 organic carbon. *Applied Geochemistry* 22(6): 1174-1180.

486 Snucins, E., Gunn, J., Keller, B., Dixit, S., Hindar, A., and Henriksen, A. 2001. Effects of regional
487 reductions in sulphur deposition on the chemical and biological recovery of lakes within
488 Killarney Park, Ontario, Canada. *Environmental Monitoring and Assessment* 67(1-2): 179-194.

489 Stoddard, J.L., Jeffries, D.S., Lükewille, A., Clair, T.A., Dillon, P.J., Driscoll, C.T., Forsius, M.,
490 Johannessen, M., Kahl, J.S., Kellogg, J.H., Kemp, A., Mannio, J., Monteith, D., Murdoch, P.S.,
491 Patrick, S., Rebsdorf, A., Skjelkvåle, B.L., Stainton, M.P., Traaen, T.S., van Dam, H., Webster,
492 K.E., Wieting, J., and Wilander, A. 1999. Regional trends in aquatic recovery from
493 acidification in North America and Europe 1980-95. *Nature* 401: 575-578.

494 UNECE. 2014. Convention on Long-range Transboundary Air Pollution.
495 http://www.unece.org/env/lrtap/lrtap_h1.html

496 Valinia, S., Englund, G., Moldan, F., Futter, M.N., Kohler, S.J., Bishop, K., and Folster, J. 2014.
497 Assessing anthropogenic impact on boreal lakes with historical fish species distribution data
498 and hydrogeochemical modeling. *Global Change Biology* 20(9): 2752-2764.

499 Wright, R.F., and Henriksen, A. 1978. Chemistry of small Norwegian lakes with special reference to
500 acid precipitation. *Limnology and Oceanography* 23: 487-498.

501

502

503

504 **Table 1** Lake Langtjern outlet water chemistry mean values \pm SD in five periods from 1973 to 2014. No data for

505 1984–1985. Data for Al_i , TOC and ANC_{Oaa} from 1986

506

Period	SO_4	NO_3	pH	Al_i	ANC	ANC_{Oaa}	TOC	Ca
	$\mu eq\ l^{-1}$	$\mu eq\ l^{-1}$		$\mu g\ l^{-1}$	$\mu eq\ l^{-1}$	$\mu eq\ l^{-1}$	$mg\ C\ l^{-1}$	$\mu eq\ l^{-1}$
1973–1979	72 ± 14	1.9 ± 1.3	4.9 ± 0.2		27 ± 11			69 ± 12
1980–1989	66 ± 14	1.7 ± 1.3	4.8 ± 0.2	74 ± 19	13 ± 8	-15.3 ± 8.8	8.8 ± 1.6	57 ± 11
1990–1999	51 ± 14	1.5 ± 1.2	5.0 ± 0.2	46 ± 20	32 ± 12	-2.3 ± 9.1	10.1 ± 2.0	55 ± 10
2000–2007	25 ± 6	0.9 ± 0.7	5.1 ± 0.2	27 ± 9	47 ± 12	10.6 ± 8.7	10.8 ± 1.9	47 ± 10
2008–2014	17 ± 4	0.8 ± 0.7	5.1 ± 0.2	26 ± 7	47 ± 9	9.7 ± 6.9	11.0 ± 2.0	42 ± 8

507

508

509

510 **Table 2** Number of non-stocked fish caught by electrofishing in the outlet and major inlet to Lake Langtjern in
511 the period 2010–2014. No data for inlet 1014

		Age class		Year		
		2010	2011	2012	2013	2014
Outlet	0+	0	2	13	0	4
	>0+	6	5	1	2	0
Inlet	0+	0	0	1	0	n.a.
	>0+	1	1	2	2	n.a.

512

513

514

515

516

517 **Fig. 1** Map showing the position and the catchment (dotted line) of Lake Langtjern (60.37 N, 9.73 E), a research
518 station for studying acidification of surface waters in Norway. Outlet (LAE01) and inlets (LAE03, LAE02 and
519 LAE08) are indicated

520

521

522 **Fig. 2** Annual deposition of SO_4 , and yearly mean concentrations of SO_4 , Ca, ANC, ANC_{Oaa} , pH and Al_i in the
523 outlet at Langtjern over the period 1973–2014. Deposition data from Aas et al. (2016)). No outlet data for
524 1984–1985. TOC and Al_i analysed from 1986. Dotted lines indicate levels of significant changes in the data
525 series

526

527

528 **Fig. 3** Count of consecutive days of $\text{pH} < 4.8$, $\text{ANC} < 10 \mu\text{eq l}^{-1}$, $\text{ANC}_{\text{Oaa}} < -5 \mu\text{eq l}^{-1}$ and $\text{Al}_i > 50 \mu\text{g l}^{-1}$ at the
529 outlet of Lake Langtjern 1973–2014. No data for 1984–1985, and data for ANC_{Oaa} and Al_i from 1986

530

531

532 **Fig. 4** Number of stocked (top) and captured (bottom) brown trout ($n/100 \text{ m}^2$) in Lake Langtjern in the period
533 1972–2011.

534







