Downward professional mobility among Poles working and living in Norway

Anna Przybyszewska

NORD
University

www.nord.no

Downward professional mobility
among Poles working and living in Norway

Anna Przybyszewska

PhD in Sociology

Faculty of Social Sciences

Nord University

Acknowledgements

I wish to thank all the study participants who gave me access to their invaluable insights into the phenomena under study. Your openness and eagerness to share your stories allowed me to embark on this riveting journey through the human experiences and social worlds related to your mobility.

I would like to thank my supervisor Yan Zhao. Thank you for always caring and always being ready to advise me, and for all of your perceptive, detailed, and valuable comments on any text I have sent you, which have undoubtedly contributed to the improvement of the quality and substantive value of this dissertation. No less important, I would like to thank you for introducing me to various aspects of the work of a researcher beyond writing the thesis.

My sincere gratitude also goes to my co-supervisor Magdalena Nowicka for all of your feedback that encouraged me to reconsider many of my thoughts and ideas. Thank you for your contribution to improving the quality of my work, especially on the articles. Finally, thank you for the inspiration that I was able to draw both from our conversations and from your academic work.

I would like to thank Marta Bivand Erdal and Elisabet Carine Ljunggren for their valuable comments on and insights into my work on the occasion of my final and midterm seminars.

Special thanks go to two persons who influenced the development of this work in different ways. Øystein Rennemo, thank you for your cooperation at the initial stage of this project and for introducing me to my new workplace in so pleasing manner. Johans Tveit Sandvin, our doctoral program coordinator, for opening horizons and widening my sociological imagination by sharing comprehensive perspectives on sociology and social knowledge during the doctoral courses you held for us.

Summary

Downward professional mobility among Poles working and living in Norway

This dissertation is concerned with the logic, dynamics, and meaning-making that underlie the downward professional mobility of Polish migrants in Norway. Drawing on data analysis of 30 qualitative interviews conducted with Poles working below their level of qualification after migrating to Norway, the study answers the following overarching research question: *How do Polish migrants perceive and respond to their downward professional mobility in the Norwegian labour market?*

The point of departure for my analysis stems from three sets of theoretical frames: (1) habitus and field, (2) identity and identification, and (3) othering, stigma, and racialisation. Combining these concepts enabled me to depict the complexity of downward professional mobility and the processes involved in how migrants experience, perceive, and respond to this phenomenon.

The study finds that perceptions and responses to downward professional mobility intersected with migration are strongly marked by national identification and identity, with Polish migrants' positionality occupying a rather unfavourable position within the field of national hierarchies, and attributed stigmatising meanings. This dissertation offers a framework for studying migrants' experiences in ethnically and nationally segmented European labour markets.

The results of the study are collected in three articles. Below, I introduce the articles' titles along with the research sub-questions which each respective article seeks answers to.

Article 1. 'Downward professional mobility among Poles working and living in Norway'

- *Why do skilled and highly skilled Poles take up low-skilled jobs in Norway?*
- *How do they explain remaining in low-skilled jobs?*

Article 2. 'Habitus mismatch and suffering experienced by Polish migrants working below their qualifications in Norway'

- How do Poles working below their qualifications in Norway cope with their downward professional mobility?

- What kinds of experiences do they describe?

- How do underemployment and disappointed aspirations influence migrants' wellbeing?

Article 3. 'Downward professional mobility, cultural difference, and immigrant niches: dynamics of and changes to migrants' attitudes towards interpersonal communication and work performance'

- How does working in and beyond immigrant niches influences Polish migrants' adaptation in Norway?

- How do encounters of cultural difference influence Polish migrants' perceptions of interpersonal communication and their work attitudes?

TABLE OF CONTENTS

OVERVIEW OF TABLES

INTRODUCTION

Background and focus of the study

Migration studies are increasingly reporting the emergence of ethnic and national segmentation of European labour markets (Bauder 2006b, OECD 2018b, 2018a, Siar 2013), including the Norwegian market (Friberg et al. 2017, 2019, SSB 2017). In these ethnically segmented structures, immigrants occupy peripheral, low-skilled, and low-status positions. This alarming tendency brings two primary losses at the macro- and microlevels, respectively: waste of human capital in both the sending and receiving countries (Siar 2013, Syed 2008, Salmonsson et al. 2013), and economic, psychological, and emotional losses and burdens for migrating individuals working below their qualifications (Vianello 2014, Moussaoui et al. 2011).

Intra-European migration is notably characterised by migratory movements from Eastern and Central European countries to Northern and Western ones. Higher wages in the receiving countries are one of the main pull factors driving intra-European migration; however, the social phenomena emerging from these movements reaches far beyond economics and influences the everyday lives of both migrating and non-migrating people. Labour market integration is often considered the most important integrative mechanism in the relationship between an individual and the society (Goul Andersen et al. 2002, Esses et al. 2006), whereas the workplace is one of the main arenas for the transmission of cultural norms. Therefore, marginalisation and exclusion of migrants from certain sectors of the labour market pose a barrier for migrants to develop social networks, adapt to the new socio-cultural space, and achieve job satisfaction.

Although intra-European migrants are free-movers with formally equal rights to participate in the host labour markets, the employment structure of European labour markets reflects inequality of access to some sectors, particularly highly skilled sectors. From 2012 to 2017, the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and

Development (OECD) collected and analysed data concerning rates of employment and return to the qualifications of migrants in European countries. Between 2012 and 2017, migrant employment increased in almost all sectors of the European labour market, with the most significant growth recorded in the low- and middle-skilled sectors. In all OECD countries, the distribution of foreign-born workers over occupations differs significantly from the distribution of native-born workers and this situation did not improve between 2012 and 2017. In total, 65 percent of employed migrants in the OECD area worked in low- or medium-skilled jobs in 2017. This also applies to tertiary-educated migrants, who are more frequently found in low- and medium-skilled occupations than natives are. Native-born employment gains were recorded in more skill-intensive industries, in both management consulting and computer programming (OECD 2018a: 91). Migrant workers, on the other hand, tended to concentrate in specific sectors across the OECD area and were disproportionally concentrated in occupations with high routine task intensity, with a third of all workers in cleaner or helper occupations in 2015 being foreign-born (OECD 2018a: 92). Foreign-born workers were also overrepresented in the hotel and restaurant industries and in domestic services in almost all OECD countries (OECD 2018a: 88), with the corresponding share for native-born workers almost 10 percentage points lower. On average, migrants are still more likely (by 12 percentage points) than native-born persons to be overqualified for their jobs (OECD 2018a: 99).

Risk of overqualification also affects migrants in the Norwegian labour market (SSB 2017), where immigrant niches have arisen (Friberg and Midtbøen 2019, 2017). Although the Norwegian government has implemented policies aimed at preventing the exploitation of migrants (Friberg 2010), work below qualifications in Norway is common among different national migrant groups (SSB 2017). The authors of a recent report from Statistics Norway regarding living conditions among immigrants [1] in Norway in 2016 indicated that immigrants generally worked in other professions than

---

[1] Persons born abroad, having two foreign-born parents and four foreign-born grandparents (SSB 2017: 23).

Norwegians. For example, while only 25 percent of employed immigrants worked in management and higher education, 58 percent of the total workforce occupied these trades (SSB 2017: 106). This disparity also applies to Poles, who constitute the largest national group of immigrants in Norway (SSB 2020). Despite having diverse educational and professional backgrounds, Poles are mainly concentrated in just a few low-skilled and low-waged industries in Norway: construction, cleaning services, and gastronomy (Friberg et al. 2011, SSB 2017).

The first research (Friberg and Eldring 2011, Friberg et al. 2007) to identify the downward professional mobility among Poles in Norway ware conducted on a non-representative sample of 500 Polish immigrants living in Oslo in 2006 and 2010. The study concerned different aspects of labour market participation and settlement patterns among Polish migrants. The results provided by the research conducted in 2010 (Friberg and Eldring 2011) revealed that 84 percent of Polish males participating in the study worked in the construction industry and 58 percent of Polish females worked in cleaning services (Friberg and Eldring 2011: 37). This raises the question: was it mostly Polish builders and cleaning ladies who had decided to emigrate to Norway? To a significant extent, this was not the case. In fact, only 1 percent of the female participants analysed had worked as cleaning ladies before coming to Norway, meaning that more than half were employed as cleaning staff despite working in various other trades immediately before their emigration to Norway: 22 percent in commerce, 18 percent in the hotel industry and gastronomy, 11 percent in industry, 9 percent in health care, 8 percent in education and public administration, and the remaining 32 percent in other trades (Friberg and Eldring 2011: 17). In addition, 28 percent of the women interviewed were highly educated (college and above), 26 percent had received secondary education, 23 percent technical education, 22 percent professional education, and 1 percent elementary education. Downward professional mobility among men appeared to be less frequent, with 52 percent of the men surveyed having worked in the construction industry before coming to

Norway. Hence, most of them conducted the same type of work after emigration as before. However, the research indicated that 12 percent of the male respondents had previously worked in industry, 9 percent in transport and logistics, 8 percent in commerce, and the remaining 19 percent in other trades (Friberg and Eldring 2011: 17). The study also revealed that Poles earned the lowest hourly rates possible for the sectors in which they were employed. Furthermore, in the first part of the research conducted in 2006, 44 percent of respondents reported feeling that they were treated differently than employees of Norwegian origin, while in 2010, as many as 59 percent of respondents agreed with this statement (Friberg and Eldring 2011: 68).

A more recent report from 2017 (SSB), based on a representative sample, sheds further light on the labour market participation structure of Polish migrants in Norway. According to the report, immigrants of Polish origin are overrepresented in manual work, with 36 percent of Poles performing such work compared to just 9 percent of the overall working population in Norway. The other trade in which Poles are overrepresented is cleaning, with 15 percent of Poles working in this industry compared to just 2 percent of the overall working population (SSB 2017: 107). These numbers do not consider gender, although the structure of employment among Poles in Norway is strongly gender-imbalanced, as evidenced by the fact that the majority of Polish females work in cleaning services, while Polish males work in the construction industry (Friberg and Eldring 2011). Notwithstanding, Polish migrants are concentrated in low-skilled and low-waged jobs. This observation is even more interesting when we compare it with the results of another study indicating that over 23 percent of workers in Norway are underqualified (OECD 2018b), which suggests a general need for qualified workers and human capital, and partly refutes any possible hypothesis about the saturation of the labour market.

Although quantitative studies have demonstrated that Poles working in Norway experience downward professional mobility, this issue has not been investigated more thoroughly in any previous qualitative study covering Polish migrants' own

viewpoints and related experiences regarding this phenomenon. Through this qualitative research, I aim to fill this gap, in the belief that exploring people's own experiences and understandings of this phenomenon will facilitate understanding of the logic behind their downward professional mobility.

The inspiration and idea for this topic arose when I was conducting qualitative research for my sociological master's thesis in 2014 and 2015. In that study, I explored the experiences of Poles adapting to the Norwegian sociocultural space. Although at that time I did not concentrate on the working life of the study participants, I realised that, at the time of conducting the interviews, 7 out of 11 of my informants – Poles who were living and working in Norway - were not working in the professions for which they were qualified, and that only 2 of them worked exclusively in the professions for which they were qualified after migrating to Norway. Despite graduating in various fields of study in Poland, most worked as cleaners, waiters, or construction workers in Norway. During the interviews, I often encountered statements similar to the following: *'And of course, what can a highly educated Polish woman do [in Norway]? Of course, I clean'* (Przybyszewska 2015: 50). Such statements, and particularly the perceived obviousness that Poles should work in low-skilled jobs in Norway, that I observed among my highly educated interviewees sowed the seeds of curiosity in me, which subsequently developed into an idea for a qualitative doctoral research.

The leading research questions

This study explores the topic of downward professional mobility among Polish migrants in Norway by means of the research questions introduced below. The main research question guiding the dissertation is:

How do Polish migrants perceive and respond to their downward professional mobility in the Norwegian labour market?

This question is specified by seven sub-questions which guided the analyses in the three articles disseminating the results of the study:

Article 1:

(I) Why do skilled and highly skilled Poles take up low-skilled jobs in Norway?

(II) How do they explain remaining in low-skilled jobs?

Article II:

(III) How do Poles who work below their qualifications in Norway cope with their downward professional mobility?

(IV) What kinds of experiences do they describe?

(V) How do underemployment and disappointed aspirations influence migrants' wellbeing?

Article 3:

(VI) How does working in and beyond immigrant niches influences Polish migrants' adaptation in Norway?

(VII) How do encounters of cultural difference influence Polish migrants' perceptions of interpersonal communication and their work attitudes?

The structure of the thesis

The first four chapters provide the study's foundation, introducing its background, theoretical framework, and methodology. The fifth chapter summarises the three articles comprising the research analysis and findings. The sixth chapter discusses the study results and contribution. The three articles are attached at the end of the dissertation.

In chapter two, which follows this introduction, I outline the study background and review previous research on downward professional mobility among migrants. The first part of chapter two contextualises Polish migration to Norway within the intra-European migratory movement from East to West, and depicts the demographic characteristics of Poles in Norway. The second part of the chapter provides a literature review.

The third, theoretical chapter, introduces and explains my theoretical approach, which draws on three sets of theories: (1) habitus and field, (2) identity and identification, and (3) othering, racialisation, and stigma. The structure of the chapter reflects the use of these different concepts, with separate subchapters devoted to each, while simultaneously drawing the link between them. It also elucidates how I applied the theory in the analyses and articles.

In chapter four, I describe the research design. This chapter delineates the subsequent steps of the research: from the recruitment of the study participants, through conducting interviews, to processing the data. It discusses the methodological choices made, my positionality within the research, and my understanding of the knowledge production.

Chapter five summarises the three articles and the research findings collected therein. I pinpoint the topics explored and theories used and developed in each of the articles. This chapter discusses and directly answers the research questions.

Chapter six provides an overall discussion and conclusion to the study, highlighting its empirical and theoretical contributions. This chapter is followed by the

three articles in which the study findings have been collected. Below, I present an overview of these articles.

List of articles

Article 1. Downward professional mobility among Poles working and living in Norway
Under review in the *Nordic Journal of Migration Research*

Article 2. Habitus mismatch and suffering experienced by Polish migrants working below their qualifications in Norway
Under review in the *Central and Eastern European Migration Review*

Article 3. Downward professional mobility, cultural difference, and immigrant niches: dynamics of and changes to migrants' attitudes towards interpersonal communication and work performance
Submitted to *European Journal of Cultural Studies*

CHAPTER 2. CONTEXT OUTLINE AND LITERATURE REVIEW

This chapter consists of two main parts. The first subchapter outlines the background to Polish migration to Norway, embedding it in the broader context of contemporary intra-European migration. The second subchapter reviews previous research on downward professional mobility among migrants and connects these discussions with my research project.

Contemporary intra-European migration

Contemporary intra-European migration has been accelerated by two main socio-political transformations: the collapse of the Soviet Union in 1989 and the accession of Central and Eastern European countries to the European Union in 2004 and 2007.

The end of the Cold War and liberation of Central and Eastern European (CEE) countries facilitated movement abroad and the seeking of better-paid jobs. Although, in the nineties, opportunities for legal labour migration in Western countries were rather limited for Eastern Europeans, significant numbers of Poles, Romanians, and Bulgarians moved, mainly to Germany (Engbersen et al. 2010: 8), and estimates suggest that approximately 3.2 million people emigrated from the A8 [2] and A2 [3] countries in the period between 1989 and 2004 (Engbersen et al. 2010: 9).

The fall of the communist regimes and liberation of Eastern European countries was accompanied by media and political discourses replete with fears regarding migrants' anticipated 'invasion' of Western countries in response to the transformation. The various prognoses suggested that as many as 25 million Eastern European nationals would move to Western Europe immediately after 1989, and although these estimates proved to be significantly overestimated, the 'fear of

---

[2] A8 countries: Czech Republic, Estonia, Hungary, Latvia, Lithuania, Poland, Slovakia, Slovenia (joined the EU in 2004).
[3] A2 countries: Bulgaria and Romania (joined the EU in 2007).

invasion' was common. The foregoing discourses have continued to reinforce two dichotomies: Eastern countries versus Western countries and migrant-sending countries versus migrant-receiving countries (Engbersen et al. 2010: 8, Kuus 2004, van Riemsdijk 2010, 2013, van Heuckelom 2013). In this dichotomy, Eastern European nationals not only tend to be perceived as homogeneous but also as invaders or intruders (Engbersen et al. 2010: 8, Buchowski 2006).

Accession of the CEE member states to the EU in 2004 and 2007 brought a second wave of intra-European migratory movement. Fears of Eastern invasion were again present in media, political, and social discourses, with migrants from Eastern Europe identified with foreignness (van Riemsdijk 2013, 2010, van Heuckelom 2013, Kuus 2004, Buchowski 2006). Although voices disseminating the potential economic advantages of labour migrants were also present, they clearly identified migrants from Eastern European countries as manual workers or 'labour force'.

Despite the internationalisation of European labour markets, monthly income in the richest countries has remained as much as 10 times higher than in the poorest countries (Eurostat 2017). Even after taking into account the costs of living in the relatively more expensive immigration countries, their net income remains significantly higher than in the countries of emigration, thus continuing to attract migrants. However, increasingly often, studies report the importance of other motives that drive intra-European migration, such as so-called lifestyle migrations characterised by migrants seeking alternative ways of living (Benson et al. 2014, Benson et al. 2009, Lulle et al. 2016).

Emigration from Poland

From 1947 to 1989, Poland and its economy were dependant on the Communist Party of the Soviet Union, and in 1989, Poland became the first of the socialist countries of Eastern Europe to re-establish independence. Although a large and dynamic private sector and sound fiscal and monetary policies have produced a fast-growing economy since 1994, the Polish economic infrastructure has remained undeveloped compared

with Western European countries (Mole 2003: 173). The income gap between Poland and some Western countries had been the main push-and-pull factor for three previous decades of Polish international migration.

At the end of 2016, it was reported that over 2.5 million Polish citizens had been abroad for at least three months (GUS 2017), most in Great Britain (788,000) and Germany (687,000). Such a large migration was accompanied by an abundance of research on Polish migrants (see e.g. Erdal et al. 2016b, Ingram et al. 2016, Grzymała-Kazłowska 2005, Nowicka 2018b, van Den Broek et al. 2017, Nowicka 2013, Djundeva et al. 2019, Weishaar 2010, Goździak et al. 2016, White 2016). A significant part of this research was conducted in the UK context (Parutis 2014, Thatcher et al. 2016, Nowicka 2014a, Kołbon 2016, Rzepnikowska 2019, Drzewiecka et al. 2014, Trevena 2013, Erdal et al. 2016a). However, research has also been conducted on Polish migrants in Scandinavian countries (e.g. Friberg 2012, 2010, van Riemsdijk 2013, Wolanik Boström et al. 2015, van Riemsdijk 2010, Friberg and Midtbøen 2017, Friberg and Eldring 2011, Bygnes et al. 2017, Erdal et al. 2018, Pawlak 2018, Kosakowska-Berezecka et al. 2018, Żadkowska et al. 2020). Thus, the literature on intra-European Polish migration is plentiful and covers a number of topics intersecting with migration, including family life, settlement patterns, and work life.

Polish migrants in Norway

In 1972 and 1994, Norwegians voted against membership of the European Union; however, since 1994, they have been in the European Economic Area (EEA), ensuring free movement across borders for goods, persons, services, and capital. Thus, Norway is a member of the EU internal market, but does not participate in EU political decision-making. In practice, however, Norway implements all the EU directives (Schramm Nielsen et al. 2004).

In Norway, an era of unprecedented wealth has been developing since the 1970s, when the exploitation of oil deposits commenced in the North Sea. Although Norway experienced a decline in its petroleum industry in the late 1980s, in the 1990s,

it again began to benefit from increased production and higher prices. Since the second half of the nineties, Norway has been the richest economy in Europe (Schramm Nielsen et al. 2004), attracting immigrants from different world regions.

The number of Poles in Norway has been increasing gradually since the 1990s, with a notably intensive wave of migration from Poland to Norway beginning in 2007. At the start of 2020, there were 115,000 Poles residing in Norway, representing 2.1 percent of Norway's over 5.3 million inhabitants (SSB 2020). However, a gender imbalance can be observed among Polish immigrants in Norway, with women comprising only one-third of the Polish diaspora (SSB 2017). Researchers have reported the varied character of migratory flows from Poland, including seasonal, temporary, circular, and permanent mobility (Erdal and Lewicki 2016a). Over time, it has become apparent that Polish migrants are increasingly settling for longer periods of time or even permanently (Erdal and Lewicki 2016b).

The majority of Poles are concentrated in Oslo (14 percent) and Viken county (31 percent) which surrounds the Oslo capital. A large proportion of Poles live in the coastal counties of Rogaland (11 percent) and Vestland (13 percent), which are important economic centres with shipping and oil industries. Nonetheless, Poles are also dispersed throughout many different rural and urban localities in Norway, constituting between 1 percent (Nordland) and 3 percent (Viken) of the counties' populations (SSB 2020).

Employment rates of Poles are high, and their reliance on welfare benefits is low (Bye et al. 2014); 84 percent aged between 16 and 74 are employed, compared to 80 percent among the overall population and 66 percent among other migrant groups in the same age range covered by the same study (SSB 2017). Although migrants' active participation in the labour market is desirable, Polish migrants suffer from prejudices and stigmas attached to their nationality. They are often reduced to the one-dimensional identity of manual workers, who are hard-working, but not fit for non-manual jobs. (Friberg and Midtbøen 2019, 2017). Dyrlid (2017), in her analysis

of newspaper articles published between 2008 and 2011, identified three main media discourses that stigmatise and racialise Poles. The first discourse is related to poor living and working conditions and the low-paid, physical work performed by Poles. The second presented Poles as hard-working and eager to work in positions that Norwegians no longer want to occupy. The third concerned the relationship between the Norwegian welfare state and Polish immigrants. As Dyrlid noted, all of these discourses presented Poles as different from Norwegians (Dyrlid 2017: 144-145) and perpetuated stereotypes of Polish workers as a separate category of worker in the Norwegian labour market (Dyrlid 2017: 148).

An ethnographic study by Pawlak (2018) describes how his participation in the everyday lives of Polish migrants working at construction sites contributed to the development of his own feeling of shame at being Polish during encounters with Norwegians. In the course of his ethnographic fieldwork, he began to feel ashamed of his Polish affiliation and uncomfortable with being identified with Polishness (Pawlak 2018: 101). The titular 'embarrassing (Polish) identity' turned out to be a determining factor in his ethnographic analysis of the everyday lives of Polish workers. The disadvantage of Polish identity seems to be compatible with the results of research conducted among Norwegian employers. Friberg and Midtbøen (2019, 2017) found that Norwegian employers perceive Polish workers as particularly suitable for hard, manual work, but unsuitable for jobs that require thinking, decision making, interpersonal contact, and representative tasks. Although the perception of Poles as hard-working and effective manual workers may be seen as an asset, it is undoubtedly difficult to derive positive effects from these perceptions when in search of other, non-manual jobs.

Previous research on downward professional mobility among migrants

The results of numerous studies have demonstrated that immigrants are at a higher risk of overqualification in their destination labour markets than non-migrant

populations (Duvander 2001, Sert 2016, Piore 1979, Thompson 2000, Rosholm et al. 2006). Literature on downward professional mobility among migrants has resonated around three main aspects: (1) non-transferability of formal and tacit skills gained prior to migration; (2) discrimination and prejudice against migrants in the host labour markets; and (3) lack of destination 'country's specific skills'. These three aspects have been discussed both separately and as interrelated factors that contribute to downward professional mobility among migrants. Some studies have discussed downward professional mobility in terms of skill devaluation, deskilling, devaluation of human capital, skill discounting, or brain waste (Salmonsson and Mella 2013, Esses et al. 2006, Bauder 2003, Özden 2005, Özden et al. 2005, Niraula et al. 2019, Nowicka 2014a, 2012, Man 2004, Sert 2016, Siar 2013). However, the same concepts have also been used in relation to migrants who do not work below their skill level, but who have experienced the deskilling or devaluation of their capital within their profession (e.g. Korzeniewska et al. 2019, van Riemsdijk 2013, 2010, Wolanik Boström and Öhlander 2015, Povrzanović Frykman et al. 2019), thus rendering these terms somewhat ambiguous. As this dissertation focuses on migrants working below their skill level, the forthcoming literature review focuses in particular on the strand of research regarding downward professional mobility and migrants working in other professions than those for which they are qualified.

One of the first authors to address the problem of downward professional mobility among migrants in the contemporary era was Piore. In his 1979 book 'Birds of passage: migrant labor and industrial societies', he aimed to provide a theoretical model explaining this phenomenon. At that time, it was already evident that the structure characterising migrants' positions in Western labour markets (Europe and North America) differed from that characterising the positions of non-migrant populations. Migrants were concentrated in the low-skilled sectors of the labour market and completely excluded from certain better-paid, capital-intensive sectors (Piore 1979: 17). Piore (1979: 19) saw the strategic role of employers in channelling

migrants into low-skilled jobs. In his view, employers tend to fill specific sets of jobs with migrants. He analysed downward professional mobility among migrants through the prism of economic duality theory, arguing that the primary, capital-intensive labour market is reserved for natives, whereas the secondary, labour-intensive markets are filled by immigrants. According to Piore, when economic development proceeds, the labour market 'absorbs' the native labour force, and, as a result, some sectors experience labour shortages. Most often, these are low-paid, low-status positions that remain unfilled as natives tend to seek better-paid jobs. As Piore explains, instead of competing for native labour through, for example, increasing wages or improving working conditions, employers recruit foreign migrant workers (Piore 1979: 27-28).

In the decades after Piore's seminal work, research on downward professional mobility among migrants focused on the Canadian labour market, where national segmentation was already observable due to sustained migratory movements. Satzewich (1991) credits the Canadian state, its ideologies, and policies with the racialisation of immigration policies and sees the crucial role of state interventions in shaping labour supplies and racial composition. In his view, racialisation is involved in the processes of class making, with migrants exposed to racialised forms of exclusion and discrimination (Satzewich 1991). Similarly, Man (2004) attributes migrants' downward professional mobility to neoliberal policies and practices as well as to institutionalised gendered and racialised discrimination.

In another study, Thompson (2000) analysed datasets with over 166,000 individuals and measured the gap in occupational skills outcomes between migrants and non-migrants in Canada. She divided migrants by their origin, as reflected by continental region (for example, Europe and Asia were analysed by their Northern, Southern, Western, and Eastern regions) and compared individuals with similar sets of qualifications. The study revealed that significantly lower numbers of male and female migrants from Eastern and Southern Europe, East and South Asia, and Central

and South America procured employment in skilled jobs than non-migrants and migrants from Northern Europe and North America. The author attributed underutilisation of immigrant human capital to the non-transferability of educational degrees and qualifications obtained outside of Canada (Thompson 2000). Although transferability of migrants' skills undeniably plays a role in downward professional mobility, it does not fully explain the difference in skills outcomes between migrants originating from different continental regions.

In line with Thompson, Bauder (2003), referring to international labour segmentation theory, sees the downward professional mobility of migrants as an effect of non-recognition of foreign credentials and institutionalised discrimination. He analysed the exclusion of immigrants by work agencies and the Canadian state, which reserved most of its highly paid positions for Canadian-born and Canadian-educated workers. Bauder concludes that educational and certification systems translate 'inherited' Canadian birthplace into economic privilege (Bauder 2003). Similarly, Esses et al. (2006) recognise both the non-transferability of skills and the level of foreignness as significant factors in discounting migrants as potential or competent employees. As they note, the impact of prejudice is two-fold: it both denigrates migrants as persons and denigrates their skills as insufficiently valuable.

Within the strand of literature on ethnic segmentation of the labour markets, there has emerged research on immigrant niches, i.e. industries that concentrate immigrants. Scholars have considered the impact of different factors, including immigrant networks (Tilly 1990, Massey et al. 1993), demand in the labour markets and employers' preferences (Rath 2002, Waldinger 1994) on the formation of such niches. In the Norwegian context, research on immigrant niches (Friberg and Midtbøen 2017, 2019) focused particularly on employers' perspectives, revealing that Norwegian employers ascribe certain stereotypes to particular national migrant groups.

Another hypothesis formulated to explain unemployment and overqualification among immigrants was an assertion regarding their limited possession of country-specific skills (Rosholm et al. 2006, Duvander 2001). This hypothesis draws attention to the potential lack of skills expected in the country of destination, rather than to the problematics of skills already obtained by immigrants prior to migration. Duvander (2001) conducted an interesting quantitative study on the potential influence of country-specific skills on the probability of underemployment and overqualification among migrants in Sweden. She compared four immigrant groups—Finns, Poles, Iranians, and Chileans—with the non-migrant population of Swedes. In her multivariate analyses, Duvander (2001) examined whether country-specific skills are significant by analysing three indicators: (1) whether the highest level of education had been achieved in Sweden, (2) whether migrants lived together with a Swedish partner (with the assumption that this improves Swedish social and cultural-specific capital), and (3) whether migrants were fluent in Swedish. The duration of stay in Sweden was also considered. The immigrant groups were compared with one another as well as with the group of Swedes and the study revealed some interesting results.

First, indicators of country-specific skills did not, to any significant degree, influence the risk of unemployment. The only factor that was positively correlated with unemployment rates was the amount of time spent in the country, but the authors did not explain the reasons for this (Duvander 2001). The analyses also showed the significance of gender; generally, women were less likely to be unemployed but more likely to be overqualified.

Second, the overqualification rates were similar for Swedes (44 percent of females; 42 percent of males), Finns (50 percent of females; 40 percent of males), and Polish men (43 percent). The overqualification rates were significantly higher for Polish women (73 percent), Chileans (75 percent of females; 72 percent of males), and Iranians (64 percent of females; 75 percent of males). Both advanced language

skills and education attained in Sweden were positively correlated with occupational positions. As the author concludes, the analysed indicators of country-specific skills improved the labour-market positions of immigrants but failed to comprehensively explain the overqualification of immigrants. Immigrants face different levels of disadvantage not measured by education or potential labour market experience. The compared national groups differed not only in overqualification rates but also in the extent to which the three indicators of country-specific skills influenced the probability of overqualification. Finnish immigrants had better labour positions than the remaining three groups, while Poles occupied slightly better positions than Iranians and Chileans. As Duvander (2001) notes, the results may entail either the different employment strategies of these groups, differentiated degrees of ethnic discrimination against each of these national groups, or both. Duvander (2001) also attributed the most advantageous position held by Finns to their cultural proximity and similar physical appearance. Many different studies have found that specific ethic groups perceived as culturally proximate by the citizens of a certain country are at an advantage in obtaining the more desirable job positions (e.g. Friberg and Midtbøen 2017, Guðjónsdóttir et al. 2017). Salmonsson and Mella (2013) term this an 'ethnic bias', observing that some migrant groups tend to be perceived as 'second class' professionals.

Some authors have indicated that downwardly mobile migrants experience conflicting or contradictory class mobility, meaning that even working below their level of competence in the immigration country, migrants are able to achieve higher incomes, and as a result improve their economic and social status in the country (or rather community) of origin, despite their low economic and social status in the destination country (Kołbon, 2016). This explanation is not comprehensive, however; while for some migrants, their rise in economic status is satisfactory and compensates for other losses, it is questionable whether higher incomes are a direct indicator of improved social status in the community of origin. For migrants who desire to perform

their professions, economic profits do not compensate for loss of social status and devaluation of their qualifications, either in the community of origin or in the destination society.

Downward professional mobility has also been observed among Polish migrants in the United Kingdom (Trevena 2011, 2013, Nowicka 2012, 2014a). Poles have lower rates of return for their human capital than other recent migrants in the UK, particularly after controlling for personal and job-related characteristics. This indicates that Poles in the UK suffer from a significant mismatch between their skills and their earnings (Nowicka 2014a). Both Nowicka (2014) and Trevena (2013) refer to the inflation of degrees in Poland and the delinking of higher education from the labour market in Poland, or so-called diploma devaluation. Their studies resulted in some comparable findings, demonstrating that Polish migrants did not attach importance to their education from Poland and that, for many, the low-skilled jobs in the UK were satisfactory. These conclusions, again, do not embrace immigrants who value their education and who strive to improve their labour market positions. One of Trevena's arguments is that overeducation and the increase in the tertiary-educated workforce in Britain have contributed to the disadvantageous positioning of Polish migrants (Trevena 2013: 176). Without disputing that assertion in the UK context, this explanation does not seem to be transferable to the context of the Norwegian labour market, which suffers rather from underqualification and a perennial shortage of skilled labour (Schramm Nielsen et al. 2004, OECD 2018b, 2017).

A more personal aspect of the experience of downward professional mobility among migrants has been touched on by Vianello (2014). She interviewed female Ukrainian migrants in their 40s and 50s working in Italy as live-in domestic workers and caregivers, but who were simultaneously the main breadwinners for their families in the Ukraine. The author was particularly interested in their subjective perceptions of downward professional mobility. Vianello identified a coping strategy among the interviewed women, who tended to perceive and explain their professional situations

as a transition period and as a tool to improve the economic situations of their families in the Ukraine. The study also found some results that contradict the finding that economic satisfaction compensates for downward mobility. Women from Vianello's study felt so ashamed by their work that they avoided discussing it with their relatives. In the author's interpretation, they tried to completely erase this fact from their experience (Vianello 2014: 90). The study also found that one of the most difficult factors for migrants was that their employers often had lower education than themselves.

Although the literature on downward professional mobility has already provided diverse insights on this phenomenon, some questions remain unanswered. For example, in studies on Polish migrants, rather little has been said about migrants who express a desire to work in the professions for which they are qualified. I aim to fill this gap by embracing individuals who value their education, professional skills, and experience and thus by covering a variety of professional trajectories. The limited research sample comprising of individuals who in majority had not entered the labour market prior to migration, as in Trevena's study (Trevena 2013, 2011), raises a question about their downward professional mobility and related experiences. As mentioned above, proposed explanations of downward professional mobility in the UK context do not seem to be simply transferable to the Norwegian case, as these two countries' labour markets differ in their demands for skilled labour.

Research that has examined immigrant niches in Norway has tended to focus mainly on employers' perspectives on Polish workers (Friberg and Midtbøen 2019, 2017). By bringing to light Poles' own perspectives on their professional careers in Norway, this study aims to add to the literature on immigrant niches by supplementing the as-yet-incomplete picture.

CHAPTER 3. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

In this chapter, I discuss the theoretical concepts that contributed to the analytical and conceptual framework for this study. As discussed in the introductory chapter, this dissertation is concerned with *how Polish migrants perceive and respond to their downward professional mobility in the Norwegian labour market.* To explore the research question, the dissertation builds mainly on three sets of theoretical conceptualisations: (1) habitus and field; (2) identity and identification; and (3) othering, racialisation, and stigma.

When seeking a theoretical approach, I examined theories that would enable me to incorporate both the agentic and structural factors involved in shaping migrants' perceptions of, responses to, and experiences with downward professional mobility. In this respect, Bourdieu's theory of practice, which in itself is an attempt to reconcile the dichotomy of agency and structure, emerged as a potential theoretical perspective. Analysis of the collected data prompted me to extend the theoretical framework by applying the concepts of identity, identification, othering, racialisation, and stigma. Application of these concepts allowed me to widen the explanation of the experiences described by the study participants and the meaning-making related to their downward professional mobility. Identity (particularly national identity) turned out to play a crucial role in structuring migrants' experiences, and self-positioning within the field of the Norwegian labour market. The concepts of othering, racialisation, and stigma add to our understanding of the processes that affect migrants' experiences and their professional mobilities. When combined, the theoretical concepts provide a coherent frame to explore and analyse the research problem.

In the following sections, I first introduce the notions of habitus and field and justify their use as a main analytical framework. Subsequent sections concern identity and identification, with a focus on professional and national identities. Following this,

I elucidate the application of othering, racialisation, and stigma within my theoretical framework. When discussing consecutive concepts, I outline their use in the articles and explain how they contribute to exploring the research questions.

Theory of practice: habitus and field

Before discussing the concepts of habitus and field in more detail and with a focus on their application in this dissertation, I would like to provide their primary definitions, although both concepts are of a rather complex and multifaceted nature.

Habitus is a set of embodied dispositions, internalised by individuals based on the opportunities and constraints that have framed their experiences. As Bourdieu notes, habitus is *structured* by one's past and present circumstances (field conditions) and is simultaneously *structuring* one's present and future practices (Bourdieu 1990: emphasis in original). Individuals equipped with certain sets of dispositions, internalised as natural social order, translate these dispositions into practices. Thus, the embodied dispositions that make up habitus are the products of the opportunities and constraints that have framed the individual's previous experiences and can be defined as categories of perception (Bourdieu 1990). As a tool, habitus enables a more thorough exploration of internalised perceptions, behaviours, beliefs, and attitudes.

Fields are the spaces in which individuals occupy certain positions. They structure relations between social positions in terms of privilege and disadvantage, domination and subordination, as well as determining the power relations between individuals (Bourdieu 1993, 1988). A fundamental feature of social fields is thus their hierarchical structure. The hierarchies of economically and culturally dominant and dominated positions (re)produce social inequalities. Nevertheless, field structures are not fixed, but are shaped historically and are therefore in a continuous process of transformation. Furthermore, fields are multiple and overlapping, and individuals occupy many fields simultaneously (Bourdieu 1984, 1988, 1991, 1990, 1977, 1996, Bourdieu et al. 1990). For example, a workplace can be seen as a micro-field

embedded in the field of the wider national labour market. If investigating international migration, it is important to examine how the national labour market relates to the even wider field of international and transnational relations. Each field thus has micro-fields and subfields. The micro-field, although following the logic of the macro-field, has its own internal logic and rules.

Bourdieu's theory of practice has been applied in various sociological subdisciplines such as educational studies, sociology of sport or migration studies, to mention a few (various examples of this theory use can be found in edited books: Costa et al. 2015, Ingram et al. 2016). For migration scholars, Bourdieu's theory has been particularly attractive due to its explanatory virtue in analysing the capital transition and habitus entanglement that accompany international migration, which is understood as a field change (e.g. Nowicka 2015a, 2015b, Bauder 2008, Erel et al. 2018, Erel 2010, Bauder 2005, Thatcher and Halvorsrud 2016, Benson and O'Reilly 2009, Reed-Danahay 2017). My study draws on Pierre Bourdieu's theory of practice and its key conceptual dyad of habitus and field in seeking the answer to the research question. This is useful for the four specific reasons outlined below.

First, labour market participation involves the major sociological factors of agency and structure, whereas Bourdieu's theory of practice aims to reconcile this ontological dichotomy. Individuals seeking job positions in the labour market depend both on their own agency and the structural conditions. The conceptual tools of habitus and field enable human action to be theorised as 'a dialectical relationship between objective structures and subjective agency' (Stahl 2015: 21). Grenfell (2008) perceives this theory as an 'ontological complicity' between the objective and internalised structures, preserving what has been gained from both the subjectivist and objectivist traditions. Intra-European migrants have the capacity to act freely and make their own, independent labour market choices; however, as demonstrated and discussed in the introduction and chapter two, the previous research has demonstrated that migrants occupy specific and less favourable positions in the host

labour markets, which entails the existence of structural limitations to their outwardly available choices and opportunities. Therefore, incorporation of both the agentic and structural factors involved in shaping migrants' perceptions and professional choices allows for a more complex picture of the phenomenon to be drawn.

Second, the habitus concept is particularly useful in analysing migrants' experiences with downward professional mobility and employment in low-skilled jobs because, in addition to allowing for agency and choice, habitus recognises that choices are limited and it shapes the vision of subjective expectations of objective probabilities (Bourdieu 1990, 1977). Bourdieu characterised social practices (and actions) as dispositional, not rational as proposed by rational choice theory. A rational agent aims to maximise profits by determining and choosing the optimal means and most effective strategies. Bourdieu's proposition allows us to understand why people do not choose the 'best' alternatives and solutions that would maximise their profits (Bourdieu 1984, 2005, 1990), as in the case of skilled and highly skilled migrants taking low-skilled (and lower-paid) jobs.

Third, theory of practice aims at uncovering the logic of social practice. Approaching Polish migrants' tendency to take low-skilled jobs after migration and examining this phenomenon not only as an individual but also as a collective social practice provided insights into the rationale behind their choices, decisions, and perceptions. I also consider the field and habitus dyad covering both the spatiality (i.e. connection between different fields) and temporality (habitus as the interconnection between past, present, and future) of the phenomenon of downward professional mobility, and thus providing an opportunity to better understand the complexity of conditions that shape migrants' professional trajectories. Exploration of migrants' downward professional mobility as a collective social practice can add to our understanding of the logic behind apparently individual decisions and actions.

Fourth, the concepts of habitus and field allowed me to analyse the dynamics and changes resulting from the constant interaction between study participants'

habitus and fields considered by this study. The analysis examines the conditions of three fields that influenced how study participants perceive and respond to their professional mobilities: (1) the transnational field of national hierarchies, (2) the field in which migrants' habitus and national identity have been shaped, (3) the Norwegian labour market and its workplaces. I discuss my understanding of these fields in detail later in the chapter. Downward professional mobility (job change) intersected with international migration comprises a significant and rapid transition between and within these fields, which can generate tensions, mismatches, and development of adaptive capacities of the habitus. An analysis of these processes shows how people respond to change, in this case the change resulting from downward professional mobility intersected with migration. Capturing the dynamics of downward professional mobility sheds light on the sociocultural consequences of this phenomenon.

I apply habitus and field as integrated concepts in my study, as they are in continuous mutual interaction (e.g. Bourdieu 2005: 47). Habitus and field cannot be analysed separately because a certain field conditions a specific habitus, whereas this habitus, which shapes an individual's dispositions (manner of seeing, being, acting, and thinking) determines both their actions and self-positioning in the different fields they enter throughout their lives (Bourdieu 2005, 1990, 1977). Practices can be accounted for only by relating the social conditions in which the habitus that generated those practices was constituted, to the social conditions in which the habitus was implemented (Bourdieu 1990: 56). In this thesis, I explore the research questions by conceptualising different layers of the fields by which and in which participants' experiences are shaped and lived. Whereas the outline of these fields is based particularly on analysing socio-historical conditions, a review of the relevant literature, and the use of supplementary theories described later in the chapter, the analysis of participants' narratives provides more direct insight into how individuals' interactions with these fields affect them and their habitus.

In the forthcoming sections, I first describe the notion of habitus in further detail by introducing what I call 'the national component of habitus'. Following this, I elaborate on habitus dynamics and its ability to change.

National component of habitus

Habitus is a comprehensive concept that incorporates different aspects of the socially shaped predispositions of an individual. Whether a certain dimension of habitus is passive or active depends on the current events in the lives of the individuals concerned and their interactions within the field. When people migrate to another country, the national dimension of their habitus comes into play as they experience different conditions than those in which their habitus was originally shaped.

Elias coined the notion of national habitus in his work 'The civilizing process', first published in 1939, to define the national character that conditions individuals' emotional and affective behaviours and perceptions (Elias 1994, 2013). More recently, Kuipers, drawing on Elias' notion, highlights the changing dynamics of national cultures, including their historical rises and declines, and calls for a more historicised and processual understanding of national culture (Kuipers 2013). Bourdieu's notion of habitus, apart from allowing for incorporation of the nationally-shaped element, also implies its dynamic nature, recognition of change, and ability to adapt. Therefore, I use Bourdieu's concept of habitus and extend it by applying the national component. Scholars incorporating the national dimension into Bourdieu's concept tend to focus on concepts of capital and cultural capital in particular (Bauder 2006a, Erel and Ryan 2018, Erel 2010, Cederberg 2015). The Bourdieusian notion of habitus along with its national implications were applied by Bauder (2005, Bauder 2006b, Bauder 2008), who analysed the relationship between migration and international segmentation of the labour markets. Although in his first work, the link between habitus and its nationally bounded dimension was rather intuitive (Bauder 2005), in his later works, Bauder (2006b, Bauder 2008) drew a clear distinction and link between citizenship and habitus. He also introduced the notion of citizenship

capital, addressing the privileged positions that arise from certain citizenships in host labour markets. A similar point, although not based on Bourdieu's concepts, is made by Friberg and Midtbøen (2017), who propose the notion of 'ethnicity as skill', referring to the phenomenon whereby certain nationalities are assigned to specific professional positions with certain professional skills.

Inspired by these discussions and in conjunction with the patterns that emerged in my analysis, I propose that habitus has a national component. By the national component of habitus, I refer to three interrelated aspects: (1) the dispositions of individuals socialised within a particular national culture in the course of their upbringing and education, (2) national identity and self-identification with the nation and co-nationals, and (3) construction of and meanings attached to a particular nationality within a certain field. The first element is associated with national cultures and the functioning of nation-states which condition and generate certain standards and styles that are internalised by individuals. The second element, national identity, determines people's self-definition as members of a specific nation and the resulting self-positioning amongst other nations. The third element, construction and meaning of a certain nationality, determines how individuals are positioned by others in the field of national hierarchies. The power of positioning may function independently of the individual's national self-identification through the meanings and statuses attached to certain citizenship. However, these two are usually interrelated.

The national component of habitus is addressed in both articles 1 and 2. In article 1, I draw a link between habitus, its national component, and the tendency of Polish migrants to channel themselves into low-skilled employment. By describing the socio-historical conditions that have shaped the stereotypical image of a Polish migrant, article 1 illustrates how self-perceptions internalised in the habitus guided the professional and migratory choices of the study participants. Article 2 then focuses on the mismatch between national identity and the meanings and stigma attached to Polish citizenship.

Habitus dynamics and change

A person's habitus constitution is primarily interrelated with the field(s) of their upbringing and both their primary and secondary socialisation. This does not, however, mean that habitus is permanent and unchanging in adulthood. On the contrary, habitus can transform and is constantly changing as we interact with different social fields throughout our lives.

With international migration providing a pictorial and very current change to the field in today's world, Bourdieu's theory can be used as an efficient tool to analyse migrants' experiences. For example, Nowicka (2013, 2015a, 2015b) employs Bourdieu's concepts of habitus and capital to explore, *inter alia*, whether a change of field facilitates lasting transformations of migrants' attitudes towards tolerance of diversity, and if so, how this process occurs. Research on Polish migrants in the UK and Germany approaches migrants' dispositions (attitudes, perceptions, and practices) as processes, not as individual qualities, and uses the concept of habitus to analyse how migrants' dispositions evolve in the new country (Nowicka 2015b: 96). Bourdieu's concepts thus allow to embed the transformation of migrant dispositions within complex systems of power relations (Nowicka 2015a: 9) and to examine how migrants' positioning in complex power structures affects their practices (Nowicka 2015a: 12).

When people migrate, their habitus is exposed to and challenged by interactions with the conditions of the new field and is subjected to transformation, adjustment, or mismatch. In a constant interplay with social fields, habitus generates new practices and transforms as a result. However, its ability to change is limited (Bourdieu 1977; Bourdieu 1990; Bourdieu 1999; Bourdieu 2000). Habitus does not automatically adapt to the conditions imposed on it. The issues of habitus mismatch and change are addressed in articles 2 and 3.

Article 2 proposes the notion of 'habitus mismatch'. My intention is to develop and extend Bourdieu's notion of a 'cleft habitus', which he used occasionally to

describe his life's experience of upward social mobility. He considered his working-class social background as having had a crucial and unique impact on his development as an academic and analyst of social reality. The upward social mobility was not smooth for Bourdieu and resulted in a sense of maladjustment to both the 'class of origin and destination', which resulted in what he called a 'cleft habitus' (Bourdieu 2007). By habitus mismatch, I aim to call attention to the social dimension of the suffering and struggles related to coping with working below one's level of competence or professional experience and discrepancy between valued but at the same time stigmatised national identity. Article 2 explores the various habitus mismatches that contribute to the suffering of Polish migrants and resulting from their subjective experiences of downward professional and social mobility, as well as the conflict between their valued and stigmatised identities. By approaching suffering as it exists in both the individual and social dimension, in line with Barbalet's definition of emotions as embedded in relationships between individuals and their social situations (Barbalet 1992: 152), the notion of habitus mismatch facilitates incorporation of the emotional aspect of the experience of downward professional mobility.

Habitus change is addressed in article 3. By approaching the workplace as a culturally and nationally bounded field, this article draws a link between the experience of cultural difference and habitus change. It proposes that 'moments of consciousness' of the habitus accelerate change, and that habitus change is an element of the cultural adaptation process, which involves the reflexive evaluation of one's own culturally-shaped and internalised dispositions and perceptions related to the conduct of interpersonal communication and work performance.

Fields and national cultures

This thesis takes into consideration three particular fields involved in the shaping of the study participants' experiences with downward professional mobility intersected with migration. The first is a macro-field which I call the transnational field of national

hierarchies. The other two fields remain closely related to this macro-field and tend to mutually interact with it. The second is the field in which migrants' habitus and national identity have been shaped. The shaping of the habitus occurs during primary and secondary socialisation and results in social self-understanding and self-positioning (Bourdieu 1977, 1990). This reflects the fact that the workings of nation states play a significant role in conditioning individuals' perceptions, habits, and self-perception. The third field, the Norwegian labour market and workplaces, comprises the field of the study participants' experiences. International migration reflects Bourdieu's metaphor of a field as a game, with migrants as novice players entering the game (a new labour market), where their positions and status are to some extent determined by their citizenship. In addition, national identity influences how they position themselves in this labour market, and which positions they consider available to them.

Different fields have their own rules and involve distinct processes that determine the structure of positions accessible to and occupied by individuals. The transnational field of national hierarchies is based on three fundamental and intertwined mechanisms: othering, stigmatisation, and racialisation. These concepts are discussed later in the chapter.

This dissertation also examines workplaces as microcosms reflecting the characteristics of national organisational cultures, where individuals use specific cultural codes to communicate and make meaning of their interpersonal interactions. By employing the concept of cultural codes (Kotani 2017, Ellingsworth 1988), article 3 investigates the process of adaptation to the new field. Bourdieu's approach allows inclusion of the agentic and dynamic role of migrants in transforming their habitus, while remaining sensitive to power relations working in the field (Erel 2010: 649).

Identities and identification

Identity and identification appeared to play a crucial role in shaping participants' understanding and experiences of their downward professional mobility. While I anticipated that professional identity may influence study participants' experiences of downward professional mobility and related struggles, I did not think that national identity, or more precisely 'being a Polish migrant in Norway', would come to the fore in participants' accounts both in terms of the frequency of narratives referring to being Polish, and its meaningful impact on shaping their perceptions of their professional careers after migrating to Norway.

Identity is a concept that has been approached in many different ways. Not only has it been developed by different fields of social sciences, such as anthropology (Barth et al. 1994, Barth 1998), social psychology (Tajfel et al. 1986, Tajfel 1982, Burke et al. 2009), and sociology (Lawler 2015, Hall 2000, Jenkins 2008, Goffman 1968), but also, in sociology itself, understanding of identity has developed into different paradigms such as socio-linguistic, discursive, or psychoanalytical approaches (see e.g. Du Gay et al. 2000). This subchapter endeavours to understand identity as applied in my analysis that resonates with the interactionist and constructivist approaches to identity. Rather than focusing on differences between the different authors, this subchapter aims to extract some common points which have a crucial meaning in exploring the research question.

Social identity is associated with the need to belong to a social group. This need has been explained through the positive effects it has on the psychosocial condition of individuals (Major, Dovidio, Link, et al. 2017, Jetten et al. 2017, Simandan 2018, Cruwys et al. 2014). Belonging to a social group provides individuals with, among other benefits, perceived collective continuity, social well-being, and reduction of uncertainty (Sani et al. 2007, Mullin et al. 1999). Group-making and belonging entail the process of othering those who do not belong to a given group. They involve

constructions of similarity and difference, imaginaries of 'us' and 'others', and homogenisation or perception of group members as similar (Udah et al. 2019).

Identity is an ongoing and dynamic process of being and becoming (Lawler 2015, Jenkins 2008), which links self and other, past and present (Lawler 2015: 35). According to Jenkins (2008: 17), identifying ourselves and others always involves meaning-making, while meaning always entails interaction: communication and negotiation. Similarly, Lawler (2015: 19) argues that identity does not belong 'within' the individual, but is produced between individuals in social relations. Only when taken into account together can both similarity and difference explain the dynamic principles of identification (Jenkins 2008: 18). Through the process of identification, individuals establish and signify relationships of similarity and difference in relation to others, between collectivities, and between individuals and collectivities (Jenkins 2008: 18).

This study approaches identities as a form of conditioning and being conditioned by habitus. Individuals' identities determine their sense of the social positions they occupy within particular fields (Bourdieu 1987, 1991: 234). In the forthcoming subchapter, I elaborate on professional and national identities, respectively, as these dimensions of identity appeared to play an important role in study participants' perceptions and responses to their downward professional mobility in Norway.

Professional identity

The concept of professional identity is introduced in articles 1 and 2. Professional identity (in conjunction with national identity) influences migrants' professional trajectories (article 1) and contributes to their struggles with downward professional mobility (article 2).

Although migrants express different levels of sense of identification with the professions for which they are qualified, these levels of attachment are important for understanding how they navigated their professional careers upon and after

migration, which I have addressed particularly in article 1. However, it is worth noting that national identity plays no less significant a role in their selection of low-skilled jobs and in the overall experience of downward professional mobility that occurs with migration to Norway. Before discussing the notion of national identity, I will examine how professional identities influence individuals' positioning in their surrounding social structures.

Professional identity can be defined as one's professional self-perception based on one's values, motives, and attributes. People use this self-perception to define their position in the specialised education- and skill-oriented structure of occupations (Slay et al. 2011, Ibarra 1999). Slay et al. (2011) point to the three factors constituting professional identity: (1) the meanings associated with the profession, (2) adjustment and adaptation to professional identity during different periods of career transition, and (3) self-understanding. Due to the differing levels of prestige between professions (Duemmler et al. 2017), they are of great importance in determining the social positions of individuals (Ashforth et al. 1999, Domański 1991). The prestige of a profession is linked with the education it requires, its task complexity, and income, but also with the social respect and power it affords (Duemmler and Caprani 2017).

Professional identities, however, are not simply determined by their prestige, as this would suggest that only people performing prestigious jobs can derive positive professional identities, while this is, in fact, not the case (Billet 2007, Duemmler and Caprani 2017, Nowicka 2014b). Notwithstanding, those who perform less prestigious jobs and particularly those who are downwardly mobile in their professional careers are more exposed to struggles with social perception of their professional positions (Duemmler and Caprani 2017) and the associated psychological burden (Ashforth and Kreiner 1999, Lucas et al. 2017, Slay et al. 2011). Therefore, transition to less prestigious professions results in a distressing loss of capital in the form of prestige and social status. In this way, downward professional mobility is an individual experience deeply embedded in the social structure. Asforth and Kreiner (1999)

discuss the challenge of constructing a positive identity when performing what they call 'dirty work'. By 'dirty work', they understand any occupation that is morally or physically tainted in the social perception. If individuals perceive their work as 'dirty' or 'polluted', with time they begin to perceive themselves as such.

National identity

This thesis understands national identity as socially constructed, imagined, and at the same time profoundly influencing individuals' self-definition and self-positioning. Although the foundations of a nation can have a character of an imaginary or idea, or as Anderson (1991) puts it an 'imagined community', various and complex processes make nations real through the powerful sentiments of their members (Verdery 1996: 78). The way in which individuals make meaning of national identity as well as how their citizenship determines their positionality depends on the fields with which they interact.

As the issue of national identity was pivotal for study participants' perceptions of and responses to downward professional mobility, this concept is considered in the analyses of each of the three articles. In article 1, national identity proves to be a key component of the habitus which guides study participants' decisions that move them onto downward professional trajectories. In article 2, national identity serves as a tool in analysing study participants' suffering as a result of the discrepancy between their national self-identification and the meanings attached to their national identity. Article 3 shows how their national identification shapes their experiences and interpretations of cultural difference.

Othering, racialisation, and stigma

To understand the processes involved in shaping the conditions of the fields analysed in this dissertation, I employ the concepts of othering, stigma, and racialisation. This subchapter discusses each of these in turn. The use of these concepts is driven

particularly by the narratives I encountered when conducting the interviews and analysing the data.

International movement of people has been inherently intertwined with social constructions of 'us' and 'others', majority and minority, and natives and migrants. The positionality of migrating individuals has been determined by their non-belonging to the social groups within the host society (e.g. Udah and Singh 2019, Buchowski 2006). As early as 1944, Schütz (1944), in his prominent essay 'The Stranger: an essay in social psychology', recognised that a 'migrant' is an outstanding example of a strangerness. Later, Weiss (2005) remarked that the social meanings of the notion of 'migrant' mark migrants as different from members of the host society, while simultaneously symbolically homogenising each respective group.

The workings of nation states contribute to reinforcing the citizens (insiders) versus non-citizens (outsiders) dichotomy (Bendixsen 2018). Noble (2005: 188) calls this the 'production and regulation of strangeness' which continually affects migrants. Their belonging to the (new) national environment always remains precarious (Skey 2013, Nowicka 2018a, Hage 1998) and 'they are never just present, they are positioned' (Hage 1998: 90). As Essed and Treinekens (2008: 58), who studied perceptions of immigrants in Dutch society, note, migrants are 'treated as second-class citizens, never quite Dutch, never quite the norm, always considered as aspiring, as a problem, lagging behind', where 'Dutch' can easily be replaced with any other adjective that describes national belonging. According to Hage, the crucial function of otherness is to construct and maintain the fantasy of the national having its own space (Hage 1998, 74). In the context of intra-European migration, the othering has been particularly reinforced by the East versus West dichotomy, with Eastern European migrants marked as 'other' (Neumann 1999, Young et al. 2001, van Heuckelom 2013, Wolff 1994, Kuus 2004, Davies 2007, van Riemsdijk 2010, 2013).

Stigmas emphasise the otherness and strangeness of immigrants and are aimed at formulating that 'something is wrong with them'. Through stigmatisation, migrants

are deprived of their individual subjectivity and uniqueness. All are identified with a set of features and properties that define a distinct, usually ethnic, group of migrants. As a consequence, migrants are labelled 'handymen', 'manual workers', or 'domestic cleaners' (Niedźwiedzki 2016: 117). In this way, stigmatisation is associated with occupational stereotyping.

Another process at work in the fields analysed in this dissertation is racialisation. This study understands racism in line with its conceptual development from the eighties and nineties, referred to as cultural racism, new racism (Barker 1982), or neo-racism (Balibar 1991). This new kind of 'cultural' and 'differentialist' racism replaces biology with culture, and race with immigrants (Balibar 1991) and refers to exploitation of social groups on the basis of cultural differences. Barker (1982) understands racism as profoundly based on the common tendency of human nature to form bounded social groups and to differentiate between 'us' and 'outsiders' or 'foreigners'. He links racism directly to the imaginaries of nations and to the socialised perception of differences between nations. As he remarks, a feeling of antagonism tends to arise in particular when 'the outsiders' (immigrants) appear physically in the field. Nations are connected to certain territories, socially naturalised as their homes (Barker 1982: 4-5, 21).

Racialisation may be defined as the process whereby social groups categorise other groups as different or inferior, on the basis of cultural or phenotypical markers (Castles et al. 2013: 32). In her critical analysis of the Norwegian immigration debate, Gullestad (2002) examines how Norway's new inhabitants are discussed in the scientific, political, and media discourses. She outlines how these discourses prevent immigrants from being respected as worthy Norwegian citizens through the process of racialisation. In her work, Gullestad (2004, 2002, 2006) highlights the mutual character of racialisation which racialises not only the disadvantaged groups and their members, but also those in advantageous positions.

Other works on racialisation and racism in the Scandinavian context have been developed specifically within the paradigm of postcolonial and whiteness studies as well as their combinations (e.g. Loftsdóttir 2017, Guðjónsdóttir 2014, Loftsdóttir et al. 2012, Keskinen et al. 2009, Keskinen et al. 2017). Although these are not the main theoretical perspectives of my analysis, I am inspired by some of the conceptual developments made by this strand of literature. In particular, I draw on some recent theoretical debates on hierarchies of desirability of national migrant groups (Guðjónsdóttir 2014, Loftsdóttir 2017, Guðjónsdóttir and Loftsdóttir 2017), which resonate with the theories of ethnically segmented labour markets (Bauder 2006b, Bauder 2008, Friberg and Midtbøen 2017) discussed earlier in the thesis. Levels of desirability of certain national migrant groups depend on their cultural proximity to the 'host national cultures' and are based on racialising processes. By embedding these national hierarchies within Bourdieu's field notion, I aim to conceptualise their contextualised and historicised socio-spatial dimension. Moreover, the habitus concept allows me to link study participants' perceptions and responses to their downward professional mobility with the encountered structural limitations.

Chapter summary

In the preceding sections of this chapter, I introduced the theoretical framework for the analysis of study participants' perceptions and responses to their downward professional mobility after migration to Norway.

Each of the three articles utilises the habitus and field concepts and complements them with other concepts introduced in this chapter. Based on these theories, each of the articles develops some of these notions or proposes new ones. Drawing on the habitus concept, article 1 proposes the notion of a 'national component of the habitus', which helps to explain why study participants' professional choices and decisions have been conditioned in a particular way. Article 2, inspired by Bourdieu's term 'cleft habitus', develops the notion of habitus

mismatch. Habitus mismatch serves to explain the multiple mismatches and suffering which study participants experienced as a result of their downward mobility after migration. Article 3 examines habitus change as an element of the adaptation process.

The articles focus on different layers of the fields analysed in this dissertation. Article 1 analyses how the fields in which study participants' habitus was shaped influenced their self-positioning in the field of the Norwegian labour market, which is a subfield of the transnational field of national hierarchies. To conceptualise the power relations working within these fields, I use the concepts of othering, stigma, and racialisation. These processes ascribe particular meanings to national identities. To allow these power relations to work, it is necessary to investigate whether and in what ways migrants identify themselves with the identities signified by these processes. Article 2 continues to draw on this understanding and analyses how interaction between these fields and their habitus influences migrants' wellbeing. Moreover, the concept of professional identity adds to our understanding of their struggles with experienced mismatches in the new field. Article 3 examines the field on the micro-scale. It approaches the workplaces that constitute migrants' social spaces as a micro-field of the Norwegian labour market with its specific rules, which are new for the study participants. The article proposes the notion of 'cultural distrust' to address the process whereby multiple cultural misunderstandings lead to migrants' distrust towards 'old regulars' of the field in which they (migrants) are just the new beginners and strive to recognise the rules of the game.

CHAPTER 4. RESEARCH DESIGN

The rationale for this study stems from the results of quantitative research, which identified and evidenced that rates of overqualification among Polish migrants in Norway are higher than among nationals (SSB 2017). The desire to explore and expand the extant knowledge about this phenomenon underlay the methodological decisions and choices I made and that are illuminated in this chapter. In the forthcoming part of the chapter, I justify my choice of qualitative interviews as a tool for data collection. I then describe the consecutive steps involved in implementing the research, including participant recruitment and data processing, and I characterise the data and sample. I then reflect upon my positionality within the research and clarify my understanding of knowledge production and the generalisability of the research findings.

Rationale for the choice of qualitative interviews as a research method

This study is guided by the overall research question: *how do Polish migrants perceive and respond to their downward professional mobility in the Norwegian labour market?* By means of this research question, I aim to broaden the extant knowledge about the logic, dynamics, and meaning-making that underly downward professional mobility among Polish migrants in Norway. The desire to cover these aspects guided my methodological choices, starting with the choice of method for data collection.

Qualitative methods are recognised as supporting research goals aimed at understanding social processes, intentions, and social meanings (Castles 2012: 9, 15). Since the goal of my study was to explore and understand the personal experiences of Poles who have worked below their level of qualification in Norway, in choosing an appropriate method, I considered explorative qualitative methods, which enable the in-depth personal views, beliefs, and experiences of research participants to be grasped. The 'qualitative' aspect emphasises the qualities of the research subjects, on

meanings and processes, which are not quantitively measurable in terms of frequency, amount, or intensity (Denzin et al. 2003: 13). According to Morawska (2018) the strength of qualitative studies stems from their ability to provide more accurate representations of the social worlds of the individuals than quantitative study and analysis (Morawska 2018: 115).

Carling (2012: 138) compares the opportunities offered by quantitative survey and qualitative interview when researching the complexity of experiences related to migration from point a to point b, and affirms that 'in survey migration histories can only take up a few moments of an interview' (Carling 2012: 137). Similarly, Byrne (2018: 220) observes that qualitative interviews enable individuals' attitudes and values to be accessed in a way that a questionnaire cannot.

According to Fedyuk and Zentai (2018: 174), the individual interview simultaneously offers 'the richness of experience and thickness of ethnographic data' which is not equally achievable by other qualitative methods like focus groups, observation, or discourse analysis. Similarly, I see the strength of the interview to lie in its rich potential for one-to-one conversation (Fedyuk and Zentai 2018: 179). Interviews also have a peculiar potential in researching vulnerable migrant groups (Fedyuk and Zentai 2018) or those who have been ignored or misrepresented (Byrne 2018). They allow study participants to speak in their own voices and with their own language (Byrne 2018: 221, Morawska 2018: 116).

As many scholars indicate (e.g. Rubin et al. 2012, Byrne 2018, Yeo et al. 2014), interviews are an effective method of generating description and interpretation of social worlds by providing researchers with access to interviewees' social realities. By means of qualitative interviews, we may learn how individuals make sense of themselves, their experiences, and their positions within their social worlds (Miller et al. 2016: 51, 52, Yeo et al. 2014: 178). By offering the possibility to achieve clarification and detailed understanding, interviews appear to be a reasonable method for exploring complex processes and experiences (Lewis 2003: 58). From the perspective

of the aims of this study, i.e. to explore the experiences of downward professional mobility and to understand the logic and dynamics behind this phenomenon, I considered the interview to be possibly the most effective method for answering the guiding research questions.

The most common typology divides interviews into structured, semi-structured, and unstructured, depending on the rigidity of the interview scenario (Fedyuk and Zentai 2018). To support my exploratory approach to the phenomena under study, I decided to conduct semi-structured interviews. I considered that unstructured interviews might shift the interview topic too far from the studied problem, whereas structured interviews might overly limit the interview content. In the semi-structured interview, on the other hand, the researcher prepares some questions in advance, but leaves space for interviewees to introduce issues of concern to them, while remaining within the framework of the main topic. This approach to the interview makes it exploratory and at the same time supports the cooperative character of knowledge production. It also fosters identification and inclusion of unexpected topics and perspectives into the inquiry (Fedyuk and Zentai 2018: 173).

Study participants' recruitment and interviews implementation

The inclusion criteria for participation in the study comprised (1) people of Polish nationality; (2) who have been living in Norway for at least 1 year; and (3) who have been working below their level of qualifications in Norway. This meant persons who were still working below their qualifications, or who had previously done so. I defined qualifications as (a) the highest level of education and/or (b) length and type of professional experience, and/or (c) certificates enabling one to perform a certain profession.

I aimed to conduct 30 interviews with individuals characterised by various sociodemographic features. I wanted the sample to be diversified in terms of gender, age, place of residence, type of education and profession, to be able to grasp

similarities and differences within the diversity. Therefore, I adapted maximum variation sampling, which is based on the logic of investigating significant, common patterns within the variation of cases (Patton 1990: 172). Moreover, I aimed to contribute to the academic literature by widening the group researched, as studies on Polish migrants in Norway to date have been limited to workers in specific industries (Friberg and Midtbøen 2017, Friberg 2010, 2012), or inhabitants of specific locations, particularly Oslo (Friberg and Tyldum 2007, Friberg and Eldring 2011); or, as in the case of qualitative research on downward professional mobility, only to females in a certain age range (Vianello 2014), or exclusively to young, single migrants, most of whom have not entered the labour market prior to migration (Trevena 2013, 2011). I also wished to include pre-accession immigrants, who have often been omitted from previous research, despite representing the most settled migrant group. As a result, gathering a sample comprising people of different ages, professions, and in varying life situations allowed me to capture a comprehensive picture of experiences related to downward professional mobility.

To recruit study participants, I used existing Facebook groups. While many social scientists have presented and described Facebook usage, the vast majority relate to Facebook as a field of research for the purposes of such methods as content analysis (You et al. 2017, Huang et al. 2013) or as a platform for recruiting participants to online surveys (Bhutta 2012). However, little has been said about Facebook as a potential online tool for sampling participants for a later qualitative research conducted offline. Facebook is visited by 2.07 billion people monthly and has 1.37 billion active users worldwide. More than 50 percent of European Union residents use Facebook regularly (Clement 2020). Facebook development has contributed to permanent transmission of a part of the social world into the online reality. In the European context, it has 271 million users, divided into differentiated groups of common interest, life situation, place of residence, or profession. It provides

researchers with access to a substantial part of the population in a way that was inconceivable before the Facebook era.

One possible usage of Facebook for participant recruitment is to access existing Facebook groups. Migrants tend to group together on social media. To illustrate the potentiality in migration studies, I present some membership numbers in particular Polish groups in different countries: Poles in France, 17,900; Poles in Germany, 76,000; Our life in the UK (*Nasze życie w UK*), 60,000; and Poles in Norway, 37,700. As presented in chapter two, Poles are a numerous immigrant group in different countries, as reflected in these Facebook groups. Long-standing observation of such groups inspired me to use this method for participant recruitment.

As I was planning to publish the invitation to participate in the study, my main concern was related to the possible perception of the invitation by the Facebook group members. I intended my invitation to 'sound' both professional and amicable, as being too official could have resulted in discouraging potential participants and a feeling of distance, while writing in an overly friendly and unofficial manner could have given an impression of frivolity. Therefore, I attempted to find a balance between formality and informality by providing an objective description of the project and ending the invitation courteously. I published the invitation to participate in the study on the following Facebook groups: *Poles in Norway, Poles in Oslo, Poles in Bergen,* and the *Polish-Norwegian Association of Poles in Bodø*.

Name of group	Number of members	Number of people willing to participate	Number of recruited interviewees
Poles in Norway	27,000	20	14
Renewed invitation		6	5
Poles in Oslo	9,200	4	3
Poles in Bergen	10,300	3	3
Polish-Norwegian Association in Bodø	180	1	1
In total	**46,680**	**34**	**25**

Table 1. Facebook groups where the invitation to participate was published (numbers of members and final effects)

Facebook enabled me to manage the time and place of the interviews in a friendly manner. First, I published the invitation on the largest group, *Poles in Norway*, to ascertain the most common locations of potential participants. The first call resulted in 20 responses, from whom I recruited 14 persons. I excluded persons who had graduated from upper secondary education but had not yet gained professional experience in a specific profession. The majority of potential participants were from the Oslo area and surrounding counties, so I also published my invitation in the group *Poles in Oslo* to populate the sample, and decided that Oslo would be the first location for interviews. The second invitation resulted in four responses and recruitment of a further three study participants. Before visiting Oslo, at the end of September 2017, I conducted three initial interviews via Skype with participants from different locations in Norway: Stavanger, Bergen, and Tromsø. The subsequent interviews were conducted in Oslo in October 2017. My visit to Oslo resulted in 11 interviews (one was conducted via Skype, as the study participant was unable to meet me in person).

At the end of November 2017, I renewed the invitation on the group *Poles in Norway*, and at that time, I stayed in touch with one potential study participant from Bergen who was recruited via the snowball sampling method. I decided to publish the invitation on the group *Poles in Bergen,* which enabled me to recruit the following three participants, and to arrange interviews in Bergen in December 2017.

In the meantime, I was conducting interviews via Skype and Messenger (via video conversation) with those study participants who were unable to meet me during my visits to Oslo and Bergen, or who were from other locations than those visited by me.

My invitation on *Poles in Bodø* resulted in the recruitment of one study participant. The remaining four participants from Bodø were recruited via snowball sampling. In total, among the 30 study participants, 25 were recruited through Facebook groups and 5 by snowball sampling.

I decided to conduct interviews in Polish, which is the study participants' and my native language. I believe that this enabled study participants to express their thoughts and feelings most freely, despite the fact that, for many, expressing their thoughts in English or Norwegian would probably not pose a problem either. The invitation to participate in the study was published in Polish and the transcriptions of interviews were also conducted in Polish. Only the excerpts selected to support the analyses in the articles were translated into English. First, I translated excerpts by myself, and then a Polish-English translator of Polish origin proofed the excerpts. I provided the translator with both the English translations of the excerpts and the Polish originals. I also considered having the chosen excerpts proofed by a native English speaker. To check the possible effects of so doing, I sent some of the translated and proofread translations of excerpts to a native English-speaking proof reader. He made some corrections to make the excerpts sound more natural in English, but I felt that doing so changed some of the meanings and content of the excerpts when compared with the original statements in Polish. Therefore, I decided to preserve the original meaning and to use the excerpts proofread by the first proof reader, who had interpreted the translations based on the Polish excerpts.

The themes I had in mind when preparing for the interviews were: course of participants' educational and professional careers, their migration to Norway, and the context of cultural differences between Poland and Norway (for the interview guide, see appendix on page 188). Following the initial talk, I began the interviews with the words, '*I would like you to start from the beginning…*' followed by one of two alternative requests: '*how and why did you move to Norway*?' or '*tell me about your education*'. Drawing on a variety of interview contents, I infer that I gave participants sufficient freedom in constructing their narratives. Regardless of the initial request (whether I began with the theme of education or migration), the further courses of the interviews differed and my sense is that they were not dependant on the starting point.

However, I did not anticipate two main features of the interviews: their deeply personal and emotional character and their biographical nature. The first lesson I learned was how deeply and emotionally people experienced their downward professional mobility after migration. The other feature, the biographical character of the narratives, stems from the complexity of their experiences. For many, the interview prompted them to structure their life stories and deep experiences that they had never previously shared with anyone, and from some participants I heard that the interview was an unexpectedly emotional experience of a therapeutic nature. This strengthened my belief in the importance of the personal, but at the same time deeply social, experience of downward professional mobility. Simultaneously, this made me even more sensitive to participants' emotions during the interviews. I always tried to pay attention to their feelings and react with empathy. Sometimes, in such moments, the subject of our conversation focused on the internal experiences that accompanied my interlocutor at the life stage he or she was discussing. However, I never insisted on speaking about emotions; we did so when the participant seemed to need it.

Characteristics of data and sample

The analysis is based on the data collected from September 2017 to February 2018 through 30 interviews with Poles who, after migrating to Norway, worked below their level of qualification. The interviews varied in length from 50 minutes to 2 hours and 40 minutes. The average length of interviews was 1 hour and 40 minutes.

The sample consists of 18 women and 12 men, aged between 26 and 60. Their stay in Norway varied from 1 to 15 years, with an average of 5 years. The study participants had diverse educational and professional backgrounds. Five held a vocational degree or professional certificate, nine a bachelor's degree, fifteen a master's degree, and one a doctoral degree. On the following page, I present the table with basic characteristics of the sample.

name	sex	age	No	educational background	first job in Norway	job at the time of the interview
Laura	F	40+	1	vocational (gastronomy)	cleaning services	cleaning services
Natalia	F	20+	3	bachelor (management) +	cleaning services	beautician (self employed)
Kaja	F	20+	3	bachelor (surveyor)	cleaning services	surveyor
Dalia	F	20+	3	master's (psychology)	cleaning services	restaurant employee
Marlena	F	30+	10	master's (economics)	cleaning services	bank advisor
Ela	F	40+	13	master's (history)	cleaning services	shopkeeper (self-employed)
Piotr	M	30+	6	master's (tourism)	cleaning services	cleaning services (sick leave)
Hubert	M	60+	11	master's (national defence) +	cleaning services	handyman
Daria	F	30+	3	master's (political science) +	cleaning services	cleaning services
Maciej	M	30+	10	vocational (mason)	construction worker	mason
Marek	M	50+	15	vocational (chef)	construction worker	restaurant employee
Patryk	M	40+	9	vocational (electrician)	construction worker	roof decker
Tomek	M	30+	2	secondary, professional certificates	construction worker	welder
Dawid	M	20+	2	bachelor (surveyor)	construction worker	construction worker
Kacper	M	30+	7	bachelor (environment) +	construction worker	repairs services (self-employed)
Gosia	F	30+	5	master's (marketing)	construction worker	kindergarten assistant
Nina	F	30+	5	bachelor (geography and tourism) +	grounds maintenance	store employee (shift leader)
Kamil	M	30+	5	master's (political science)	oil platform employee	bus driver
Ewa	F	40+	2	master's (physiotherapy) +	personal assistant	personal assistant (sick leave)
Kuba	M	20+	6	bachelor (physiotherapy)	restaurant employee	restaurant employee
Maja	F	20+	3	bachelor (midwife)	restaurant employee	restaurant employee
Marta	F	30+	6	bachelor (pedagogics)	restaurant employee	restaurant employee
Ola	F	30+	5	master's (human resources)	restaurant employee	language teacher (self-employed)
Blanka	F	20+	5	bachelor (social psychology)	restaurant employee	restaurant employee
Kinga	F	20+	4	master's (law)	restaurant employee	restaurant employee
Filip	M	20+	2	master's (international relations)	restaurant employee	restaurant employee
Ada	F	30+	5	master's x2 (psychology, pedagogics)	school assistant	school assistant
Daniela	F	30+	6	master's (history with pedagogics)	school assistant	school assistant
Beata	F	30+	1	PhD (archeology)	school assistant	school assistant
Arek	M	30+	6	master's (management in hospitality)	security guard	restaurant employee

Table 2. Overview of study participants' characteristics

Note:
'Age' 20+ means aged between 20 and 29, 30+ between 30 and 39, etc.
'No' indicates time in years that the informant had spent in Norway.
'+' beside educational level indicates additional studies, which in Poland often means one or two years of study to deepen or widen the field of study. Although called 'postgraduate studies', they do not proffer any additional academic titles.

At the time of the interview, eight of the study participants lived in the Oslo area, eight in rural and urban areas of counties surrounding Oslo (Viken and Innlandet), seven in Bergen, five in Bodø, one in Stavanger, and one in Tromsø.

The sample included individuals who had moved to Norway alone and those who had migrated with their families. Of the 30 participants, 16 (8 females, 8 males) had moved on their own. Of these, seven had arranged jobs before leaving Poland or other countries; however, in most cases, these arranged jobs turned out to differ from what had been agreed prior to migration. Seven participants migrated with their families (4 females, 3 males), and another seven (6 females, 1 male) joined their partners who already lived in Norway.

Almost all (27) participants had entered the labour market in Poland or other countries prior to their migration to Norway. The majority (18) performed jobs corresponding to their field and level of education prior to migration to Norway. Of these, seven had been performing a certain job for more than 10 years, during which time their careers had progressed. Another six participants migrated immediately after or during their studies (of these, three had not yet entered the labour market). The remaining six participants had been performing other jobs than those for which they were qualified, gaining professional experience in one specific field.

Data processing

All of the interviews were recorded and transcribed in full. I began the analysis by listening to the interview recording while following the transcription. After listening to each interview, I made notes of my reflections regarding the interview content. At this stage, I analysed the interviews not only for what study participants said but particularly for how they constructed their narratives and how they communicated the information and accounts, which is typical for narrative analysis (Byrne 2018: 223, Bamberg 2012). Narrative analysis takes into account the circumstances, conditions, and purposes of accounts, and is therefore interested in the functions that the narrative serves in a certain situation (Gubrium et al. 2009: XVI). This part of the analysis, approaching each of the interviews as a whole, served me principally to grasp how participants navigated their narratives and which issues they paid special

attention to. It helped to extract and map the main topics for further investigation. At this stage, I also listed all of the crucial information about each of the participants, such as subsequent job positions in Norway, length of stay in Norway, and circumstances of migration, so that I could easily return to this information in any further step of the analysis.

In the subsequent step, I imported the transcription to NVivo (version 11) to code the interview content for qualitative data analysis. Codifying is used to arrange raw data in a systematic order, and to make units part of a system or classification (Saldaña 2016). The process of applying and reapplying thematic and interpretative codes allowed me to divide, reorganise, and link data in order to consolidate meaning (Saldaña 2016, Grbich 2013). Then, by conducting cross-case analysis, I explored the differences and similarities across the cases and searched for relationships between the emerged categories. At this stage of the analysis, I manually mapped models of relationships and developed possible explanations. I contrasted the different cases, cross-read them, and related my interpretations to all of them.

Interpretation of data involves the question of validity and reliability. Hammersley (1992: 57) defines validity as truth, understood as the extent to which accounts represent a social phenomenon. Qualitative research gives us the opportunity to revise or even abandon our initial assumptions by carefully following study participants' claims. To strengthen the validity and reliability of research accounts, Silverman (2013: 282, 298) urges 'comprehensive data treatment' which involves dealing with exceptions and contrary cases in our data, and entails counting on participants' own categories. In light of new evidence, I revised many of my initial assumptions. I endeavoured to critically question the data and my own ways of thinking. While preparing for this research, I assumed that this dissertation would mostly touch upon the topic of professional identity, and experiences tightly related to work and the everyday experience of working below one's qualifications. However, the analysis of study participants' narratives moved the focus to the topic of

nationality and national identity. To a significant extent, participants' stories shaped the focus of this study. This exemplifies the approach I took to this research and the analysis. I was open to whatever topics would emerge during the interviews and the categories that would evolve in the analysis. I not only left participants free space to shape their narratives, but I was also sensitive to their perspectives in the analysis. I adopted a flexible approach to data analysis (Castles 2012: 16), as reflected by my eagerness to change my earlier assumptions based on what participants said and how they constructed their stories. In the light of new information and discoveries, I approached the interview data as a resource in reflexive mastering and transforming the research (Charmaz 2006).

My positionality within the research

Conducting social research, and particularly qualitative research, requires reflexivity and critical self-scrutiny from the researcher. This involves asking oneself questions about one's own role in and impact on the subsequent steps of the research process. As researchers approach the research from a specific position, they affect the whole research process – from the questions asked, through the analysis conducted, to the research conclusions provided (Byrne 2018: 224). Thus, the role of the researcher is an integral component of the method (Fedyuk and Zentai 2018: 174), and has become an inherent element of the debate regarding research methodology. The impact of the researcher on the study, particularly in interview and participant observation, has been debated within and across different scholarly traditions such as feminist scholarship and migration studies (e.g. Zhao 2016, Haraway 1999, Carling et al. 2014). This debate stems from the assumption that the person of the researcher and his or her social characteristics will influence how the informants perceive them, and whether and to what extent they are willing to share their stories and trust them. Finally, it affects the data to be produced and analysed (Carling et al. 2014).

As the main topic of the interviews in this study revolved around downward professional mobility, which may be perceived (by the participants themselves) as a lack of professional success (and in the case of most participants this indeed appeared to be the case), I also considered my professional position as a potential factor in shaping participants' perception of me. At the time of conducting the research, I was employed by a Norwegian university, which might have been perceived as a successful migration trajectory. I wanted to prevent my interlocutors from perceiving their professional trajectories as less successful than mine. The circumstances were favourable as the character of being a doctoral student in Poland differs from that in Norway in many respects. In Poland, being a doctoral student rarely equates with being employed by the university as it does in Norway. While doctoral students in Poland can receive a scholarship, it is also common for them to perform other full-time jobs while using their free time and resources to work on their thesis. Thus, a person conducting doctoral research is often considered a student rather than a university employee. As appearing in the role of a student seemed to be a propitious and safe position, I decided not to focus on the character of my employment unless the study participants asked about it. Both the invitation and information to participate in the research included the information that I was conducting the research under the auspices of a Norwegian university, Nord university in Bodø; however, it was not necessary to explain the difference between being a doctoral student in Poland and Norway. Of course, I did not assume that study participants did not know that being a doctoral student in Norway usually means being employed by the university (in fact, at least two of the study participants were well acquainted with the character of an academic career in the Norwegian system), but I aimed not to focus either on this issue or on myself as a person. I wanted the interview to focus mostly on the participants' experiences and I therefore revealed only the minimum necessary information about myself. This strategy worked and although each of the interviews was preceded by several minutes of initial conversation, the study

participants did not ask much about me or my affiliation. There were only a few cases where, after the interview, the study participants, concluding that they had told me a great deal about themselves, asked about the research idea, or some basic questions about myself. In such cases, I answered all questions posed.

Within the debate on researcher positionality, particular attention has been given to the insider and outsider positions. Migration scholars have been occupied with the significance of socially meaningful features of a researcher, such as gender, nationality, or skin colour, which can potentially influence the interaction with the study participants (Carling et al. 2014, Dwyer et al. 2009, Ryan 2015). The intersection of these features embodied in both the person of the researcher and the participant shape the power dynamics within interview settings and data interpretation (Fedyuk and Zentai 2018). Sharing or not the socially significant features, roles, or experiences with the participants determines the still ongoing debate on being the outsider or insider within the research (Dwyer and Buckle 2009, Nowicka et al. 2015, Nowicka and Cieslik 2014, Carling et al. 2014, Ryan 2015). In migration studies, scholars have tended to assume their insiderness on the basis of their shared nationality with the study participants (or outsiderness in the case of having another nationality), but this has been criticised for its naivety (Amelina et al. 2012, Wimmer et al. 2003).

The insider-outsider positionality seems to have two separate aspects. One issue is what assumptions we have regarding our positionality in relation to the study participants; the second is how the participants position us. The latter will always remain in the sphere of conjecture. As to the first, I am in favour of taking the position of uncertainty proposed by Nowicka and Ryan, who argue that researchers should give up the idea of any assumed, a priori commonality with their research participants (Nowicka and Ryan 2015). In their view, abandoning a priori assumptions and embracing a sense of uncertainty in encounters with research participants is a fruitful strategy in enabling migration studies to move beyond methodological 'groupism' (Nowicka and Ryan 2015). When we do not presume any commonalities, we have a

space in which to establish trust and rapport with the research participants in the course of the interaction. Beginning an interview with few expectations regarding the research participant is a difficult challenge, but it also allows us to move beyond the ethnic, national, or gendered lens in migration studies (Nowicka and Ryan 2015). Moreover, defining oneself as an insider or outsider in the whole specific research is misleading as our positionality differs in each interview.

The oversimplified categorisation of insider-outsider has also omitted the multidimensional nature and dynamic character of the researcher's positionality. In my view, our positionality differs not only in our interactions with different individuals, but it can also change during the interaction with one and the same person. To illustrate the dynamics of insiderness and outsiderness, let me introduce two excerpts from the interview with one of this study's participants named Ela. In the following excerpt, she clearly implies my insiderness into the commonly known image of a female cleaner in Poland: 'You know how the cleaner is perceived in Poland. In these rag slippers, in a colourful apron and with some kind of headkerchief'. Based on my and Ela's Polish origin, she assumes that we share some knowledge or perception of how the Polish cleaner is usually dressed, most probably positioning me as an insider in this context. However, as the next excerpt shows, based on our age difference (I was in my late twenties at the time of the interview, while Ela was in her late forties), she positions me as an outsider relative to the experiences of her generation: 'My generation is a bit tragic, I will tell you, because we lived under communism and we had a chance to live under Polish capitalism (...) we are afraid of change, because we don't know what these changes will bring, we are afraid of the unknown, so we don't go for change (...) you young are different, you are braver. And it's cool'. In this context, Ela no longer defines me and her as 'us', but on the contrary, when making the comparison between the features of two generations, she positions me and her at the opposite poles of the 'we' – 'you' divide. As the two quotes

illustrate, the way in which interviewees position us can change (even manifoldly) over the course of the interview, depending on the issues discussed.

On numerous occasions, study participants knowingly used inclusive phrases when discussing cultural features that characterise Poles, such as 'we know what it is', or when discussing employees' rights in Poland, such as 'we know how it works in Poland, right?' (both examples from the interview with Maja). Basing on such examples and the narrative content, I conclude that my Polish origin often determined the study participants' perception of me as an insider and 'one of us' due to our shared national origin. However, I would argue that the positionalities within the interviews were multidimensional and dynamic or, as Ryan (2015) puts it, characterised by 'dynamic rhythms of multi-positionalities'. Ryan highlights the fallaciousness of treating the single identity as determining the interaction, and advocates for considering features like gender, age, or nationality as 'ingredients in a complex and active mix of identities' (Ryan 2015: 4).

The insider-outsider debate seems to omit the importance of the personal impact of researchers and their social skills. From my point of view, the interpersonal contact between two people determines the social interaction, and we should not overestimate the role of social features in shaping that interaction. Much of the debate over the position of the researcher seems to consistently underestimate the essence of empathy and interpersonal energy and focuses particularly on basic social categories. My view on the role of the researcher in interview-based research is in line with Ryan (2015), who emphasises the role of empathy in shaping the dynamics of the interview encounter, and with Charmaz (2006: 25-26), who sees the role of the interviewer as that of a sensitive listener and observer encouraging the interlocutor to respond. The attitude of an empathic listener is the one I tried to adopt in this study.

Reflections on knowledge production and generalisability of findings

I approach participants' narratives as situated in the interview situation and emerging from worlds that exist outside the interview situation. The interview gives us access to study participants' lived experiences, knowledge, opinions, and perspectives and allows us to explore and grasp their understandings of social phenomena. Rubin and Rubin (2012) define in-depth interviews as giving a researcher the ability to talk to those who have knowledge or experience of the problem of interest. Through the interviews, researchers explore in detail the experiences, motives, and opinions of others and attempt to understand the world from the perspectives of the interviewees (Rubin and Rubin 2012, Miller and Glassner 2016). The access we gain throughout the research is to the 'representations' of their experiences or 'accounts' of their views or opinions (Silverman 2006: 117, Byrne 2018: 220).

While the interview is itself a symbolic interaction, knowledge about the social world beyond this interaction can still be obtained (Yeo et al. 2014, Miller and Glassner 2016). Interviews reveal evidence of the nature of the phenomena under study, including the contexts and situations in which they emerge and insights into the cultural frames people use to make sense of their experiences and their social worlds (Miller and Glassner 2016: 51).

Although I perceive participants' knowledge about the social phenomena to come from outside the interview situation, and not to be created exclusively within the interview situation as some constructivists claim (Kvale 1996), I nevertheless hold a constructivist view on the study participant and researcher's coproduction of knowledge. In line with Fedyuk and Zentai (2018), I believe that interviews entail co-production of knowledge incorporating participants' perspectives and interpretation of social reality and the researchers' interpretations into the research outcomes. Methods like unstructured and semi-structured interviews particularly support such an approach as they give study participants the space they need to actively shape the

research inquiry, and provide the researcher with the opportunity to explore aspects not originally perceived as part of the inquiry (Fedyuk and Zentai 2018: 172).

The methodological approach we undertake affects the study's potentiality to generalise. As Guba et al. (1981) note, all human behaviour is situated in a context. Therefore, generalisations that intend to be context free should be treated with particular deliberation (Guba and Lincoln 1981: 62). This study employs the contextualist approach to social science methodology, as described by Mjøset (2009), where the research is problem driven; in this case, the problem being downward professional mobility among Poles working in Norway. The contextualist approach determines both the attitude towards the virtue of provided explanations and potential for generalisation on the basis thereof. The explanations provided by contextualist research are related to its relevant context, while statements regarding inherent structures are contextualised and depend on the research questions (Mjøset 2009: 49). Similarly, generalisation embraces the specific, relevant context. Theories can be established at a case level, but remain within the middle range, providing an explanation-based theory. The accumulation of knowledge occurs through these explanation-based theories and leads to what Mjøset calls the emergence of local research frontiers as 'even a single case analysis can contribute to growth of knowledge when it is developed with reference to knowledge already accumulated in one or more local research frontiers' (Mjøset 2009: 60-61).

Ethical issues

This study was submitted to the Norwegian Centre for Research Data (NSD) (for receipt, see appendix on page 190). I advanced the written information letter to all participants (appendix, page 186). In the information letter, I introduced the topic and purpose of the study, the ways in which the data would be processed, and information about voluntariness of participation and the possibility of withdrawing consent at any time without the need to state a reason. Prior to the interviews, I asked participants

whether the information included in the letter had been clear to them. Some asked questions regarding the anonymity or purpose of the study, and in such cases I explained the necessary issues until the study participants stated that everything was understandable to them. All participants provided their written or verbal consent to participate. The participants of face-to-face interviews gave written consent, while the participants of computer-assisted interviews gave verbal consent. To ensure anonymity, all participants' names have been changed.

Chapter summary

My intention to explore how Polish migrants perceive and explore their downward professional mobility after migration to Norway has guided my methodological decisions and choices. To discover the logic, meaning making, and dynamics behind migrants' professional trajectories, I chose to base my study on qualitative interviews. Due to the desire to grasp the patterns, relationships, variety, and similarities within the diversity, I included people of different socio-demographic backgrounds in the sample. I believe that this allowed me to cover the complexity of the phenomena under study.

This chapter also reflected on my positionality and understanding of knowledge production in this research. As I indicated, I tried to abandon possible assumptions and categorisations regarding study participants and instead to focus on an empathic attitude towards them. I think this resulted in abundant and diversified narratives and data for analysis. For example, in the analysis of interviews, I remained sensitive to study participants' accounts, understandings, and their own categories. In this way, our cooperation has resulted in the findings provided by this dissertation.

CHAPTER 5. SUMMARY OF ARTICLES AND FINDINGS IN REFERENCE TO THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS

This chapter presents the three articles and summarises the research findings collected in them. The findings are discussed in relation to the research sub-questions explored in each of the articles.

The first article is under review in the *Nordic Journal of Migration Studies*. The second is under review in the *Central and Eastern European Migration Review*. The third has been submitted to *European Journal of Cultural Studies.*

The three articles provide a multifaceted answer to the overall research question of the study. Article 1 demonstrates how participants' decisions to take low-skilled jobs are conditioned and how they perceive remaining in low-skilled employment. Article 2 explores Polish migrants' struggles in relation to working below their level of qualification. It analyses the burdens and mismatches related to downward professional mobility and migration. Article 3 embeds participants' experiences of cultural differences in the debate on immigrant niches and analyses the changes in attitudes towards interpersonal communication and performing work in the light of working in and beyond immigrant niches.

Each of the articles functions as an independent unit, but, together, they create a complex theoretical and empirical whole that answers the overall research question, uncovering the logic, meaning-making, and dynamics behind the downward professional mobility of Polish migrants working and living in Norway. The settlement and downward professional mobility that occur after arrival in Norway comprise a complex, multi-stage process. The three articles read as a whole provide a wide perspective on this process, with its causes, logic, and consequences. Thus, they reflect and outline the different stages and dimensions of this process. Analyses in each of the articles draw on cross-case analysis of all 30 in-depth interviews.

Article 1. Downward professional mobility among Poles working and living in Norway

Under review in the Nordic Journal of Migration Research

This first article explores the diverse trajectories of downward professional mobility as experienced by skilled Polish migrants living in Norway. The article deals with reasons for taking up low-skilled jobs at the initial stages of migration, and analyses how migrants interpret remaining in low-skilled employment. The article bridges habitus and field theory with the concept of hierarchies of desirability of national migrant groups. It also develops the notion of the national component of habitus. The following two paragraphs summarise the article's findings in relation to the two research questions posed in the article.

Why do skilled and highly skilled Poles take up low-skilled jobs in Norway? The majority of study participants seem to follow the stereotypical pattern of migration that intersects with taking up low-skilled employment. Article 1 shows that although participants migrate with the purpose of working, prior to migration they rarely undertake activities that would enable them to continue their professional careers upon arrival to Norway. For example, the vast majority did not learn Norwegian before migrating, knowledge of which is necessary to secure many of the job positions available on the Norwegian labour market. This article approaches how taking low-skilled jobs is not only an individual but also a collective social practice. To provide a possible explanation for the logic of this practice, I analysed Polish socio-political conditions in which participants' habitus has been shaped, and the positionality of Polish nationality within the transnational field of national hierarchies. I argue that migrants' habitus, and particularly its national component, drives migrants into specific job positions and sectors of the Norwegian labour market, which they perceive as available to migrating Poles. Their habitus recognises only a limited pool of possibilities and their perceptions of the inevitability of taking such jobs upon migration have been maintained by the social and media discourses which

disadvantageously position migrants from Eastern European countries, including Poland. In opposition to rational choice theory, where individuals choose the opportunities that most increase their profits, theory of practice allows us to understand less favourable choices, such as gravitating towards low-waged and low-skilled job positions. A few cases of migrants who do not fit into this rule, and who learned Norwegian prior to migration and applied exclusively for jobs corresponding to their qualifications, show that they are also directed into low-skilled positions by job search intermediaries. These findings shed light on both the agentic and structural factors involved in channelling migrants into low-skilled employment upon migration.

How do they explain remaining in low-skilled jobs? The study identifies three professional trajectories following the initial underemployment: (1) adaptation to the low-skilled job, (2) reskilling, (3) struggling to get work in one's profession. The first trajectory, adaptation to the low-skilled job, is related to ambivalent attitudes towards the discipline or value of migrants' own education. This finding corresponds to the research conducted by Nowicka (2014a) and Trevena (2011), who found that Polish migrants in the UK devaluated their skills acquired through education in Poland. Article 1 shows that participants falling into this trajectory tended to explain their professional situation as not that unfavourable when compared to their co-nationals in Norway, or admitted that it was too challenging to learn Norwegian to the extent that would allow them to improve their job positions. The second trajectory, reskilling, applies to participants who qualified for new professions to escape from low-skilled employment. The third trajectory, struggling to get work in one's profession, which was the most common among the sample, defines the situation in which migrants invest great and long-lasting efforts into improving their job positions, including acquisition of high language competences. The second and third trajectories (reskilling and struggling to get work in one's profession) apply to 5 and 15 participants, respectively. Altogether, 20 (out of 30) participants tended to explain their limited access to their desired job positions in terms of discrimination and racism

towards them. In their view, certain skilled job positions and sectors of the labour market are exclusively accessible for Norwegians. Their Polish origin, visible in the job-seeking process through their Polish names and surnames, works as a disadvantage and reduces their chances of being invited to job interviews. These findings link the experience of downward professional mobility intersected with migration with the subjective perceptions of being discriminated against and racialised.

Article 2. Habitus mismatch and suffering experienced by Polish migrants working below their qualifications in Norway

Under review in the Central and Eastern European Migration Review

The second article is concerned with the experiences of professional and social mobility, and the divergence between valued and stigmatised identities resulting in multiple habitus mismatches, ipso facto developing the notion of habitus mismatch. This article sheds light on the complexity of factors that underlie the difficulties and suffering associated with experiencing downward professional mobility after migration. By outlining the social dependence of suffering, it investigates the influence of downward professional mobility on migrants' wellbeing and vulnerability. The article explores three of the research sub-questions. The three following paragraphs summarise the answers provided.

How do Poles who work below their qualifications in Norway cope with their downward professional mobility? Regardless of whether migrants adapted to the low-skilled jobs, reskilled themselves, or strived to improve their job positions (the professional trajectories identified in article 1), they described struggles and burdens related to their downward professional mobility. In none of the cases was work below their level of qualification problem-free or easy to adapt to. Article 2 shows how migrants construct their narratives to highlight how they are different from what they perceive to be the stereotypical image of Poles in Norway. It also unveils that some migrants avoid identifying with the professions they perform(ed); for example,

instead of using the phrase 'I worked as a cleaner', they used less direct phrases such as 'I worked in cleaning'. This indicates not only their lack of identification with the performed profession, but also their rejection of the meanings they attribute to the person performing a given profession. The analysis also finds that migrants differently construct their social spaces in Poland and Norway. Social relations in Poland allow them to feel they are 'somebody' with many differentiated identities, whereas in Norway they often expressed the feeling of being 'nobody' or 'just a Pole'. Thus, their social relations and spaces in Poland allow them to recall the social status and social identities suppressed in the course of migration and underemployment.

What kinds of experiences do they describe? Participants' experiences are primarily marked by a sense of mismatch. Article 2 identifies and analyses three mismatches that occur between (1) class of origin and the post-migratory social environment, (2) valued national identity and the stigmatising meanings attached to it in the new field, and (3) professional identity shaped in the course of education and professional career and the status of the low-skilled job. Class mobility leads to the experience of 'double isolation': despite being surrounded by co-nationals with whom they work and live, the participants felt different and isolated from them. At the same time, the participants reported a sense of longing and nostalgia for the 'class of origin' they had left behind in Poland. Although study participants expressed a large attachment to their national identity, the meaning and stigma associated with Polishness led to a sense of discomfort. The divergence between the habitus and professional identity shaped in the course of education and the performance of a low-skilled job results in struggles in daily work performance.

How do underemployment and disappointed aspirations influence migrants' wellbeing? Downward professional mobility and disappointed aspirations negatively affect migrants' vulnerability and wellbeing in many ways. As wellbeing is considered the experience of good health, prosperity, and happiness, the research findings show

that all these aspects have been significantly challenged due to underemployment. The most commonly self-reported and self-diagnosed symptoms of impaired wellbeing were: permanent loss of self-esteem and self-confidence, feelings of depression, distress, a sense of shame and humiliation, and weight loss. The article addresses the issues mentioned as suffering and analyses them in combination with the experienced mismatches.

Although scholars have been interested in downward professional mobility among migrants for the past few decades, as discussed in the second chapter, little of this research has paid attention to the human experience of underemployment and its influence on migrants' wellbeing. Article 1 covers this under-researched area, unveiling the 'human face' of downward professional mobility.

Article 3. Downward professional mobility, cultural difference, and immigrant niches: dynamics of and changes to migrants' attitudes towards interpersonal communication and work performance

Submitted to European Journal of Cultural Studies

Article 3 analyses the meaning-making processes in encounters of cultural difference in work-related situations. The analysis focuses on two dimensions where cultural difference is encountered: (1) interpersonal communication and (2) work performance and attitudes. It looks at the workplaces as fields in Bourdieu's sense, allowing for scrutiny of how immigrants' habitus responds to the encountered field difference. The article shows that the vast majority of migrants begin their professional careers in Norway in immigrant niches; that is, workplaces where they have no or only sporadic contact with Norwegians. Moreover, only a few escape from immigrant niches in the course of their careers in Norway. The article argues that working in or beyond the immigrant niche has a crucial impact on migrants' adaptation capacities. The article proposes the notion of cultural distrust to address migrants' attitudes towards the host community members resulting from multiple

cultural misunderstandings. It also recognises moments of consciousness of habitus as accelerators of change, whereas habitus change as an element of cultural adaptation. The analyses in the article were guided by two of the research sub-questions, which are discussed in the two subsequent paragraphs along with the pertinent findings. By exploring the research questions, new insights into the immigrant niches in Norway are provided, recognising immigrants' perspectives. Moreover, the topic of cultural adaption is introduced into the discussion of immigrant niches.

How does working in and beyond immigrant niches influences Polish migrants' adaptation in Norway? Cultural adaptation in Norway is reliant on whether they obtain the opportunity to work outside of immigrant niches and whether their capital receives recognition in the new field. Generally, those migrants who had the opportunity to work with Norwegians showed a greater tendency to change their attitudes, perceptions, and behaviours. The encounter with cultural difference in everyday working life enables migrants to evaluate, understand, and eventually adapt to the observed differences. These encounters prompt migrants to reflect upon their own internalised perceptions and dispositions, triggering moments of consciousness of the habitus. These moments of consciousness are turning points for habitus change and adaptation. However, such changes are also conditioned by the (non)recognition of migrants' capital. Upon migration, Polish migrants have specific perceptions of what a 'good worker' and 'good work' constitute. The most common features described by them as desirable are: taking the initiative to perform tasks beyond one's duties, willingness to work additional hours, and supreme productivity. These perceptions impacted on how they perform their work in Norway. However, as the Polish and Norwegian organisational cultures differ in many respects, their work attitudes, although intended as positive, most often met with disapproval or rejection. These circumstances particularly conduced them to renegotiation and redefinition of their own capital and a change of work attitude to what the study

participants perceived as a more Norwegian way of working, most often characterised by a calm pace of work and focusing solely on the responsibilities assigned to them. Nevertheless, when migrants' capital in the form of their particular efficiency did receive recognition, they tended to preserve their work attitudes.

How do encounters of cultural difference influence Polish migrants' perceptions of interpersonal communication and their work attitudes? The article analyses study participants' reflections on their experiences with cultural differences. The job-seeking process is, for many, one of the few opportunities to directly interact with Norwegians. The course of these encounters has a significant impact on how migrants tend to perceive Norwegians in the long-term. At the initial stages of job seeking, study participants tended to interpret the job interviews as enthusiastic and promising, based on the verbal and non-verbal messages they received from recruiters and potential employers. However, the initial enthusiasm followed by a lack of expected response gave rise to suspicion and cultural distrust in migrants. They commonly characterised Norwegians as duplicitous and the atmosphere in interpersonal contact as insincere. Whether migrants changed these attitudes is highly dependent on whether they subsequently obtained the opportunity to work in a typically Norwegian working environment. As the study found, working among Norwegians fosters recognition of Norwegian cultural codes and subsequent adaptation to Norwegians' differing ways of communicating and performing work. Remaining in immigrant niches, on the other hand, hinders or completely prevents migrants from acquiring the cultural competence which would allow them to recognise these new meaning systems.

6. FINAL DISCUSSION AND CONCLUDING REMARKS

Through analysis of empirical data, I sought to answer the main research question: *How do Polish migrants perceive and respond to their downward professional mobility in the Norwegian labour market?* The previous chapter summarised the research findings, explicitly answering the research question asked in each of the articles. In this concluding chapter, I illuminate how these research findings broaden our knowledge and understanding of the phenomena. Hereby, I also delineate the main empirical and theoretical contributions of this dissertation and draw a final conclusion.

Empirical contributions: downward professional mobility among migrants

This thesis advances the literature in several ways. First, it highlights the importance of perceived stigmatisation and racialisation around the meaning of Polishness in the Norwegian context. In contrast to previous studies on downwardly mobile Poles working in the UK (Trevena 2011, 2013, Nowicka 2012, 2014a), this research identified the perceived stigmatisation and racialisation as important factors in migrants' understanding of their disadvantageous positions in the host labour market. As indicated in chapter two, intra-European Polish migration has been rather well researched; however, literature on their labour market participation has remained blind to the demographic and social diversity among Poles who migrate, and by studying groups limited by just a few socio-demographic features, many questions have remained answered. For example, a study focusing exclusively on young, single university graduates, most of whom had not entered the labour market before migration (Trevena 2013), ascertained that their motives for migrating could be attributed to the desire to learn the language, travel, and experience life in a multicultural city, while at the same time deprioritising the development of a professional career. The knowledge gap that remained was why migrants who value

their education, have long professional experience, and express the desire to continue their professional careers decide to take low-skilled jobs and then remain in such jobs for years. By drawing on a diversified sample, this dissertation has shown the variety of post-migratory professional trajectories, and filled this gap by exploring the perspectives of migrants who value and desire to continue their professional careers in specific professions after settlement. This, in turn, revealed how migrants' opportunities are constrained by power relations and processes conditioning the field of the Norwegian labour market. Whereas previous studies have noted the importance of demand in the (UK) host labour market for downward professional mobility among Polish migrants (Nowicka 2014a, 2012, Trevena 2013, 2011), this research has broadened the perspective by demonstrating that stigmatising and racialising processes are also at play in shaping migrants' experiences and perceptions on their professional situations. The disadvantageous positionality of Polishness and East Europeanness in the transnational field of national hierarchies and the stereotypical image of Poles taking low-skilled jobs upon migration impact Polish migrants' self-positioning in the Norwegian labour market and their professional decisions and choices. In effect, they channel themselves and are being channelled into specific sectors of the host labour market.

The second contribution of this study is to provide information on the emotional and personal dimensions of the experience of downward professional mobility intersected with migration. This exceedingly important issue, to which previous studies have not paid sufficient attention, proved to have meaning and impact on daily functioning, most commonly negatively affecting migrants' vulnerability and wellbeing. Thus, this study contributes to the literature by showing the human side of the experience of downward professional mobility, which is addressed particularly in article 2. At the same time, the postulate of this work is to more thoroughly consider the human side of experience in academic and political

discussions on the labour market participation of migrants, as these discussions themselves often tend to efface the human side of their subjects.

The study also contributes to the growing body of literature on ethnic segmentation of the Norwegian labour market and the emergence of immigrant niches (Friberg and Midtbøen 2019, 2017). These studies analysed how such niches emerge, providing valuable insights into the current processes shaping segmentation of the Norwegian labour market, but not much has been said about the everyday experiences of the social realities within these immigrant niches. As previous studies were mostly interested in employers' perspectives, this dissertation provides a supplementary picture of immigrant niches in Norway, by giving voice to those who have been under-researched in this regard. It provides a glimpse into the lived experiences within the immigrant niches and the implications for cultural adaptation which working in such workplaces brings.

Theoretical contributions: downward professional mobility and the transnational field of national hierarchies

This dissertation offers a framework for studying migrants' experiences in European labour markets. I have bridged Bourdieu's concepts of habitus and field with hierarchies of desirability of migrants, and othering, racialisation, and stigma to conceptualise the transnational field of national hierarchies. The concepts employed and developed in this study serve to analyse how migrants' professional decisions and work- as well as non-work-related experiences and perceptions are shaped and conditioned.

I have made theoretical contributions in each of the articles. Article 1 develops the notion of the national component of the habitus in order to move beyond the intuitive link between habitus and national identity and to bring attention to how the choices and actions of migrating individuals are influenced by the construction of and meanings attached to a particular nationality within a certain field. The national

component of habitus explains how people internalise meanings and positions within hierarchies ascribed to their nationality and, therefore, why certain national migrant groups choose certain job positions and sectors of the labour market.

Article 2 proposes the notion of habitus mismatch to conceptualise the conflict between valued and stigmatised identities resulting from subjective experiences of downward professional and social mobilities and incorporates the emotional aspect of the experience of downward professional mobility. Article 3 develops the concept of cultural distrust and recognises moments of consciousness of the habitus as turning points for cultural adaptation. It proposes understanding the habitus change as an element of the cultural adaptation process.

Conclusion

This thesis has provided new insights into the problem of downward professional mobility among migrants by paying attention to the human perspective of experience and perceptions of the phenomenon. This human dimension should be of particular concern in an attempt to improve the situation of migrants in European labour markets. The existence of immigrant niches leads to the rise and coexistence of collateral social spaces, where more desirable positions are reserved for specified national groups. Whereas some immigrants remain disadvantaged, this contradicts the politics and idea of equal right to participate in the open European labour markets.

The more that migrants who are able and willing to work in their professions encounter a barrier to accessing their desired job positions, the more human capital we lose. I recall the reflections that accompanied me many times during the interviews, in the course of which I recognised the study participants as intelligent people equipped with capital. The experiences they related about the work they did and the conditions in which they did it often made me think that these are social realities and spaces which are not widely known and seen in Norway. This impression

was particularly sharp when my imagination situated the human who was talking to me within the reality described by her or him. A human being, not 'East-European' (*NO: 'østeuropeer'*), not 'just a Pole', not a 'labour migrant'. 'How was it possible?' I was thinking, 'how were you able to survive this purgatory?' I had a great sense of injustice; injustice that such social realities exist parallel to the world I had encountered in Norway, and that anyone could find themselves in such conditions and situations. Would they ever agree to anything similar in Poland? I truly doubt it.

This study finds that nationalities bear meanings and these meanings position people in the fields of national hierarchies influencing their post-migratory, professional trajectories. In the introduction, I recalled the words of the study participant from my master's degree research, pointing to the obviousness of the fact that she, as a Pole, was working as a cleaner in Norway. This doctoral research allowed me to provide a complex explanation and picture of how such perceptions are conditioned and maintained. The study shows how people internalise and reproduce national hierarchies and how powerful the system of ethnic segmentation of the labour market is. At the same time, the study reveals and emphasises the human side of the experiences related to working below one's qualifications and in immigrant niches.

The findings of this study allowed me to rethink the meaning of two memories, which returned to me vividly during the concluding reflections on this study. I remembered a conversation with a Polish acquaintance of mine. Knowing that I am somehow connected with Norway, he started to complain about the unfavourable conditions of his work and job contract in Norway through a Polish company. I tried to impart to him that he could improve his work conditions and that he should not agree to the conditions he described. His reply resounds in my thoughts, 'but you know, I'm just a typical Pole in Norway'. He later asked me about the character of my job, and it seemed confusing for him to take in that I am employed by a Norwegian university. After a while he said, 'Ah, so you are like Norwegian'. The findings of this

research allowed me to interpret and understand what being a Pole, and being 'like Norwegian', meant in this exchange: if you perform more skilled work in the Norwegian working environment, you no longer fit into what being a Pole in Norway means; if you are 'a typical Pole', you do not even deserve to improve your work situation.

The second memory concerns a conversation my partner had during a job interview. After I moved to Bodø to carry out this project, we wanted him to move here too. During the interview, he was asked about his reasons for wanting to move to Bodø, so he explained that it was because of my job contract. The men interviewing him immediately asked, 'Is she a cleaner or a nurse here?'. Many people experience such categorisations on a daily basis and these categorisations have a real impact on their life situations, self-perceptions, and wellbeing as evidenced by this dissertation.

This study has provided a complex picture of the logic, meaning-making, and dynamics that underlie the downward professional mobility among Poles in Norway. The study was concerned with downward professional mobility, thus drawing on the accounts of those who had experienced downward mobility as the soundest way to widen knowledge about the phenomenon; however, we could elicit an even broader perspective by also embracing those who were not downwardly mobile after migration to Norway. Therefore, an interesting avenue for future research on the professional trajectories of migrants would be to investigate those with continuous and upward professional mobility, particularly among national migrant groups who are at a positional disadvantage. This would allow us to identify the conditions and factors facilitating more advantageous professional mobilities of migrants and for further scrutiny of constraints and strategies of overcoming them within the transnational field of national hierarchies.

REFERENCES

Alba R, and Foner N. (2014). Comparing Immigrant Integration in North America and Western Europe: How Much Do the Grand Narratives Tell Us? *International Migration Review, 48*(Supp.1), S263-S291. doi:10.1111/imre.12134

Alcántara C, Chen C-N, and Alegría M. (2014). Do Post-Migration Perceptions of Social Mobility Matter for Latino Immigrant Health? *Social Science & Medicine, 101*(1), 94-106. doi:10.7916/D8668D8J

Amelina A, and Faist T. (2012). De-naturalizing the national in research methodologies: key concepts of transnational studies in migration. *Ethnic and Racial Studies, 35*(10), 1707-1724. doi:10.1080/01419870.2012.659273

Amin A. (2002). Ethnicity and the multicultural city: living with diversity. *Environment & Planning, 34*(6), 959-980. doi:10.1068/a3537

Anderson B. (1991). *Imagined communities: reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism*. New York: Verso.

Antonsich M. (2018). Living in diversity: Going beyond the local/national divide. *Political Geography, 63*, 1-9. doi:10.1016/j.polgeo.2017.12.001

Ashforth BE, and Kreiner GE. (1999). 'How can you do it?': dirty work and the challenge of constructing a positive identity. *The Academy of Management Review, 24*(3), 413-434. doi:10.2307/259134

Balibar É. (1991). Is there a 'neo-racism'? In: É Balibar and I Wallerstein (eds.), *Race, nation, class: ambiguous identities*. London: Verso.

Bamberg M. (2012). Narrative practice and identity navigation. In: JA Holstein and JF Gubrium (eds.), *Varieties of narrative analysis* (pp. 99-124). Los Angeles: Sage.

Barbalet JM. (1992). A Macro Sociology of Emotion: Class Resentment. *Sociological Theory, 10*(2), 150-163. doi:10.2307/201956

Barbalet JM. (1998). *Emotion, Social Theory, and Social Structure: A Macrosociological Approach*: Cambridge University Press.

Barker M. (1982). *The new racism: conservatives and the ideology of the tribe*. Frederick: University Publications of America.

Barth F. (1998). *Ethnic groups and boundaries: the social organization of culture difference*. Prospect Heights: Waveland Press.

Barth F, Govers C, and Vermeulen H. (1994). *The anthropology of ethnicity: beyond "ethnic groups and boundaries"*. Amsterdam: Het Spinhuis.

Bauder H. (2003). "Brain abuse", or the devaluation of immigrant labour in Canada. *Antipode, 35*(4), 699-717.

Bauder H. (2005). Habitus, rules of the labour market and employment strategies of immigrants in Vancouver, Canada. *Social & Cultural Geography, 6*(1), 81-97. doi:10.1080/1464936052000335982

Bauder H. (2006a). Capital and distinction. In: *Labor movement: how migration regulates labor markets*. Cary: Oxford University Press.

Bauder H. (2006b). *Labor movement: how migration regulates labor markets*. Cary: Oxford University Press.

Bauder H. (2008). Citizenship as capital: the distinction of migrant labor. *Alternatives: Global, Local, Political, 33*(3), 315-333. doi:10.1177/030437540803300303

Beaverstock JV. (2011). Highly Skilled International Labour Migration and World Cities: Expatriates, Executives and Entrepreneurs. In: B Derudder, M Hoyler, P Taylor, and F Witlox (eds.), *International Handbook of Globalization and World Cities* (pp. 240-250). Cheltenham UK; Northhampton USA: Edward Elgar Publishing.

Bendixsen S. (2018). Differentiation of rights in the Norwegian welfare state: hierarchies of belonging and humanitarian exceptionalism. *Social Inclusion, 6*(3), 162-171. doi:10.17645/si.v6i3.1520

Benson M, and O'Reilly K. (2009). Migration and the search for a better way of life: a critical exploration of lifestyle migration. *The Sociological Review, 57*(4), 608-625. doi:10.1111/j.1467-954X.2009.01864.x

Benson M, and Osbaldiston N. (2014). *Understanding lifestyle migration: theoretical approaches to migration and the quest for a better way of life*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Berend TI. (1998). *Decades of crisis: Central and Eastern Europe before World War II*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Berg LM, and Nowicka M. (2019). *Studying Diversity, Migration and Urban Multiculture. Convivial Tools for Research and Practice*: UCL Press.

Bhutta C. (2012). Not by the book: Facebook as a sampling frame. *Sociological Methods and Research, 41*(1), 57. doi:10.1177/0049124112440795

Billet S. (2007). Exercising self through working life: learning, work and identity. In: A Brown, S Kirpal, and F Rauner (eds.), *Identities at work*. Dordrecht: Springer.

Bourdieu P. (1977). *Outline of a theory of practice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bourdieu P. (1984). *Distinction: a social critique of the judgement of taste*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press

Bourdieu P. (1987). What makes a social class? On the theoretical and practical existence of groups. *Berkeley Journal of Sociology, 32* 1-18.

Bourdieu P. (1988). *Homo academicus*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Bourdieu P. (1990). *The logic of practice*. Oxford: Polity Press.

Bourdieu P. (1991). *Language and symbolic power*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Bourdieu P. (1993). *Sociology in question*. London: Sage.

Bourdieu P. (1996). *The state nobility: elite schools in the field of power*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Bourdieu P. (1999). *The Weight of the World: Social Suffering in Contemporary Society*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Bourdieu P. (2000). *Pascalian Meditations*. Oxford: Polity Press.

Bourdieu P. (2005). Habitus. In: J Hillier, E Rooksby, and Habitus (eds.), *Habitus: a sense of place* (2nd ed., pp. 43-49). Aldershot: Ashgate.

Bourdieu P. (2007). *Sketch for a self-analysis*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Bourdieu P, and Passeron JC. (1990). *Reproduction in education, society and culture*. London: Sage.

Buchowski M. (2006). The specter of orientalism in Europe: from exotic other to stigmatized brother. *Anthropological Quarterly, 79*(3), 463-482. doi:10.1353/anq.2006.0032

Burke PJ, and Stets JE. (2009). *Identity theory*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Bye HH, Herrebrøden H, Hjetland GJ, Røyset GØ, and Westby LL. (2014). Stereotypes of Norwegian social groups. *Scandinavian Journal of Psychology, 55*(5), 469-476. doi:10.1111/sjop.12141

Bygnes S, and Erdal MB. (2017). Liquid migration, grounded lives: considerations about future mobility and settlement among Polish and Spanish migrants in Norway. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 43*(1), 102-118. doi:10.1080/1369183X.2016.1211004

Byrne B. (2018). Qualitative interviewing. In: C Seale (ed.), *Researching society and culture* (4th ed.). London: Sage.

Cappelen C, and Dahlberg S. (2018). The Law of Jante and generalized trust. *Acta Sociologica, 61*(4), 419-440. doi:10.1177/0001699317717319

Carling J. (2012). Collecting, analysing and presenting migration histories. In: C Vargas-Silva (ed.), *Handbook of research methods in migration*. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar.

Carling J, Erdal M, and Ezzati R. (2014). Beyond the insider–outsider divide in migration research. *Migration Studies, 2*(1), 36-54. doi:10.1093/migration/mnt022

Castles S. (2012). Understanding the relationship between methodology and methods. In: C Vargas-Silva (ed.), *Handbook of research methods in migration*. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar.

Castles S, de Haas H, and Miller MJ. (2013). *The age of migration: international population movements in the modern world* (5th ed.). London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Cederberg M. (2015). Embodied cultural capital and the study of ethnic inequalities. In: A D'Angelo, L Ryan, and U Erel (eds.), *Migrant capital: networks, identities and strategies* (1st ed.). London: Palgrave Macmillan

Cerna L. (2016). The Crisis as an Opportunity for Change? High-skilled Immigration Policies across Europe. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 42*(10), 1610-1630. doi:10.1080/1369183X.2016.1162355

Charmaz K. (2006). *Constructing grounded theory: a practical guide through qualitative analysis*. London: Sage.

Chen E, and Miller GE. (2013). Socioeconomic Status and Health: Mediating and Moderating Factors. *Annual Review of Clinical Psychology, 9*(1), 723-749. doi:10.1146/annurev-clinpsy-050212-185634

Clement J. (2020). Number of Facebook users worldwide 2008-2019. Retrieved from https://www.statista.com/statistics/264810/number-of-monthly-active-facebook-users-worldwide/. Date accessed 15.03.2020.

Costa C, and Murphy M. (2015). *Bourdieu, habitus and social research: the art of application*. London: Palgrave Macmillan

Cruwys T, Haslam SA, Dingle GA, Haslam C, and Jetten J. (2014). Depression and social identity: an integrative review. *Personality and Social Psychology Review, 18*(3), 215-238. doi:10.1177/1088868314523839

Davies N. (2007). *Europe East and West*. London: Pimlico.

Deeb S, and Bauder H. (2015). Breaking through the glass ceiling: intercultural communication and the career experiences of skilled immigrant managers. In:

A D'Angelo, L Ryan, and U Erel (eds.), *Migrant capital: networks, identities and strategies* (1st ed.). London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Denzin NK, and Lincoln YS. (2003). Introduction: the discipline and practice of qualitative research. In: NK Denzin and YS Lincoln (eds.), *Strategies of qualitative inquiry* (2nd ed., pp. 1-45). Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Djundeva M, and Ellwardt L. (2019). Social support networks and loneliness of Polish migrants in the Netherlands. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 1-20. doi:10.1080/1369183X.2019.1597691

Domański H. (1991). *Klasy społeczne, grupy zawodowe, organizacje gospodarcze: struktura społeczna w krajach rozwiniętego kapitalizmu*. Warsaw: PAN.

Drzewiecka J, Hoops J, and Thomas R. (2014). Rescaling the state and disciplining workers in discourses on EU Polish migration in UK newspapers. *Critical Studies in Media Communication, 31*(5), 1-16. doi:10.1080/15295036.2014.881517

Du Gay P, Evans J, and Redman P (eds.). (2000). *Identity: a reader*. London: Sage.

Duemmler K, and Caprani I. (2017). Identity strategies in light of a low-prestige occupation: the case of retail apprentices. *Journal of Education and Work, 30*(4), 339-352. doi:10.1080/13639080.2016.1221501

Duvander AZE. (2001). Do country-specific skills lead to improved labor market positions? An analysis of unemployment and labor market returns to education among immigrants in Sweden. *Work and Occupations, 28*(2), 210-233. doi:10.1177/0730888401028002005

Dwyer SC, and Buckle JL. (2009). The space between: on being an insider-outsider in qualitative research. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods, 8*(1), 54-63. doi:10.1177/160940690900800105

Dyrlid LM. (2017). *Transnasjonalisme mellom stolthet og stigma: polske migranters narrativer om arbeid, tilhørighet og posisjonering.* (Doctoral thesis). Norwegian University of Science and Technology, Trondheim.

Dzięglewski M. (2015). Polish graduates: migration and its media representations. *Polish Sociological Review, 2*(190), 171-189.

Egge-Hoveid K. (2017). Utdanning. In: S Vrålstad and KS Wiggen (eds.), *Levekår Blant Innvandrere i Norge 2016* (pp. 93-101). Oslo: SSB.

Elias N. (1994). *The civilizing process*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Elias N (ed.) (2013). *Studies on the Germans: power struggles and the development of habitus in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries*. Dublin: University College Dublin Press.

Ellingsworth H. (1988). A theory of adaptation in intercultural dyads. In: WB Gudykunst and YY Kim (eds.), *Theories in intercultural communication*. Newbury Park: Sage.

Engbersen G, Okólski M, Black R, and Panţîru C. (2010). Working out a way from East to West: EU enlargement and labour migration from Central and Eastern Europe. In: R Black, G Engbersen, M Okólski, and C Panţîru (eds.), *A continent moving West? EU enlargement and labour migration from Central and Eastern Europe* (pp. 7-22). Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.

Erdal M, and Lewicki A. (2016a). Moving citizens: citizenship practices among Polish migrants in Norway and the United Kingdom. *Social Identities, 22*(1), 112-128. doi:10.1080/13504630.2015.1110371

Erdal M, and Lewicki A. (2016b). Polish migration within Europe: mobility, transnationalism and integration. *Social Identities, 22*(1), 1-9. doi:10.1080/13504630.2015.1110351

Erdal M, and Oeppen C. (2013). Migrant balancing acts: understanding the interactions between integration and transnationalism. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 39*(6), 867-884. doi:10.1080/1369183X.2013.765647

Erdal M, and Pawlak M. (2018). Reproducing, transforming and contesting gender relations and identities through migration and transnational ties. *Gender, Place & Culture, 25*(6), 882-898. doi:10.1080/0966369X.2017.1372378

Erel U. (2010). Migrating cultural capital: Bourdieu in migration studies. *Sociology,* *44*(4), 642-660. doi:10.1177/0038038510369363

Erel U, and Ryan L. (2018). Migrant capitals: proposing a multi-level spatio-temporal analytical framework.

Essed P, and Trienekens S. (2008). 'Who wants to feel white?' Race, Dutch culture and contested identities. *Ethnic and Racial Studies, 31*(1), 52-72. doi:10.1080/01419870701538885

Esses VM, Dietz J, and Bhardwaj A. (2006). The role of prejudice in the discounting of immigrant skills. In: R Mahalingam (ed.), *Cultural Psychology of Immigrants* (pp. 113-130). Mahwah: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers.

Eurostat. (2017). Structure of earnings survey: monthly earnings. Retrieved from http://appsso.eurostat.ec.europa.eu/nui/submitViewTableAction.do. Date accessed 13.09.2018.

Fedyuk O, and Zentai V. (2018). The interview in migration studies: a step towards a dialogue and knowledge co-production? In: R Zapata-Barrero and E Yalaz (eds.), *Qualitative research in European migration studies* (pp. 171-188). Cham: Springer.

Friberg JH. (2010). Working conditions for Polish construction workers and domestic cleaners in Oslo: segmentation, inclusion and the role of policy. In: R Black, G Engbersen, M Okólski, and C Panţîru (eds.), *A continent moving West? EU enlargement and labour migration from Central and Eastern Europe* (pp. 23-50). Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.

Friberg JH. (2012). Culture at work: Polish migrants in the ethnic division of labour on Norwegian construction sites. *Ethnic and Racial Studies, 35*(11), 1914-1933. doi:10.1080/01419870.2011.605456

Friberg JH, and Eldring L. (2011). *Polonia i Oslo 2010: mobilitet, arbeid og levekår blant polakker i hovedstaden*. Oslo: Fafo.

Friberg JH, and Midtbøen AH. (2017). Ethnicity as skill: immigrant employment hierarchies in Norwegian low-wage labour markets. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 44*(9), 1463-1478. doi:10.1080/1369183X.2017.1388160

Friberg JH, and Midtbøen AH. (2019). The making of immigrant niches in an affluent welfare state. *International Migration Review, 53*(2), 322-345. doi:10.1177/0197918318765168

Friberg JH, and Tyldum G. (2007). *Polonia i Oslo: en studie av arbeids- og levekår blant polakker i hovedstadsområdet*.

Goffman E. (1968). *Stigma: notes on the management of spoiled identity*. Harmondsworth: Penguin.

Gopal K. (2000). Janteloven - modviljen mod forskellighed. *Tidskriftet antropologi, 42*, 23-43.

Goul Andersen J, and Jensen PH. (2002). Citizenship, changing labour markets and welfare policies: an introduction. In: *Changing labour markets, welfare policies and citizenship* (pp. 1-13). Bristol: Policy Press.

Goździak EM, and Pawlak M. (2016). Theorizing Polish migration across Europe: perspectives, concepts, and methodologies. *Sprawy Narodowościowe. Seria nowa, 48*(48), 106-127. doi:10.11649/sn.2016.007

Grbich C. (2013). *Qualitative data analysis: an introduction* (2nd ed.). London: Sage.

Grenfell M. (2008). Introduction to part II. In: M Grenfell (ed.), *Pierre Bourdieu: Key Concepts*. London: Taylor & Francis

Grzymała-Kazłowska A. (2005). From ethnic cooperation to in-group competition: undocumented Polish workers in Brussels. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 31*(4), 675-697. doi:10.1080/13691830500109787

Guba E, and Lincoln Y. (1981). *Effective evaluation: improving the usefulness of evaluation results through responsive and naturalistic approaches.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

Gubrium JF, and Holstein JA. (2009). Introduction. In: JF Gubrium and JA Holstein (eds.), *Analyzing narrative reality*. Los Angeles: Sage.

Guðjónsdóttir G. (2014). 'We blend in with the crowd but they don't': (in)visibility and Icelandic migrants in Norway. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research 4*(4), 176-183. doi:10.2478/njmr-2014-0026

Guðjónsdóttir G, and Loftsdóttir K. (2017). Being a desirable migrant: perception and racialisation of Icelandic migrants in Norway. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 43*(5), 791-808. doi:10.1080/1369183X.2016.1199268

Gullestad M. (2002). *Det norske sett med nye øyne: kritisk analyse av norsk innvandringsdebatt*. Oslo: Universitetsforlaget.

Gullestad M. (2004). Blind slaves of our prejudices: debating 'culture' and 'race' in Norway. *Ethnos, 69*(2), 177-203. doi:10.1080/0014184042000212858

Gullestad M. (2006). *Plausible prejudice: everyday experiences and social images of nation, culture and race*. Oslo: Universitetsforlaget.

GUS. (2017). Informacja o rozmiarach i kierunkach czasowej emigracji z Polski w latach 2004–2016. Retrieved from https://stat.gov.pl/obszary-tematyczne/ludnosc/migracje-zagraniczne-ludnosci/informacja-o-rozmiarach-i-kierunkach-emigracji-z-polski-w-latach-20042016,2,10.html. Date accessed 15.06.2019.

Hage G. (1998). *White nation: fantasies of white supremacy in a multicultural society*. Annandale: Pluto Press.

Hall S. (2000). Who needs 'identity'? In: P Du Gay, J Evans, and P Redman (eds.), *Identity: a reader*. London: Sage.

Hammersley M. (1992). *What's wrong with ethnography? Methodological explorations*. London: Routledge.

Haraway D. (1999). Situated knowledges. In: M Biagioli and P Galison (eds.), *The Science studies reader*. New York: Routledge.

Helsedirektoratet. (2019). Autorisasjon og lisens. Retrieved from
https://www.helsedirektoratet.no/tema/autorisasjon-og-
spesialistutdanning/autorisasjon-og-lisens

Hofstede G. (1980). *Culture's consequences: international differences in work-related
values* (Vol. 5). Beverly Hills: Sage.

Hofstede G, and Hofstede GJ. (2005). *Cultures and organizations: software of the
mind* (2nd ed., rev. and exp. ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill.

Hofstede G, and Minkov M. (2013). Values Survey Module 2013 Manual. Retrieved
from https://geerthofstede.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Manual-VSM-
2013.pdf

Huang CM, and Park D. (2013). Cultural influences on Facebook photographs.
International Journal of Psychology, 48(3), 334-343.
doi:10.1080/00207594.2011.649285

Hudson DL. (2015). All That Glitters is Not Gold: Social Mobility, Health and Mental
Health among African Americans. In: MS Sherraden and N Morrow-Howell
(eds.), *Financial Capability and Asset Holding in Later Life: a Life Course
Perspective* (pp. 27-45). Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press.

Ibarra H. (1999). Provisional selves: experimenting with image and identity in
professional adaptation. *Administrative Science Quarterly, 44*(4), 764-791.
doi:10.2307/2667055

Ingram N, Ciarán B, Abrahams J, and Thatcher J. (2016). *Bourdieu: the next
generation. The development of Bourdieu's intellectual heritage in
contemporary UK sociology*. London: Routledge.

Jenkins R. (2002). *Pierre Bourdieu*. London: Routledge.

Jenkins R. (2008). *Social Identity*. London: Routledge.

Jetten J, Haslam AH, Cruwys T, and Branscombe NR. (2017). Social identity, stigma,
and health. In: B Major, JF Dovidio, and BG Link (eds.), *The Oxford handbook*

of stigma, discrimination, and health (pp. 301-316). New York: Oxford University Press.

Keskinen S, and Andreassen R. (2017). Developing theoretical perspectives on racialisation and migration. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research, 7*(2), 64-69. doi:10.1515/njmr-2017-0018

Keskinen S, Tuori S, Irni S, and Mulinari D. (2009). *Complying with colonialism: gender, race and ethnicity in the Nordic region*. Farnham: Ashgate.

Kołbon I. (2016). Mobilność społeczna w kontekście mobilności przestrzennej: awans, marginalizacja i degradacja społeczna polskich Euroemigrantów. *Migration Studies–Review of Polish Diaspora, 159*(1), 177-198.

Korzeniewska L, and Erdal M. (2019). Deskilling unpacked: comparing Filipino and Polish migrant nurses' professional experiences in Norway. *Migration Studies*. doi:10.1093/migration/mnz053

Kosakowska-Berezecka N, Żadkowska M, Gjerstad B, Krys K, Kwiatkowska A, and Odden G. (2018). Changing country, changing gender roles: migration to Norway and the transformation of gender roles among Polish families. In: M Rosario de Guzman, J Brown, and C Pope Edwards (eds.), *Parenting from afar and the reconfiguration of family across distance*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Kotani M. (2017). Dynamic nature of boundaries of speech communities: learning and negotiating codes in intercultural communication. *Journal of Intercultural Communication Research, 46*(5), 463-477. doi:10.1080/17475759.2017.1373692

Kuipers G. (2013). The rise and decline of national habitus: Dutch cycling culture and the shaping of national similarity. *European Journal of Social Theory, 16*(1), 17-35. doi:10.1177/1368431012437482

Kuus M. (2004). Europe's eastern expansion and the reinscription of otherness in East-Central Europe. *Progress in Human Geography, 28*(4), 472-489. doi:10.1191/0309132504ph498oa

Kvale S. (1996). *Interviews: an introduction to qualitative research interviewing*. Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Lawler S. (2015). *Identity: sociological perspectives* (2nd ed.). London: Sage.

Lewis J. (2003). Design issues. In: J Ritchie and J Lewis (eds.), *Qualitative research practice: a guide for social science students and researchers* (pp. 47-76). London: Sage

Link BG, and Phelan J. (2014). Stigma Power. *Social Science & Medicine, 103*, 24-32.

Loftsdóttir K. (2017). Being 'the damned Foreigner': affective national sentiments and racialization of Lithuanians in Iceland. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research, 7*(2), 70-78. doi:10.1515/njmr-2017-0012

Loftsdóttir K, and Jensen L. (2012). *Whiteness and postcolonialism in the Nordic region: exceptionalism, migrant others and national identities*. Farnham: Ashgate.

Lucas J, Ho H, and Kerns K. (2017). Power, status, and stigma: their implications for health. In: B Major, JF Dovidio, and BG Link (eds.), *The Oxford handbook of stigma, discrimination, and health*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Lulle A, and King R. (2016). *Ageing, gender, and labour migration*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan

Magala S. (2005). *Cross-cultural competence*. London: Routledge.

Major B, Dovidio JF, and Link BG. (2017). *The Oxford Handbook of Stigma, Discrimination, and Health*.

Major B, Dovidio JF, Link BG, and Calabrese SK. (2017). Stigma and its implications for health: introduction and overview. In: B Major, JF Dovidio, and BG Link (eds.), *The Oxford handbook of stigma, discrimination, and health* (pp. 3-28). New York: Oxford University Press.

Man G. (2004). Gender, work and migration: deskilling Chinese immigrant women in Canada. *Women's Studies International Forum, 27*(2), 135-148. doi:10.1016/j.wsif.2004.06.004

Massey DS, Arango J, Hugo G, Kouaouci A, Pellegrino A, and Taylor JE. (1993). Theories of international migration: a review and appraisal. *Population and Development Review, 19*(3), 431.

McSweeney B. (2009). Dynamic Diversity: Variety and Variation Within Countries. *Organization Studies, 30*(9), 933-957. doi:10.1177/0170840609338983

Midtbøen A. (2015). Etnisk diskriminering i arbeidsmarkedet. *Tidsskrift for samfunnsforskning, 56*(1), 3-30.

Midtbøen A. (2019). Discrimination at Work: The Case of Norway. In: J Vassilopoulou, J Brabet, and V Showunmi (eds.), *Race Discrimination and Management of Ethnic Diversity and Migration at Work* (Vol. 6, pp. 153-173): Emerald Publishing Limited.

Miller J, and Glassner B. (2016). The 'inside' and the 'outside': finding realities in interviews. In: D Silverman (ed.), *Qualitative research* (4th ed.). Los Angeles: Sage.

Mjøset L. (2009). The contextualist approach to social science methodology. In: D Byrne and CC Ragin (eds.), *The SAGE handbook of case-based methods* (pp. 37-68). Los Angeles: Sage.

Mole J. (2003). *Mind your manners: managing business cultures in the new global Europe* (3rd ed.). London: Nicholas Brealey Publishing.

Morawska E. (2018). Qualitative migration research: viable goals, open-ended questions, and multidimensional answers. In: R Zapata-Barrero and E Yalaz (eds.), *Qualitative research in European migration studies* (pp. 113-131). Cham: Springer.

Moussaoui D, and Agoub M. (2011). Risk and protective factors in mental health among migrants. In: D Bhugra and S Gupta (eds.), *Migration and Mental Health* (pp. 99-106). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Mullin B-A, and Hogg MA. (1999). Motivations for group membership: the role of subjective importance and uncertainty reduction. *Basic and Applied Social Psychology, 21*(2), 91-102. doi:10.1207/S15324834BA210202

Neumann IB. (1999). *Uses of the other: "The East" in European identity formation*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Niedźwiedzki D. (2016). Tożsamość europejska, narodowa, regionalna i lokalna polskich migrantów w Europie. *Studia Migracyjne - Przegląd Polonijny, 159*(1), 113-126.

Niraula A, and Valentin K. (2019). Mobile brains and the question of 'deskilling'. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research, 9*(1), 19. doi:10.2478/njmr-2019-0008

Noble G. (2005). The discomfort of strangers: racism, incivility and ontological security in a relaxed and comfortable nation. *Journal of Intercultural Studies, 26*(1-2), 107-120. doi:10.1080/07256860500074128

NOKUT. (2019a). Godkjenning av utenlandsk fag- og yrkesopplæring. Retrieved from https://www.nokut.no/tjenester/godkjenning-av-utenlandsk-fag--og-yrkesopplaring/

NOKUT. (2019b). Godkjenning av utenlandsk høyere utdanning. Retrieved from https://www.nokut.no/tjenester/godkjenning-av-utenlandsk-hoyere-utdanning/

Nowicka M. (2012). Deskilling in migration in transnational perspective. The case of recent Polish migration to the UK. *COMCAD Working Papers, 112*. Retrieved from https://pub.uni-bielefeld.de/download/2535087/2675428

Nowicka M. (2013). Positioning strategies of Polish entrepreneurs in Germany: transnationalizing Bourdieu's notion of capital. *International Sociology, 28*(1), 29-47. doi:10.1177/0268580912468919

Nowicka M. (2014a). Migrating skills, skilled migrants and migration skills: the influence of contexts on the validation of migrants skills. *Migration Letters, 11*(2), 171-186. doi:10.33182/ml.v11i2.237

Nowicka M. (2014b). Successful earners and failing others: transnational orientation as biographical resource in the context of labor migration. *International Migration, 52*(1), 74-86. doi:10.1111/imig.12144

Nowicka M. (2015a). Bourdieu's theory of practice in the study of cultural encounters and transnational transfers in migration. *MMG Working Papers, 15-01*. Retrieved from https://pure.mpg.de/rest/items/item_2125470/component/file_2125468/content

Nowicka M. (2015b). Habitus: its transformation and transfer through cultural encounters in migration. In: C Costa and M Murphy (eds.), *Bourdieu, habitus and social research: the art of application*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Nowicka M. (2018a). Cultural precarity: migrants' positionalities in the light of current anti-immigrant populism in Europe. *Journal of Intercultural Studies, 39*(5), 527-542. doi:10.1080/07256868.2018.1508006

Nowicka M. (2018b). "I don't mean to sound racist but ... " Transforming racism in transnational Europe. *Ethnic and Racial Studies, 41*(5), 824-841. doi:10.1080/01419870.2017.1302093

Nowicka M, and Cieslik A. (2014). Beyond methodological nationalism in insider research with migrants. *Migration Studies, 2*(1), 1-15. doi:10.1093/migration/mnt024

Nowicka M, and Ryan L. (2015). Beyond insiders and outsiders in migration research: rejecting a priori commonalities. Introduction to the FQS thematic section on "Researcher, migrant, woman: methodological implications of multiple positionalities in migration studies". *Forum: Qualitative Social Research, 16*(2). doi:10.17169/fqs-16.2.2342

Nowicka M, and Vertovec S. (2014). Comparing convivialities: Dreams and realities of living-with-difference. *European Journal of Cultural Studies, 17*(4), 341-356. doi:10.1177/1367549413510414

OECD. (2017). *Getting skills right: skills for jobs indicators*. Paris: OECD Publishing.

OECD. (2018a). *International migration outlook 2018*. Paris: OECD Publishing.

OECD. (2018b). Skills for jobs mismatch - Europe OECD. Retrieved from https://stats.oecd.org/Index.aspx?DataSetCode=MISMATCH. Date accessed 03.09.2018.

Okólski M. (1994). Poland. In: S Ardittis (ed.), *The politics of East-West migration* (pp. 51-67). London: St. Martin's Press.

Parutis V. (2014). "Economic migrants" or "middling transnationals"? East European migrants' experiences of work in the UK. *International Migration, 52*(1), 36-55. doi:10.1111/j.1468-2435.2010.00677.x

Patton MQ. (1990). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods* (2nd ed.). Newbury Park: Sage.

Patzelt A. (2017). 'A Totally New World Has Been Opening up for Me' – Experiences of Older German Migrants Who Are Actively Involved in the German-Speaking Community in Ottawa, Canada. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 43*(2), 218-234. doi:10.1080/1369183X.2016.1238906

Pawlak M. (2018). *Zawstydzona tożsamość. Emocje, ideologie i władza w życiu polskich migrantów w Norwegii*. Kraków: Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Jagiellońskiego.

Piore MJ. (1979). *Birds of passage: migrant labor and industrial societies*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Povrzanović Frykman M, Guribye E, Hidle K, and Mozetič K. (2019). How does place matter to highly skilled migrants? Work/non-work experiences of international physicians in Norway and Sweden. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research, 9*(3). doi:10.2478/njmr-2019-0026

Prasad P, D'Abate C, and Prasad A. (2007). Organizational Challenges at the
Periphery: Career Issues for the Socially Marginalized. In: H Gunz and MA
Peiperl (eds.), *Handbook of career studies* (pp. 169-187). Los Angeles: Sage.

Przybyszewska A. (2015). *Doświadczenia emigracyjne Polaków w Norwegii. Badanie
jakościowe procesów adaptacyjnych do Skandynawskiej przestrzeni społeczno-
kulturowej [EN: The migration experiences of Poles in Norway. The qualitative
research on adaptation processes to the Scandinavian sociocultural space].*
(Master thesis). University of Gdańsk, Gdańsk.

Rath J. (2002). A quintessential immigrant niche? The non-case of immigrants in the
Dutch construction industry. *Entrepreneurship & Regional Development,
14*(4), 355-372. doi:10.1080/0898562022000013158

Reed-Danahay D. (2017). Bourdieu, social space, and the nation-state. Implications
for migration studies. *Sociologica, 2017*(2), 1-22.

Revold MK. (2017). Arbeid og arbeidsmiljø. In: S Vrålstad and KS Wiggen (eds.),
Levekår blant Innvandrere i Norge 2016 (pp. 102-119). Oslo: SSB.

Rich Madsen K, Trab Damsgaard M, Smith Jervelund S, Christensen U, Stevens
GGWJM, Walsh S, . . . Holstein BE. (2016). Loneliness, Immigration
Background and Self-Identified Ethnicity: a Nationally Representative Study of
Adolescents in Denmark. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 42*(12),
1977-1995. doi:10.1080/1369183X.2015.1137754

Riemsdijk M, Basford S, and Burnham A. (2016). Socio-Cultural Incorporation of
Skilled Migrants at Work: Employer and Migrant Perspectives. *International
Migration, 54*(3), 20-34. doi:10.1111/imig.12221

Rosholm M, Scott K, and Husted L. (2006). The times they are a-changin': declining
immigrant employment opportunities in Scandinavia. *International Migration
Review, 40*(2), 318-347. doi:10.1111/j.1747-7379.2006.00019.x

Rubin HJ, and Rubin IS. (2012). *Qualitative interviewing: the art of hearing data*.
Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Ryan L. (2015). 'Inside' and 'outside' of what or where? Researching migration through multi-positionalities. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research, 16*(2).

Rzepnikowska A. (2019). Racism and xenophobia experienced by Polish migrants in the UK before and after Brexit vote. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 45*(1), 61-77. doi:10.1080/1369183X.2018.1451308

Saldaña J. (2016). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers* (2nd ed.). Los Angeles: Sage.

Salmonsson L, and Mella O. (2013). Cultural demands on skilled immigrants, a devaluation of human capital. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research, 3*(1), 3-9. doi:10.2478/v10202-012-0008-6

Sandemose A. (1936). *A fugitive crosses his tracks*. New York: Knopf.

Sani F, Bowe M, Herrera M, Manna C, Cossa T, Miao X, and Zhou Y. (2007). Perceived collective continuity: seeing groups as entities that move through time. *European Journal of Social Psychology, 37*(6), 1118-1134. doi:10.1002/ejsp.430

Satzewich V. (1991). *Racism and the incorporation of foreign labour: farm labour migration to Canada since 1945*. London Routledge.

Schramm Nielsen J, Sivesind KH, and Lawrence P. (2004). *Management in Scandinavia: culture, context and change*. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar.

Schütz A. (1944). The stranger: an essay in social psychology. *American Journal of Sociology, 49*(6), 499-507. doi:10.1086/219472

Sert D. (2016). From skill translation to devaluation: the de-qualification of migrants in Turkey. *New Perspectives on Turkey, 54*(54), 97-117. doi:10.1017/npt.2016.9

Siar S. (2013). From highly skilled to low skilled: revisiting the deskilling of migrant labor. *PIDS Discussion Papers, 2013-30*. Retrieved from https://www.econstor.eu/handle/10419/126949

Silverman D. (2006). *Interpreting qualitative data* (3th ed.). Los Angeles: Sage.

Silverman D. (2013). *Doing qualitative research* (4th ed.). Los Angeles: Sage.

Simandan D. (2018). Rethinking the health consequences of social class and social mobility. *Social Science & Medicine, 200*, 258-261. doi:10.1016/j.socscimed.2017.11.037

Simpson R, Slutskaya N, Lewis P, and Höpfl H. (2012). Introducing Dirty Work, Concepts and Identities. In: R Simpson, N Slutskaya, P Lewis, and H Höpfl (eds.), *Dirty Work: Concepts and Identities* (pp. 1-18). Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan.

Skey M. (2013). Why do nations matter? The struggle for belonging and security in an uncertain world. *British Journal of Sociology, 64*(1), 81-98. doi:10.1111/1468-4446.12007

Slay HS, Smith DA, Khapova SN, and Arthur MB. (2011). Professional identity construction: using narrative to understand the negotiation of professional and stigmatized cultural identities. *Human Relations, 64*(1), 85-107. doi:10.1177/0018726710384290

Smith PB, Andersen JA, Ekelund B, Graversen G, and Ropo A. (2003). In search of Nordic management styles. *Scandinavian Journal of Management, 19*(4), 491-507. doi:10.1016/S0956-5221(03)00036-8

SSB. (2017). *Levekår blant innvandrere i Norge 2016*. SSB: report no. 2017/13. Oslo.

SSB. (2018, 15.06.2019). Innvandrere og norskfødte med innvandrerforeldre. Retrieved from https://www.ssb.no/befolkning/statistikker/innvbef

SSB. (2020). Innvandrere og norskfødte med innvandrerforeldre. Retrieved from https://www.ssb.no/statbank/table/05183/. Date accessed 15.03.2020.

Stahl G. (2015). Egalitarian habitus: narratives of reconstruction in discourses of aspiration and change. In: C Costa and M Murphy (eds.), *Bourdieu, habitus and social research: the art of application* (pp. 21-38). London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Stenning A. (2005a). Post-socialism and the changing geographies of the everyday in Poland. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers, 30*(1), 113-127. doi:10.1111/j.1475-5661.2005.00155.x

Stenning A. (2005b). Where is the Post-socialist Working Class?: Working-Class Lives in the Spaces of (Post-)Socialism. *Sociology, 39*(5), 983-999. doi:10.1177/0038038505058382

Suzuki S. (1997). Cultural Transmission in International Organizations Impact of Interpersonal Communication Patterns in Intergroup Contexts. *Human Communication Research, 24*(1), 147-180. doi:10.1111/j.1468-2958.1997.tb00590.x

Syed J. (2008). Employment prospects for skilled migrants: a relational perspective. *Human Resource Management Review, 18*(1), 28-45. doi:10.1016/j.hrmr.2007.12.001

Tajfel H. (1982). Social psychology of intergroup relations. *Annual Review of Psychology, 33*(1), 1-39. doi:10.1146/annurev.ps.33.020182.000245

Tajfel H, and Turner JC. (1986). The social identity theory of inter-group behavior. In: S Worchel and WG Austin (eds.), *Psychology of intergroup relations* (pp. 33-47). Chicago: Nelson-Hall.

Taylor B, and Śliwa M. (2011). Polish migration: moving beyond the Iron Curtain. *History Workshop Journal, 71*(1), 128-146. doi:10.2307/41306814

Thatcher J, and Halvorsrud K. (2016). Migrating habitus: a comparative case study of Polish and South African migrants in the UK. In: N Ingram, B Ciarán, J Abrahams, and J Thatcher (eds.), *Bourdieu: the next generation. The development of Bourdieu's intellectual heritage in contemporary UK sociology*. London: Routledge.

Thompson EN. (2000). Immigrant occupational skill outcomes and the role of region-specific human capital. Retrieved from

http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.465.3476&rep=rep1&type=pdf

Tilly C. (1990). Transplanted networks. In: V Yans-McLaughlin (ed.), *Immigration reconsidered: history, sociology, and politics*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Trevena P. (2011). A question of class? Polish graduates working in low-skilled jobs in London. *Studia Migracyjne: Przeglad Polonijny, 37*(1), 71-96.

Trevena P. (2013). Why do highly-skilled educated migrants go for low-skilled jobs? A case study of Polish graduates working in London. In: B Glorius, A Kuvik, and I Grabowska-Lusinska (eds.), *Mobility in transition - migration patterns after EU enlargement* (pp. 169-190). Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.

Udah H, and Singh P. (2019). Identity, othering and belonging: toward an understanding of difference and the experiences of African immigrants to Australia. *Social Identities, 25*(6), 843-859. doi:10.1080/13504630.2018.1564268

van Den Broek T, and Grundy E. (2017). Loneliness among Polish migrants in the Netherlands: the impact of presence and location of partners and offspring. *Demographic Research, 37*, 727-742. doi:10.4054/DemRes.2017.37.23

van Heuckelom K. (2013). Londoners and outlanders: Polish labour migration through the European lens. *The Slavonic and East European Review, 91*(2), 210-234. doi:10.5699/slaveasteurorev2.91.2.0210

van Riemsdijk M. (2010). Variegated privileges of whiteness: lived experiences of Polish nurses in Norway. *Social & Cultural Geography, 11*(2), 117-137. doi:10.1080/14649360903514376

van Riemsdijk M. (2013). Everyday geopolitics, the valuation of labour and the socio-political hierarchies of skill: Polish nurses in Norway. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 39*(3), 373-390. doi:10.1080/1369183X.2013.733859

van Tonder CL, and Soontiens W. (2014). Migrant Acculturation and the Workplace. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences, 143*, 1041-1047. doi:10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.07.550

Verdery K. (1996). Nationalism, postsocialism, and space in Eastern Europe. *Social Research, 63*(1), 77-95.

Vianello FA. (2014). Ukrainian migrant workers in Italy: coping with and reacting to downward mobility. *Central and Eastern European Migration Review, 3*(1), 85-98.

Wacquant L. (2013). Symbolic Power and Group-Making: On Pierre Bourdieu's Reframing of Class. *Journal of Classical Sociology, 13*(2), 274-291. doi:10.1177/1468795X12468737

Waldinger R. (1994). The making of an immigrant niche. *International Migration Review, 28*(1), 3. doi:10.2307/2547023

Weishaar HB. (2010). "You have to be flexible" - Coping among Polish migrant workers in Scotland. *Health and Place, 16*(5), 820-827. doi:10.1016/j.healthplace.2010.04.007

Weiss A. (2005). The transnationalization of social inequality: conceptualizing social positions on a world scale. *Current Sociology, 53*(4), 707-728. doi:10.1177/0011392105052722

White A. (2016). Polish migration to the UK compared with migration elsewhere in Europe: a review of the literature. *Social Identities, 22*(1), 10-25. doi:10.1080/13504630.2015.1110352

Whitehead M, Pennington A, Orton L, Nayak S, Petticrew M, Sowden A, and White M. (2016). How Could Differences in 'Control over Destiny' Lead to Socio-Economic Inequalities in Health? A Synthesis of Theories and Pathways in the Living Environment. *Health and Place, 39*, 51-61. doi:10.1016/j.healthplace.2016.02.002

Wimmer A, and Schiller NG. (2003). Methodological nationalism, the social sciences, and the study of migration: an essay in historical epistemology. *International Migration Review, 37*(3), 576-610. doi:10.1111/j.1747-7379.2003.tb00151.x

Wolanik Boström K, and Öhlander M. (2015). Renegotiating symbolic capital, status, and knowledge: Polish physicians in Sweden. In: H Cervinkova, M Buchowski, and ZK Uherek (eds.), *Rethinking ethnography in Central Europe*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Wolff L. (1994). *Inventing Eastern Europe: the map of civilization on the mind of the enlightenment*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Yeo A, Legard R, Keegan J, Ward K, Nicholls M, and Lewis J. (2014). In-depth interviews. In: J Ritchie, J Lewis, N McNaughton, and R Ormston (eds.), *Qualitative research practice: a guide for social science students and researchers*. London: Sage.

You Q, García-García D, Paluri M, Luo J, and Joo J. (2017). Cultural diffusion and trends in Facebook photographs. Retrieved from https://arxiv.org/abs/1705.08974

Young C, and Light D. (2001). Place, national identity and post-socialist transformations: an introduction. *Political Geography, 20*(8), 941-955. doi:10.1016/S0962-6298(01)00039-7

Żadkowska M, Kosakowska-Berezecka N, Szlendak T, and Besta T. (2020). When migrant men become more involved in household and childcare duties – the case of Polish migrants in Norway. *Journal of Family Studies*, 1-21. doi:10.1080/13229400.2020.1712222

Zhao Y. (2016). Exploring the interactive space of the 'outsider within': Practising feminist situated knowledge in studying transnational adoption. *European Journal of Women's Studies, 23*(2), 140-154. doi:10.1177/1350506814568361

Özden C. (2005). Educated migrants: is there brain drain? In: C Özden and MW Schiff (eds.), *International migration, remittances, and brain drain* (pp. 227-244). Washington: The World Bank and Palgrave Macmillan.

Özden C, and Schiff MW. (2005). *International migration, remittances, and brain drain*. Washington: The World Bank and Palgrave Macmillan.

ARTICLE 1.

DOWNWARD PROFESSIONAL MOBILITY
AMONG POLES WORKING AND LIVING IN NORWAY

Abstract

This article explores the diverse trajectories of downward professional mobility as experienced by skilled Polish migrants living in Norway. On the basis of 30 in-depth qualitative interviews with Poles who have worked below their level of competence after migrating to Norway, I outline (1) how they tend to channel themselves into low-skilled employment at the initial stages of migration as they commonly assume it is inevitable when migrating, and (2) how they interpret and respond to remaining in low-skilled jobs after settling in Norway, often explaining it as a result of racialising and discriminatory practices against them. By bridging concepts of habitus and field with hierarchies of desirability of national migrant groups, I propose a notion of a 'transnational field of national hierarchies'. I argue that the downward professional mobility is both an individual and collective social practice guided by what I call 'the national component of the habitus' and embedded in the transnational field, where different national identities are hierarchically positioned.

Keywords: skilled migration, downward professional mobility, Polishness, Norwegianness, power relations

Introduction

Guided by two research questions: (1) why do skilled and highly-skilled Poles take up low-skilled jobs in Norway; (2) how do they explain remaining in low-skilled jobs?, this article sheds light on downward professional mobility among Polish migrants living and working in Norway. The wide scale of downward professional mobility among this group has been recognised by some quantitative studies (Friberg and Eldring 2011, SSB 2017); however, less scholarly attention has been given to the experiences and

perceptions Polish migrants have towards working below their level of competence. This article recognises and analyses migrants' views on the problem, and thus provides new insights and understanding to the body of knowledge concerning migrants' participation and exclusion in the European labour markets.

Downward professional mobility affects migrants worldwide irrespective of their origin, educational background, profession or work experience more often than the non-migrant population, and this also applies to the Norwegian labour market (OECD 2018a: 88-99). Research conducted on Poles living in Oslo in 2010 revealed that Polish women (58%) tend to be employed in cleaning services and Polish men (84%)–in the construction industry, although a significant percentage of them had worked in other, diverse sectors of the labour market prior to migration (Friberg and Eldring 2011: 17, 37). A more recent study conducted in 2016 (SSB 2017) confirms that Poles are overrepresented in manual labour, particularly in the construction industry and cleaning services, and underrepresented in managerial and academic jobs when compared to the non-migrant population in Norway. It is noteworthy that the proportion of highly educated Polish women living in Norway does not differ significantly from the whole female population in Norway, whereas the proportion of highly educated male Polish migrants is 13 percentage points lower than among the host society members (Vrålstad & Wiggen 2017: 99). These significant findings, showing a large scale of downward professional mobility among Poles in Norway, are derived from numerous quantitative results provided by these studies, however, none of them aimed to explain or investigate this specific problem qualitatively.

Some qualitative studies on downwardly mobile Polish migrants have been conducted in the UK (Trevena 2011, Nowicka 2012) showing that generally, Poles devalued their education and qualifications from Poland. Both authors pointed to the popularisation of higher education and so-called devaluation of higher diplomas in Poland, resulting in a supersaturation of the Polish labour market with highly qualified individuals looking for work. Trevena (2011) argued that higher incomes in the UK

compensate for the low-skilled employment and the related losses. These studies, however, did not include migrants who value their education and professional experience. It is also crucial to note that Trevena's research drew on a sample comprised exclusively of young and single migrants, who in majority had not entered the labour market prior to migration (Trevena 2011). This article covers this gap by showing and analysing the diversity of downward professional trajectories. Moreover, it advances the literature by exploring the influence of the ascribed identities on the migrant's professional careers. As White (2016) notes, although Polish migration has been a rather well-researched migrant group (for an overview see: White 2016), a significant element of this research has explored the ethnic identity construction, while ascribed identities remained under-researched topic (White 2016: 14).

The Norwegian labour market is a specific context for the discussion of overqualification among migrants as it suffers, rather, from underqualification (OECD 2017: 93). Thus, the obvious waste of human capital in the form of migrants' skills is of particular importance. Working below one's level of competence, aside from being a loss at the macro-level, is also disadvantageous for individuals, who may suffer from psychological and social distress (Moussaoui and Agoub 2011: 102). Therefore, a broader perspective on the issue may contribute to developing practical implications for policies directed towards improving the wellbeing of the members of the largest migrant group in Norway.

In the following sections, first, I describe the research context, discussing the construction and positionality of Eastern and Western identities, power relations between them, and their impact on migrating Poles. Then, I outline the study's theoretical and analytical framework, which draws on concepts of habitus and field and hierarchies of desirability of migrants. The further section describes the study's method and sample. The subsequent analysis is divided into two principal parts. The first part focuses on the initial stage of migration: motives, decision-making processes and perceptions of migration, and thus addresses the question of what reasons skilled

migrants have for taking up low-skilled jobs. The second part investigates explanations and meanings the participants attach to remaining in low-skilled jobs. The last section provides the main conclusions.

Social constructions of Polish migrants

Poland has a long-standing tradition of intense emigration dating back more than two centuries (Okólski 1994: 51), and is therefore often considered as an exemplification of an emigration country in present-day Europe. Although migration research tends to distance the post-accession migration from the earlier migratory context, I see the necessity of historicising contemporary migrants by examining relevant discursive and socio-historical conditions, which have shaped the ways migrants from certain nation states are perceived and treated today (cf. van Riemsdijk 2013). Intra-European migratory movements from Poland have become embedded in the discourse of the European East-West dichotomy, i.e. a spatial term coined in the eighteenth and nineteenth century in the context of distinguishing different levels of industrial development between the two regions of Europe (Wolff 1994, Berend 1998). The image of Europe as composed of two blocs (Western and Eastern) was later perpetuated by socio-political discourses after Eastern European countries (including Poland) had been subjugated by the Soviet Union. The imagery of the Iron Curtain was a useful symbol of an ideologically divided Europe itself and functioned as a line demarcating the boundaries of 'otherness' between the Western and Eastern European identities (van Riemsdijk 2013, Young and Light 2001). The end of the Cold War in 1989 did not concurrently put an end to the influences it had on the mentalities and beliefs of people, and the mentalities changed slowest of all (Davies 2007: XIV). Eastern Europe has been perceived as ideologically distanced from an idealised West. Most recently, the processes of 'othering' the nations of Eastern Europe have been revived along with the process of EU and NATO enlargement by the discourse on an incompetent and immature East, in contrast to the directive and mature West (Kuus

2004). The constructions of otherness of Eastern Europeans based on discourses of their incomplete Europeanness (Buchowski 2006, Loftsdóttir 2017, van Riemsdijk 2013) has influenced the positionalities of migrating individuals. The nation states have generated and maintained the construction of opposing, but at the same time mutually constitutive, identities of the country's citizens–the insiders, and migrants– the Others (Bendixsen 2018: 163-164). Whereas Western European migrants are perceived as privileged 'free movers' and 'lifestyle migrants', Eastern Europeans are still perceived as 'target earners' (Lulle and King 2016).

Disadvantageously positioned in these discourses, Polish migrants have been moving in large numbers to Western European countries since the nineties. Post-socialist conditions are currently experienced in an indirect form, as imagined geographies of the Cold War have influenced the way migrants from Eastern Europe are treated and perceived nowadays (van Riemsdijk 2013: 378). In 2004, the number of Polish emigrants was estimated at one million worldwide (GUS 2017). While Poles have become an increasingly large national group in many countries in Europe (there are currently an estimated 2.5 million Poles living in other European countries), the widespread image of a Pole, more than any other European nationality, has been reduced to the most prototypical labour migrant and an object of discrimination both in Scandinavia (Guðjónsdóttir and Loftsdóttir 2017, Guðjónsdóttir 2014, Loftsdóttir 2017), and in other regions of Europe (van Riemsdijk 2010, van Heuckelom 2013). The stigma of 'otherness' of Polish migrants has been also identified by a wide range of research on media coverage (e.g. Drzewiecka et al. 2014, van Heuckelom 2013, Taylor et al. 2011). Van Heuckelom (2013) noticed that cinematic portrayals of Poles present them as intruders from the uncivilised outskirts of Europe and that these portrayals therefore bear the marks of orientalisation (van Heuckelom 2013: 218)–a discursive practice through which the West structures the imagined East socially and politically (Buchowski 2006: 463).

Calling the liberation of the Eastern Bloc countries 'a return to Europe' clearly illustrates that East and West have never been fixed locations but merely historically constructed geo-political and economic locations that marks a nation's positionality within Europe (Kuus 2004, Neumann 1999), where the terms 'West' and 'East' characterise economic distinctions rather than geographic ones. Therefore, despite of being a northern country in geographical terms, Norway, due to its strong economic position, is often considered to be a country of the Western world. Since the nineties, Norway has been an attractive destination country for migrating Poles; however, the major migration flow began after the accession of Poland to the UE in 2004 and has become particularly intense since 2006 (SSB 2018). Nowadays, in the Norwegian labour market, Polish migrants are associated with cheap and effective manual labour, eager to take the jobs that Norwegians no longer want to apply for. Norwegian employers perceive Poles as not suited for professional roles requiring independent decision-making and direct communication with customers (Friberg and Midtbøen 2017: 1472-1473).

Theoretical framework: positioning of migrants in the transnational field

My analytical framework bridges Bourdieu's conceptual dyad of habitus and field (Bourdieu 1990) with the recent conceptualisation of hierarchies of desirability of national migrant groups (Guðjónsdóttir and Loftsdóttir 2017, Loftsdóttir 2017, Guðjónsdóttir 2014). I draw a link between the positionality of national migrant groups with their professional decisions and choices upon migration. Through what I call 'the national component of the habitus', migrants perceive the accessible positions which have been ascribed to their nationality. By the national component of the habitus I address three elements (1) the dispositions of individuals socialised by them in the course of upbringing and education within a particular national culture, (2) national identity and the self-identification with the nation and co-nationals, and (3) construction of and meanings attached to particular nationality within a certain

field. Nationality understood both as citizenship and identity is incorporated into the habitus and strengthens the feeling of affiliation to an imagined community among co-nationals (cf. Anderson 1991). Individuals tend to gravitate towards positions in the fields that match dispositions ascribed to them (Bourdieu and Passeron 1990); therefore, I see the actions of the study participants as deeply influenced by the positionality assigned to the nationality they illusively represent. I approach the channelling into specific, low-skilled positions as individual and collective social practice guided by the national component of the habitus and conditioned by the transnational field of national hierarchies.

Fields are structured spaces of positions, determining power relations among the agents (Bourdieu 1993: 72-73). My analysis focuses on three intersecting and overlapping fields: (1) a transnational field of national hierarchies, (2) a field in which migrants' habitus and national identity have been shaped and (3) the Norwegian labour market. The second and the third fields are subfields of the first one. The dialectic between habitus and field allows for agency and choice, however, habitus recognises that choices are limited and shapes the vision of subjective expectations of objective probabilities. In opposition to rational choice theory, where individuals choose the opportunities that increase their profits the most, theory of practice allows the understanding of the less favourable choices, as for example gravitating towards low-waged and low-skilled job positions.

The theory of practice aims to investigate how relations between privilege, disadvantage, domination, and subordination are produced through the interplay between habitus and field. Habitus, being a set of internalised, structured and structuring dispositions: thoughts, perceptions, behaviours and beliefs (Bourdieu 1990: 52-65, 1993: 73), facilitates better understanding of how these dispositions are translated into practices when individuals operate within a specific field. As an aggregate of individual and collective trajectories, habitus shapes the vision of what is probable from a limited range of possibilities (Bourdieu 2000). Therefore, I propose

to understand the national identity as a component of habitus playing a key role in shaping migrants' choices and perceptions of themselves as 'Poles' in the Norwegian labour market.

Racialisation is a process which places migrants into hierarchies (Guðjónsdóttir and Loftsdóttir 2017, Loftsdóttir 2017, Guðjónsdóttir 2014). It is the process of categorising people on the basis of their alleged biological or cultural differences, reinforcement of these differences, and legitimisation of power relations on the basis thereof (Keskinen and Andreassen 2017: 65); Racialisation inscribed in the fields works twofold, it influences both how migrants of certain national groups are perceived and perceive themselves within the transnational fields as members (not) belonging to a specific national group.

The ongoing interplay between the structure of the transnational field and agency of the involved actors reproduces racialised identities, privileges and discrimination. Polishness and East Europeanness are underprivileged, stigmatised and racialised identities both in the transnational field (van Riemsdijk 2010, 2013) and in the Norwegian labour market (Friberg and Midtbøen 2017, Guðjónsdóttir and Loftsdóttir 2017, Guðjónsdóttir 2014), and, as I shall demonstrate in the final part of the analysis, the participants of this study showed great awareness of being racialised and discriminated against.

Method, data, and sample characteristics

The analysis draws upon data collected from 30 qualitative interviews conducted in Norway between September 2017 and February 2018 with Poles who have lived in Norway for at least a year and who have worked below their level of competence after migration. In order to comprehend the complexity of downward professional mobility among Polish migrants in Norway, I employed the strategy of maximum variation sampling, which is based on the logic of searching for significant, common patterns within the variation of cases (Patton 1990). I recruited 25 study participants

by publishing an invitation to participate in my study in four Facebook groups relevant to Poles living in Norway—*Poles in Norway, Poles in Oslo, Poles in Bergen,* and *Poles in Bodø*—at the time of publishing my invitation, numbering almost 50 thousands members in total. The other five participants were recruited by snowball sampling through my network of contacts. Among the 30 interviews, 19 interviews are face-to-face interviews conducted in Oslo, Bergen, and Bodø, while 11 were conducted online via video conversations with study participants living in different rural and urban localities in Norway. All of the interviews were recorded and transcribed. They varied in length from 50 minutes to 2 hours and 40 minutes. The average length of the interviews was 1 hour and 40 minutes. The interviews were conducted in Polish, the study participants' and my first language; therefore, the quotes presented in the article are translations of participants' statements into English. When conducting the interviews I was employed by the Norwegian university and I wanted to spare my interlocutors the possibility of perceiving their professional trajectories as less successful than mine. In Poland, being a doctoral student rarely equals being employed by the university, as is the case in Norway; thus, I did not explain this difference until they asked about the character of my job. I considered the role of student a safe position. Moreover, I wanted to focus as much as possible on participants' experiences and to reveal the minimum of information about myself. This strategy worked, as my participants provided me with rich data material, whereas they asked rather little about me.

The names of the study participants have been changed to preserve their anonymity. In order to make the participants' gender more visible through their names, I have chosen names ending with letters different than 'a' for the male participants, while all the names ending with 'a' are female ones.

I interviewed 18 females and 12 males, aged between 24 and 59 years. At the time of the interviews, the participants had been living in Norway from 1 year up to 15 years, 17 of them having lived in Norway for more than 5 years. All the participants

held various educational degrees from Poland: five—vocational or professional certificates, nine—bachelor's degrees, fifteen—master's degrees, and one doctorate. They had performed and been qualified to perform a variety of skilled and highly-skilled professions prior to migration including physiotherapist, military officer, bank advisor, midwife, and surveyor—to name but a few; however, after moving to Norway, 26 of them channelled themselves into one of the four labour market sectors: nine into cleaning services (seven females, two males), seven into gastronomy (five females, two males), seven into construction (one female, six males), and three (all female) into working as a kindergarten or school assistant. The remaining four persons took up jobs as a security guard, oil platform employee, personal assistant, and grounds maintenance worker.

Characteristics	Category	Number of participants
Age	24–39	25
	40–59	5
Gender	Female	18
	Male	12
Education	Vocational	5
	Bachelor	9
	Master	15
	Doctoral	1
Length of residence in Norway (years)	1–5	13
	≥ 5	17

Table 1. Characteristics of the sample (30)

Almost all (27) of the participants had entered the labour market in Poland or other countries prior to migrating to Norway. Three participants, who had not entered the labour market at all, migrated to Norway right after or during their studies. The other

three participants, who migrated right after graduation had been performing diverse jobs when studying. The professional careers of 18 of the participants prior to migration corresponded both to the field and level of their education: seven of them had been performing a specific job for more than ten years, and their careers had progressed. The remaining six study participants had been performing other jobs than those they had been qualified for.

The following section addresses the material collected from the migrants' narratives, with particular attention given to two aspects: decision-making processes and perceptions guiding their decisions to take up low-skilled work after moving to Norway, and interpretation of and respond to remaining in low-skilled jobs.

Channelling into low-skilled jobs

Although the participants expressed their desire to improve their professional and economic situation through migration and taking up employment in Norway, prior to migration, they had rarely taken actions that would enable them to develop—or at least continue—their professional careers in Norway. Norwegian language is a basic skill necessary to apply for most of the positions available in the Norwegian labour market. However, only two of the study participants had started learning Norwegian before moving to Norway. From the whole sample (30), 23 study participants revealed that they had assumed it would be necessary to take up low-skilled work in the initial stage of their stay in Norway. The most common plan among the participants was to find a low-skilled job in the initial stage of their migration, settle down, take a Norwegian language course, and only then get a proper job. Equally common was the assumption that getting a job in one's profession would take up to a year. Marlena described her plan in the following way:

> My idea for myself was just that I'll learn Norwegian and I'll be able to work normally, as it was in Poland, in an office in some company, to continue what I

had been doing. I had known, that I'd clean at the beginning, but I explained to myself that I need to have money for a language course.

The majority of the participants also admitted that prior to migration, they had had little knowledge about the Norwegian labour market and the qualification systems in Norway. For example, few of them had heard about the agencies that verify diplomas and qualifications from aboard, such as the Norwegian Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (NOKUT) and the Registration Authority for Health Personnel (SAK). While it is not necessary to formally recognise higher education diplomas from abroad in Norway, it may be of advantage when applying for jobs (NOKUT 2019b). In the case of vocational education, formal recognition corresponding to the Norwegian 'fagbrev' or 'svennebrev' (*EN: craft certificate*) is required in certain professions (NOKUT 2019a). Health personnel wishing to practise their profession in Norway have to be registered and hold a license or authorisation (Helsedirektoratet 2019). Most of the study participants learned about these issues only after arriving in Norway. When making their decisions about migrating, paradoxically, they rarely reflected on their further professional careers. Their decisions to move to Norway were often spontaneous and their emigration unplanned, although the majority of the study participants had been considering a long-term stay or permanent settlement. Kaja moved to Norway soon after she graduated as a surveyor. When I asked Kaja about what idea she had about her prospective career in Norway while making her decision to migrate, she answered: 'Now, I don't know exactly, perhaps I was not thinking about that too much. It was spontaneous.'. Lack of specific plans for professional career development in Norway was also common among those with stable professional positions and long-term work experience in Poland. As a result, the vast majority of the study participants made migration a point of intersection for their professional careers. Ada, having two master's degrees in two disciplines, psychology and pedagogics, and 10 years of professional experience, provides us with an insight into how prospective careers in Norway might be seen:

> Now, I think I was moving [to Norway] with such an idea, because I even remember such talks with my friends—me saying that I would take any kind of a job, anything, perhaps in a café… To earn and settle down in a way, to learn the language… I feel that I kept repeating, you know, such common opinions, and then when I came here, I didn't really want to work in a café.

The quotation demonstrates how common opinions and knowledge about the inevitability of taking up low-skilled jobs when migrating influenced Ada's perspectives on her career prospects in Norway. She reflected on these perceptions only after migrating when she imagined the fruition of what she previously 'kept repeating'. Similar opinion is again visible in Natalia's words: 'It is commonly known, that you arrive to Norway and you really start again from scratch'. When study participants reflected on the job positions potentially available to them, they constructed their perspectives through perceptions of jobs performed by Poles in Norway, as exemplified by Marlena's statement 'Simply said, a Pole can either clean or be a carpenter here, or, at best, work in a kindergarten. (…) There is no chance; there are little chances for it [getting a proper job]'. Marlena's response shows not only the importance of job positions typically ascribed to Poles, but also the strong self-identification with Polishness. When looking at professional possibilities in Norway, study participants ascribed greater significance to their Polishness than to their professional qualifications. Perceptions of positions accessible to migrating Poles influenced the decisions and actions the study participants have (or have not) made prior to and right after migration. To explain the commonness of these views and patterns of navigating professional careers onto downward trajectories, we have to analyse the conditions that might have shaped them. As previously discussed in the background section, the socio-political discourses have been maintaining positionality and meanings attached to migrating Eastern Europeans including Poles—'target earners' and 'manual workers'. According to Bourdieu (1990) what appears to us as likely becomes what we actively choose. National component of the habitus shaped the range of likely and necessarily limited opportunities available to Poles in the

transnational field of national hierarchies. On the contrary, the most improbable practices (in this case: continuity of the professional career when migrating) became excluded, as unthinkable (cf. Bourdieu 1990).

These perceptions are also transmitted through social networks and media. Nowadays, it is nearly impossible to find any Pole who does not have a family member, friend, or acquaintance living abroad; therefore, some images and perceptions of emigration are part of everyday knowledge among Poles. Migrating from Poland and taking low-skilled jobs has become such a common social practice that hardly any of the participants of this study seemed to reflect upon its reasonableness. As Bourdieu (1990) pointed out, practices tend to reproduce regularities, and this does not necessarily occur with the consciousness of social agents. The habitus being embodied history—firstly internalised as a second nature and afterwards forgotten as history—also becomes the past active in the present, shaping individual and collective practices (Bourdieu 1990: 56). The past still shapes views, convictions, practices, and decision-making processes related to emigration from Poland.

The picture of the Polish migrant has also been present in media discourses. Dzięglewski (2015) analysed 172 journalistic articles from Polish weekly magazines published in the period between 2004–2012. In the articles, he identified stories of 394 international migrants from Poland, and he found out that from the perspective of standardised classifications, the vast majority of these stories were concerned with downward professional and social mobility. However, in the subjective perceptions of the articles' protagonists, their stories were not necessarily presented as stories of failure (Dzięglewski 2015: 180-182). These views may result from perceiving migration from Poland itself as a kind of success, especially during the nineties and the first decade of the new millennium. Migration was imagined to be a step towards the more developed and wealthy West, and indicated economic and social advancement. Of

minor significance was the type of job performed by Poles in the West; it was a status that mattered.

The image of a Pole migrating to Norway, as well as to other European countries, to take up a low-skilled job has been naturalised and internalised by prospective migrants from Poland in the form of common knowledge. This image still determines positions ascribed to them and their own perspectives on and trajectories of professional careers when they migrate.

Being channelled into low-skilled employment

As I have illustrated up to this point, Poles tend to channel themselves into low-skilled jobs, guided by the stereotyped image of jobs typical for Polish migrants, and through positioning themselves as Polish migrants and workers. However, employment service institutions may also contribute to channelling Polish migrants into certain sectors of the labour market. To complement the picture, I will hereby introduce a significant minority of my overall sample: two cases in which the study participants had begun learning Norwegian prior to emigrating, therefore they were able to communicate in Norwegian after their arrival in Norway. Beata holds a doctoral degree in archaeology specialising in archival science. In Poland, she used to work as an academic assistant, and later, as an assistant professor for a total of over 10 years. Tomek is a certified welder with several years of professional experience in Netherlands. His welding certificates were recognised in Norway. Both Beata and Tomek had applied for jobs in Norway before migrating, however, their applications remained unanswered. After arriving in Norway, they contacted potential employers. Additionally, Tomek contacted several recruitment agencies, while Beata–NAV (Norwegian Labour and Welfare Administration), which also provides job seekers with employment services. Interestingly, although they had applied exclusively for jobs corresponding to their professions and work experience, job positions offered to them were far from the field of their expertise. The recruitment agency offered the

position of tiler to Tomek, and NAV advised Beata to apply for the position of cleaning lady in a hotel or shop assistant. The cases of Beata and Tomek show that recruitment agencies and public welfare agencies (NAV) may play a role in channelling Polish migrants into low-skilled employment in Norway, being guided by maintained gender stereotypes of Polish women working in cleaning services and Polish men working at construction sites. Tomek told how it happened that he ended up as a tiler despite the fact that he had applied for the position of welder:

> They came for me, it was a Polish recruitment agency, a Norwegian picked me up, and while traveling to the place of work it turned out that it was not about welding but about laying tiles, right? I said, 'listen, okay, but I haven't had anything to do with anything like that so far.'

Tomek also motivated his decision for accepting the unsought job offer: 'At that time, I started to struggle with kind of depressive feelings as I was applying for jobs for another day in a row and there was no response.'. Taking a job in Norway is a free decision; however, most of migrants put all their savings into moving to and settling in Norway, at the same time, leaving behind their lives in Poland or other countries and quitting their jobs before migration. Migration, in effect, is a one-way journey for them, and the extended period without an income increases their feeling of insecurity. Therefore, numerous migrants like Tomek, without many other options, decide to accept any job offer presented to him, which again contributes to maintaining the common perception of taking a low-skilled job as an inevitable part of migration. Beata expressed greater astonishment and indignation regarding the job positions offered to her by NAV. In her own words:

> Just one question bothers me, how many Norwegians holding PhDs work as cleaners? I'm not sure if it's so common here that someone does a PhD, and then s/he cleans a hotel.

Beata clearly links the types of job offers she received with her Polish nationality and the stereotypes of the jobs typically held by Poles in Norway. She also

states that the job offers presented to her would not be given to a person of Norwegian origin holding the same qualifications.

Remaining in low-skilled employment

The study participants assumed that they would perform low-skilled jobs only during the initial phase of their stay in Norway; however, in most cases this presumed 'temporary' situation lengthened into years. They remain in such jobs for extended periods of time, despite that the majority acquire knowledge of Norwegian, get their qualifications recognised by relevant institutions, and keep searching intensively for job positions corresponding to their professional qualifications. At the time of conducting the interviews for this study, only three participants worked in the professions they have been interested in from the very beginning; however, even in these cases, the time that had elapsed before they found such employment had been longer than they had expected.

Based on cross-case analysis, I identify three types of downward professional mobility trajectories the participants usually followed after their settlement in Norway: (1) adaption to a low-skilled job; (2) reskilling; (3) struggling to get work in one's profession. Below, I will expound these trajectories, respectively.

The first trajectory—adaption—relates to ten of the participants of this study, who, after spending some time in low-skilled jobs, found their work satisfactory—especially in terms of good wages and working conditions. Furthermore, some of them found learning Norwegian too challenging to achieve the level of language proficiency required to perform more skilled professions. The second trajectory—reskilling—was a trajectory relevant to five participants of the study. They decided to qualify themselves for other professions in order to quit low-skilled employment, including four who went on to establish their own businesses. The third trajectory—struggling to get work in one's profession—applies to fifteen participants who persistently struggled to get the desired job, and intensively applied for jobs

throughout months and years. Concurrently, they have consistently worked towards improving their language skills.

Among the 10 participants who followed the first trajectory and have adapted to performing low-skilled jobs, some expressed an ambivalent attitude towards the value of their education. This finding corresponds to the research conducted by Nowicka (2014a) and Trevena (2011) on Polish migrants in the UK, who found that the participants in their studies devaluated their skills acquired through education in Poland. The adaptive trajectory includes five participants who had worked in jobs different from the field of their education already before migration to Norway (six such cases in the whole sample), thus it might be concluded, as suggested by Nowicka (2014a), that they had devalued their education already before migration and, consequently, had developed a tendency to adopt to performing other jobs.

Although the participants following the 'adaption' trajectory unsuccessfully applied for jobs corresponding to their working experience from other countries, they seemed to accept other job positions in Norway more easily than the participants following the second and the third trajectory. They also tended to construct positive narratives on the work they perform, often by comparing themselves to other Poles, who, in their views, have to perform worse work. Nina—an employee in a grocery store at the time of the interview—reflected on this issue by asking herself a question: 'Do I feel degraded? Probably not as much as my [Polish] friends, who have to clean for example and who have higher education.'. The participants following the 'adaption' trajectory often do not perceive their professional position as degraded in contrast to those following the second and the third trajectory, what shows the relative character of the perception of success and failure (Nowicka 2014b).

The second trajectory—reskilling—was followed among others by Natalia, who holds a bachelor's degree in management studies. During her two-year employment as a cleaner, she decided to take a postgraduate course in cosmetology, which shhad

been always interested in. She travelled to Poland on weekends to participate in the course. In her own words:

> I've recently established my own business, a beauty salon, because I won't get a chance to work in management [in Norway]. So, I opened the doors to the future where I won't have to clean for the rest of my life.

Natalia assumed that gaining new skills and establishing her own beauty salon was an alternative to the only other possibility available to her—being employed as a cleaning lady. When I asked her why working in management would be beyond her reach, she explained that certain sectors of the labour market, including higher-level and managerial positions are reserved exclusively for Norwegians. She also added, 'There are certain workplaces where only Norwegian will be promoted.'. Similar opinions are echoed by Dawid, a surveyor working as a wall painter at construction sites:

> In Norway, there's a lack of highly educated people in general, professionals let's say. There's a lack of professionals. And they admit professionals from all over the world very willingly because someone has to perform work. Up to a certain point, this foreigner has opportunities for development, is provided with help, is treated well. However, when a foreigner starts to be higher in a hierarchy than a Norwegian, a problem arises.

The narratives of foreignness and national hierarchies touched on by Dawid were common among the participants who follow the second and the third trajectories (twenty participants altogether). Their stories depict the existence of an invisible, yet encountered barrier, a glass-ceiling excluding unprivileged nationalities from participation in the desired sectors of the Norwegian labour market. Lack of response from potential employers has led to frustration and distress. Prolonged periods of being stuck in low-skilled jobs and an intensive, yet ineffective job-seeking have strengthened their feelings of being discriminated against in the recruitment

processes and their perceptions of exclusion practices in certain sectors of the labour market. In Beata's words:

> No one responds to the applications I send, or even if they do respond, they simply say: 'No, just because.' And this includes archives, museums, and all the Norwegian research centres, which, in my opinion, block me just because I'm a Pole. If I was a Norwegian… Because I have master's degrees in history and in archaeology as well as a doctorate approved by Nokut, my education corresponds to the Norwegian system, but nevertheless, the situation is pretty hard.

Beata highlights that, in her understanding, it is not her qualifications that matter in the job-seeking process but her Polishness and non-Norwegianness blocking her access to the desired jobs. Racialisation include not only the personal quality of non-Norwegianness but also related attributes, like for instance, a lack of professional experience from Norway. Piotr's account indicates that professional experience from Poland is not valued equally to the experience from Norway: 'When I had been applying for jobs corresponding to my qualifications, and later I asked why I didn't get a job offer, they answered that I lack professional experience from Norway'. Some study participants like Marek explicitly expressed a feeling of discrimination and racism toward Poles and East Europeans:

> There is massive amount of racism towards Eastern Europeans. (…) I've been always telling and will keep telling to the faces of Norwegians, even if I were to go to Stortinget [the supreme legislature of Norway]: 'you're racists, and once again racists. You don't have tolerance for the Eastern Europe. You've just made Eastern Europe your cheap workforce.'

The quotation shows a great awareness of being racialised and the positionality and meanings ascribed to Eastern European migrants. Ela, another participant who established her own business in order to quit her job as a cleaning lady, referred to racism towards companies run by non-Norwegians:

> Now I have encountered this Norwegian racism. I mean, racism, maybe I said too strongly, but with this different treatment of companies run by foreigners and Norwegians. I will tell you, we are all equal before the law, but we are not equal in fact.

Study participants experience racialisation against their qualifications and businesses, which can be identified as Polish, East-European, and non-Norwegian. In this way, the Norwegian labour market becomes a field of struggle for those who are not equipped with the 'right' and desired capital, which can be defined as Norwegianness. This is something they permanently lack. Norwegianness equals a privileged position, whereas Eastern Europeanness and Polishness equal positions of marginality. Therefore, a Polish name and surname, being visible attributes of Polishness in the job application process, are perceived as reducing the likelihood of being invited to a job interview. As Piotr stated: 'Nationality has a meaning, and even a surname has a meaning', whereupon he recalled a story of a Polish friend of his, whose job applications had remained unanswered for a year until he changed his name and surname in his job applications to Norwegian ones.

Response to the downward professional mobility depends on the course of interaction between the habitus and field. In the case of those participants who 'adapted' to low-skilled jobs, the national component of habitus fitted into the field it entered. As the participants who followed this trajectory occupied and accepted positions typically ascribed to Poles in the Norwegian labour market, they have not had an opportunity to experience the struggles encountered by the participants persisting in their efforts towards improving their work positions. Habitus of those who followed the second and the third trajectory was subjected to more intensive and explicit interaction with the field. As a result, they dealt with the power relations and processes (exclusion and racialisation) working in the field. The national component of the habitus, which guided their actions channelling them into low-skilled employment at the initial stage of migration, through interaction with the field, exposed them to the experience of disadvantageousness of being a Pole, and

motivated their actions into improving their positions. The workings of the field, however, proved to be more impactful than the actions taken and the majority remained in the low-skilled jobs, where their habitus had originally guided them. Paraphrasing Bourdieu's words, practices, guided by the habitus, in a dialectic with a field reproduced regularity (Bourdieu 1990: 56-57).

Conclusions

The article explored Polish migrants' perceptions of downward professional mobility in Norway. It analysed decision-making processes, perceptions and interpretations related to migration and working below migrants' actual level of competence. It explained how socio-historical and media discourses have shaped the positionality of Western and Eastern European identities, and how these positionalities affect migrants' decisions and choices, guiding them towards jobs and sectors of the labour market which are typically ascribed to Poles. By identifying three alternative downward professional trajectories: adaption (10 participants), reskilling (5 participants), struggling to get work in one's profession (15 participants) the analysis captured the complexity of downward professional trajectories covering the gap in our knowledge about the diversity of these trajectories among migrating Poles and those migrants who value their education highly and struggle to improve their professional positions.

The proposed theoretical framework bridged the concepts of habitus and field (Bourdieu 1990, 1977) with hierarchies of desirability of national migrant groups (Guðjónsdóttir and Loftsdóttir 2017, Loftsdóttir 2017, Guðjónsdóttir 2014), offering a notion of an transnational field of national hierarchies. The article argued that this macro-field influences how migrants are positioned and how they position themselves when migrating. This occurs through the national component of the habitus. The article looked at the Norwegian labour market as a subfield of the transnational field of national hierarchies, however, it is possible for future research

to adapt this framework for other labour markets and contexts. The article brought the workings of racialising national hierarchies up for discussion, opening new paths for understanding the complexity of conditions that underlie the experience of downward professional mobility among migrants. The article advances the literature by covering the under-researched topic of the impact of meanings ascribed to Polishness (White 2016), and by showing how these ascribed meanings are involved in Polish migrants' understanding and interpretation of their prolonged low-skilled employment.

An interesting avenue for the future research on the professional trajectories of migrants would be to investigate what strategies develop those disadvantageously positioned migrants who continue or advance their professional careers upon migration. This would allow us to examine how the conditions of the constrictive field can be overcome.

References

Anderson, B 1991, *Imagined communities: Reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism*, Verso, New York.

Bendixsen, S 2018, 'Differentiation of rights in the Norwegian welfare state: Hierarchies of belonging and humanitarian exceptionalism', *Social Inclusion,* vol. 6, no. 3, pp. 162-171, DOI:10.17645/si.v6i3.1520.

Berend, TI 1998, *Decades of crisis: Central and Eastern Europe before World War II*, University of California Press, Berkeley.

Bourdieu, P 1977, *Outline of a theory of practice*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.

Bourdieu, P 1990, *The logic of practice*, Polity Press, Oxford.

Bourdieu, P 1993, *Sociology in question*, Sage, London.

Bourdieu, P 2000, *Pascalian meditations*, Polity Press, Oxford.

Bourdieu, P & Passeron, JC 1990, *Reproduction in education, society and culture*, Sage, London.

Buchowski, M 2006, 'The specter of orientalism in Europe: From exotic other to stigmatized brother', *Anthropological Quarterly,* vol. 79, no. 3, pp. 463-482, DOI:10.1353/anq.2006.0032.

Davies, N 2007, *Europe East and West*, Pimlico, London.

Drzewiecka, J, Hoops, J & Thomas, R 2014, 'Rescaling the state and disciplining workers in discourses on EU Polish migration in UK newspapers', *Critical Studies in Media Communication,* vol. 31, no. 5, pp. 1-16, DOI:10.1080/15295036.2014.881517.

Dzięglewski, M 2015, 'Polish graduates: Migration and its media representations', *Polish Sociological Review,* vol. 2, no. 190, pp. 171-189.

Friberg, JH & Eldring, L 2011, *Polonia i oslo 2010: Mobilitet, Arbeid og Levekår blant Polakker i Hovedstaden*, Fafo, Oslo.

Friberg, JH & Midtbøen, AH 2017, 'Ethnicity as skill: Immigrant employment hierarchies in Norwegian low-wage labour markets', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies,* vol. 44, no. 9, pp. 1463-1478, DOI:10.1080/1369183X.2017.1388160.

Guðjónsdóttir, G 2014, ''We blend in with the crowd but they don't': (In)visibility and Icelandic migrants in Norway', *Nordic Journal of Migration Research* vol. 4, no. 4, pp. 176-183, DOI:10.2478/njmr-2014-0026.

Guðjónsdóttir, G & Loftsdóttir, K 2017, 'Being a desirable migrant: Perception and racialisation of Icelandic migrants in Norway', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies,* vol. 43, no. 5, pp. 791-808, DOI:10.1080/1369183X.2016.1199268.

GUS 2017, *Informacja o rozmiarach i kierunkach czasowej emigracji z polski w latach 2004–2016*, Available from: <https://stat.gov.pl/obszary-tematyczne/ludnosc/migracje-zagraniczne-ludnosci/informacja-o-rozmiarach-

i-kierunkach-emigracji-z-polski-w-latach-20042016,2,10.html>. [Last accessed 15.06.2019].

Helsedirektoratet 2019, *Autorisasjon og lisens*, Available from: <https://www.helsedirektoratet.no/tema/autorisasjon-og-spesialistutdanning/autorisasjon-og-lisens>. [Last accessed 18.06.2019].

Keskinen, S & Andreassen, R 2017, 'Developing theoretical perspectives on racialisation and migration', *Nordic Journal of Migration Research,* vol. 7, no. 2, pp. 64-69, DOI:10.1515/njmr-2017-0018.

Kuus, M 2004, 'Europe's eastern expansion and the reinscription of otherness in East-Central Europe', *Progress in Human Geography,* vol. 28, no. 4, pp. 472-489, DOI:10.1191/0309132504ph498oa.

Loftsdóttir, K 2017, 'Being 'the damned foreigner': Affective national sentiments and racialization of Lithuanians in Iceland', *Nordic Journal of Migration Research,* vol. 7, no. 2, pp. 70-78, DOI:10.1515/njmr-2017-0012.

Lulle, A & King, R 2016, *Ageing, gender, and labour migration*, Palgrave Macmillan New York.

Moussaoui, D & Agoub, M 2011, 'Risk and protective factors in mental health among migrants' in *Migration and mental health,* eds D Bhugra & S Gupta, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, pp. 99-106.

Neumann, IB 1999, *Uses of the other: "The East" in European identity formation*, University of Minnesota Press, Minneapolis.

NOKUT 2019a, *Godkjenning av utenlandsk fag- og yrkesopplæring*, Available from: <https://www.nokut.no/tjenester/godkjenning-av-utenlandsk-fag--og-yrkesopplaring/>. [Last accessed 18.06.2019].

NOKUT 2019b, *Godkjenning av utenlandsk høyere utdanning*, Available from: <https://www.nokut.no/tjenester/godkjenning-av-utenlandsk-hoyere-utdanning/>. [Last accessed 18.06.2019].

Nowicka, M. 2012. Deskilling in migration in transnational perspective. The case of recent Polish migration to the UK. *Working Papers* [Online], 112. Available: https://pub.uni-bielefeld.de/download/2535087/2675428 [Accessed 15.03.2020].

Nowicka, M 2014a, 'Migrating skills, skilled migrants and migration skills: The influence of contexts on the validation of migrants skills', *Migration Letters,* vol. 11, no. 2, pp. 171-186, DOI:10.33182/ml.v11i2.237.

Nowicka, M 2014b, 'Successful earners and failing others: Transnational orientation as biographical resource in the context of labor migration', *International Migration,* vol. 52, no. 1, pp. 74-86, DOI:10.1111/imig.12144.

OECD 2017, *Getting skills right: Skills for jobs indicators*, OECD Publishing, Paris.

OECD 2018, *International migration outlook 2018*, OECD Publishing, Paris.

Okólski, M 1994, 'Poland' in *The politics of East-West migration,* ed S Ardittis, St. Martin's Press, London, pp. 51-67.

Patton, MQ 1990, *Qualitative evaluation and research methods*, Sage, Newbury Park.

SSB 2018, *Innvandrere og norskfødte med innvandrerforeldre*, Available from: <https://www.ssb.no/befolkning/statistikker/innvbef>. [Last accessed 01.06.2019].

Taylor, B & Śliwa, M 2011, 'Polish migration: Moving beyond the Iron Curtain', *History Workshop Journal,* vol. 71, no. 1, pp. 128-146, DOI:10.2307/41306814.

Trevena, P 2011, 'A question of class? Polish graduates working in low-skilled jobs in London', *Studia Migracyjne: Przeglad Polonijny,* vol. 37, no. 1, pp. 71-96.

van Heuckelom, K 2013, 'Londoners and outlanders: Polish labour migration through the European lens', *The Slavonic and East European Review,* vol. 91, no. 2, pp. 210-234, DOI:10.5699/slaveasteurorev2.91.2.0210.

van Riemsdijk, M 2010, 'Variegated privileges of whiteness: Lived experiences of Polish nurses in Norway', *Social & Cultural Geography,* vol. 11, no. 2, pp. 117-137, DOI:10.1080/14649360903514376.

van Riemsdijk, M 2013, 'Everyday geopolitics, the valuation of labour and the socio-political hierarchies of skill: Polish nurses in Norway', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies,* vol. 39, no. 3, pp. 373-390, DOI:10.1080/1369183X.2013.733859.

Vrålstad, S & Wiggen, KS 2017, *Levekår blant innvandrere i norge 2016*, SSB, Oslo.

White, A 2016, 'Polish migration to the UK compared with migration elsewhere in Europe: A review of the literature', *Social Identities: Polish Migration within Europe: Mobility, Transnationalism and Integration,* vol. 22, no. 1, pp. 10-25, DOI:10.1080/13504630.2015.1110352.

Wolff, L 1994, *Inventing Eastern Europe: The map of civilization on the mind of the enlightenment*, Stanford University Press, Stanford.

Young, C & Light, D 2001, 'Place, national identity and post-socialist transformations: An introduction', *Political Geography,* vol. 20, no. 8, pp. 941-955, DOI:10.1016/S0962-6298(01)00039-7.

ARTICLE 2.

HABITUS MISMATCH AND SUFFERING EXPERIENCED BY POLISH MIGRANTS WORKING BELOW THEIR QUALIFICATIONS IN NORWAY

Abstract

Recent research has reported that an increasing number of migrants in Norway are concentrated in the low-skilled sectors of the labour market irrespective of their educational backgrounds, thus facilitating the formation of migrant niches in the long term. Despite the growing body of literature that raises the problem of downward professional mobility and deskilling among migrant populations, little scholarly attention has been paid to migrants' struggles and vulnerabilities as a result of underemployment. Drawing on 30 in-depth interviews, this article explores the common experience of habitus mismatch and suffering among Poles who have worked below their level of competence or professional experience since migrating to Norway. By analysing subjective experiences of downward professional and social mobility, and the conflict between valued and stigmatised identities, the article examines various habitus mismatches that contribute to suffering in downwardly mobile Polish migrants.

Keywords: habitus mismatch, suffering, stigmatised identity, downward professional mobility, class mobility

Introduction

The successful integration of immigrants into host labour markets not only contributes to host countries' sustainable economic development but also to newcomers' wellbeing . Among integrative mechanisms, labour market integration is

considered one of the most important in the relationship between the individual (migrant) and society (Esses et al. 2006, Goul Andersen and Jensen 2002). In Norway, Polish migrants' high employment rates suggest effective labour market integration with 84 percent aged between 16 and 74 being employed compared to 80 percent of the overall population and 66 percent of the migrant groups who are in the same age range and were covered by the same study (Revold 2017). However, when considering labour market integration, attention should be paid not only to whether migrants are employed, but also to the types of jobs that they perform and whether these jobs are concomitant with their qualifications. Studies in economics and other social sciences, including migration studies, have revealed that migrants are more exposed to work below their qualifications than non-migrants both in Europe (including Norway) and worldwide (Beaverstock 2011, Cerna 2016, Duvander 2001, Nowicka 2014a, Salmonsson and Mella 2013, Siar 2013, Syed 2008, Thompson 2000, OECD 2018a). Poor labour market integration among migrants reflected in ethnically segmented labour markets leads to the wasting of human capital, causing psychological distress among migrants that negatively impacts integration efforts in other domains as well.

Although many insightful studies concerning downward professional mobility among migrants have been conducted in recent years (e.g. Beaverstock 2011, Cerna 2016, Duvander 2001, Man 2004, Nowicka 2014a, Sert 2016), little attention has been paid to the struggles migrants face when they work in jobs that are not only beneath their educational levels, but also fall short of fulfilling their post-migration aspirations, thus negatively impacting their wellbeing. UK studies on downward professional mobility and deskilling among Poles attempted to explain the causes of the phenomenon (Trevena 2013, Nowicka 2014a). Trevena (2013) analysed the macro-, meso-, and micro-level factors underlying downward professional mobility among Poles in the UK and ascertained that microlevel aspects, such as migration motives and intended length of stay, are crucial for understanding the reasons highly educated

Polish migrants take low-skilled jobs. She found that migrants who were eager to take low-skilled jobs immediately after migrating had a stronger tendency to seek occupational advancement in the UK as their time living abroad increased. Nowicka (2014a) attributed Polish migrants' acceptance of low-skilled jobs to their ambivalent attitudes towards the skills they gained through studies in Poland as not corresponding to the UK labour market's requirements.

The scope of this article moves the discussion towards experiences that are related to downward professional mobility. Thus, unlike previous studies, it does not aim to explain the reasons that underly the phenomenon itself, but rather seeks to answer the following questions: (1) How do Poles who work below their qualifications in Norway cope with their downward professional mobility?, (2) What kinds of experiences do they describe? (3) How do underemployment and disappointed aspirations influence migrants' wellbeing?

Drawing on 30 in-depth interviews with Poles who have worked below their qualifications in Norway, this article explores the suffering that is caused by downward professional mobility. It analyses study participants' experiences of (1) class mobility, (2) the discrepancy between their sense of national identification and the stigma that is attached to this identity, and (3) the divergence between their educational and professional identities given the low-skilled work that they perform in Norway. Hence, the article develops the concept of habitus mismatch, which covers study participants' experiences of multiple mismatches due to migration and downward professional mobility. The article forms part of broader doctoral research in which the exploration of migrants' suffering was not an aim; however, analysis of participant narratives could not ignore the essence and commonality of this problem.

This article addresses 2 calls that were identified in the literature. The first indicates the need for sociology to acknowledge recent psychological works that have reported strict links between social mobility and increased vulnerability (Alcántara et al. 2014, Major, Dovidio and Link 2017, Simandan 2018) to diseases such as

depression (Cruwys et al. 2014) and explore the link between the subjective experience of social mobility and wellbeing. The second call points to the need to explore the multidimensionality of the social processes that are involved in suffering. As some authors have suggested (Major, Dovidio, Link, et al. 2017), the studies that have been conducted in various social science disciplines have tended to focus on single mechanisms beyond the experience of suffering (health vulnerability, distress, or loneliness) such as migration (Djundeva and Ellwardt 2019, Patzelt 2017, Rich Madsen et al. 2016, van Den Broek and Grundy 2017), class mobility (Alcántara et al. 2014, Hudson 2015, Simandan 2018), or identification with a stigmatised group (Cruwys et al. 2014). This tendency has contributed to the omission of multi-facetedness and the mutual entanglement of the social processes that negatively affect people's wellbeing.

In the following sections, I will first draw the landscape of the Polish diaspora in Norway, focusing on the patterns that characterise Poles' participation in the Norwegian labour market. I will then introduce the theoretical concepts used in analysis, namely habitus, habitus mismatch, social identity (with a focus on national, professional identities and stigma), and class. I will then move on to explaining the study's methodology. In the section that follows that, I will present the results. The article concludes by considering the complexity of the dimensions that shape lived experiences of habitus mismatch in the context of downward professional mobility.

Poles in Norway: demography and labour market participation

Poles are the most numerous national immigrant group in Norway. At the beginning of 2019, the number of Poles residing in Norway was 112 000, representing 2.1 percent of Norway's over 5.3 million inhabitants (SSB 2018).

A series of studies conducted by Jon Horgen Friberg over the past decade provided valuable insights into Poles' participation patterns in the Norwegian labour market. Polish migrants have been subjected to social dumping and, in certain sectors,

have earned the lowest wages (Friberg 2010). Although the Norwegian government has introduced some policies aimed at protecting migrants from economic exploitation and the lowering of wages in certain industries (Friberg 2010), Polish migrants remain overrepresented in low-skilled jobs with the majority of Polish men working in construction and the majority of Polish women providing cleaning services (Friberg and Eldring 2011). Another study confirmed that Poles are overrepresented in handicraft jobs at 36 percent (compared to 9 percent of all the people who are employed in Norway) and cleaning services at 15 percent (compared to 2 percent of all the people who are employed in Norway) (Revold 2017). These numbers do not address gender differences in employment patterns, although participation in certain sectors of the labour market differs significantly between Polish males and females (Revold 2017, Friberg and Eldring 2011). Poles are also underrepresented in academic jobs in which 8 percent of Polish migrants are employed compared to 32 percent of all the people who are employed in Norway. With regard to managerial jobs, 2 percent of Poles hold such employment compared to 11 percent of all the people who are employed in Norway (Revold 2017). Given that the Norwegian labour market is nationally segmented, distinct migrant niches have emerged (Friberg and Midtbøen 2019, 2017). Norwegian employers perceive workers' professional dispositions through the prism of their nationality, and Poles do not particularly benefit from this since they are viewed as effective and hard-working manual labourers who are unsuitable for jobs that require representative tasks, customer service, or decision making. In employers' views, Eastern Europeans, including Poles (in contrast to Swedes), lack the predispositions and social skills that would enable them to perform well in such jobs (Friberg and Midtbøen 2019, 2017).

The proportion of Polish women in Norway who have a higher education degree (47 percent) does not differ significantly from the whole female population in Norway (45 percent). In fact, a higher proportion of Polish women in Norway have graduated from high school (45 percent) than in the female Norwegian population

(33 percent) (Egge-Hoveid 2017). However, the proportion of highly educated men is lower than the proportion of highly educated women both for the overall population in Norway and for Polish migrants in Norway. The percentage of men with higher education credentials in Norway is 33 percent compared to 20 percent of male Polish migrants. The proportion of male Polish migrants who have completed high school (66 percent) is higher than the proportion of males in the entire Norwegian population (43 percent) who have done the same (Egge-Hoveid 2017). Thus, despite high professional activity among Poles in Norway, and educational levels that do not differ from, and in some cases exceed, nationals', Poles are still concentrated in low-paid, low-skilled jobs.

Theoretical concepts

Habitus mismatch and suffering

In order to analyse study participants' experiences, I have employed Bourdieu's concept of habitus, which is a product of social conditioning that is reflected in individuals' dispositions (sets of perceptions, beliefs, and behaviours). Through constant interaction with social fields, habitus generates practices and transforms; however, its abilities to change are limited (Bourdieu 1977, 1990, 1999, 2000). Moreover, habitus is not necessarily coherent and has only a limited degree of integration; thus, individuals can occupy contradictory positions with various statuses (Bourdieu 2000). When the field changes, habitus does not automatically transform to suit its conditions. Such circumstances foster the occurrence of what I call habitus mismatch, which aims to develop Bourdieu's notion of 'cleft habitus' that he referenced based on his own life experience of upward social mobility. While the concept of habitus has been central to Bourdieu's overall conceptualisation, the notion of 'cleft habitus' only occasionally appeared in his work in relation to his dual experience given the prolonged divergence between his internationally recognised academic accomplishments and his low social origin. In Bourdieu's own assessment,

his habitus never fully matched the social fields he entered. He defined his dual experience and habitus transformation as leading from a 'coincidence of contraries' to a 'conciliation of contraries', and he credits this for his particular style of research and approach to social science (Bourdieu 2007: 100, 103). Interestingly, habitus and its transformations have been applied and analysed in numerous studies in various social science fields without noting that habitus mismatch often shapes individual experiences and underlies habitus transformation. Therefore, this notion warrants further consideration, use, and recognition in sociological analysis.

This analysis focuses on study participants' suffering. While emotion is simply a category, specific emotions are attached to the realities of actual experience. As Barbalet (1998: 2) pointed out, sociology does not need another general theory of emotion, but it would benefit from a deeper understanding of particular emotions, especially those that are central to social processes. Emotion can be regarded as an outcome or effect of social processes. As a social product, emotions fall within the purview of sociological examination and explanation (Barbalet 1998: 9). This article approaches suffering as existing in 2 dimensions in line with Barbalet's perception of emotions as existing not only as individuals' internal states but also in the relationships between individuals and their social situations (Barbalet 1992: 152). The suffering that is discussed in this article incorporates several emotions that negatively impact study participants' wellbeing. The manifestations of suffering that study participants reported the most often were stress, depression, grief, loss of self-esteem and self-confidence, feelings of isolation, weight loss, and in some cases, suicidal thoughts. It is beyond the scope of this article to diagnose participants' psychological conditions. Instead, suffering was approached as lived experience and understood as an outcome of multiple habitus mismatches that themselves resulted from downward professional mobility and migration.

Habitus mismatch analysis involved 3 specific mismatches: (1) social class mismatch, (2) the mismatch between national identification and the meaning and

stigma attached to this identity in certain social contexts, (3) the divergence between habitus (and professional identity) as shaped by education (and professional careers) and low-skilled work. A sense of class belonging, and national and professional identity are conceptualised as incorporated into an individual's habitus.

The article is interested in subjective experiences of downward class mobility. It draws on Bourdieu's understanding of class; he emphasised its relational and symbolic nature. Bourdieu understood social relations as functioning in 2 forms: the positions occupied by individuals in the field and socialised bodies. This relational approach facilitates overcoming the objectivist-subjectivist dichotomy (Wacquant 2013) and capturing subjective experiences of class and class mobility. According to Bourdieu, in order to distinguish between classes, one needs to start by analysing the properties that are embodied as class habitus, generating and unifying certain sets of practices and taking into account the symbolic dimension of group making. Recognising the lifestyle that characterises a given class reveals hidden symbolic spaces (Bourdieu 1984, 1987). Due to his remarkably layered approach to class, Bourdieu has avoided its unambiguous definition; however, he proposed to define classes, inter alia, 'by the structures of relations between all the pertinent properties which give its specific value to each of them and to the effects they exert on practices' (Bourdieu 1984: 106).

Like subjective experiences of class, identities condition and are conditioned by habitus. Although the concept of identity remains one of the most ambiguous in the social sciences, sociologists and social psychologists have agreed that identities are social constructs that are produced in relation to others and that our sense of who we are depends on our (non) belongingness to the groups or their imaginations (Jenkins 2008, Tajfel and Turner 1986). The collective process of identification occurs through interactions and is fundamentally based on constructions of similarity and difference (Jenkins 2008). Social actors construct their identities actively, and the resulting constructions determine their sense of the positions they occupy in the social space

(Bourdieu 1987, 1991: 234). As Jenkins (2008: 42) pointed out, identities are attributes of embodied individuals; but at the same time, they are collectively constituted, sometimes abstractly or symbolically. Identities are multiple, and they are produced in discursive and interactive struggles over meaning. Depending on the situation, different identities may activate (Jenkins 2008, Simpson et al. 2012).

This analysis pays particular attention to national and professional identities, which are strongly activated when people migrate to another country in order to find a new job. Both professions and nationalities position individuals in social fields albeit in different manners and depending on the context.

Professions differ in terms of prestige (Duemmler and Caprani 2017). They define individuals' positions in the social space (Ashforth and Kreiner 1999, Domański 1991) and they are important for identity construction (Duemmler and Caprani 2017). Professions not only dictate the activities people perform at work, they are also socially constructed and given meaning by those who perform them and by others, for instance, customers (Duemmler and Caprani 2017).

Like professions, nationalities determine individuals' positions in the social space. The hierarchical positionality of nationalities shapes migrants' levels of (un)desirability according to their national origin (Guðjónsdóttir 2014, Guðjónsdóttir and Loftsdóttir 2017, Loftsdóttir 2017), making it particularly difficult for some national migrant groups to derive positive effects from national identity. As research has demonstrated, social identification positively affects psychological condition and self-esteem by giving people a sense of belonging (Cruwys et al. 2014). Meanwhile, a lack of social identification leads to feelings of disconnection or dislocation from the surrounding world and identification with stigmatised groups negatively impacts health (Cruwys et al. 2014).

Stigmas marginalise individuals by reducing their identities to one-dimensional characteristics (Goffman 1968, Prasad et al. 2007), leading to group members' perceived homogeneity. Belonging to a stigmatised group renders it particularly

difficult to derive a positive identity from group membership (Jetten et al. 2017). Link and Phelan (2014), drawing on Bourdieu's concepts of symbolic power, argued that the power of stigma serves the interests of stigmatisers by aiding in their exploitation, control, or exclusion of stigmatised persons. Approaching stigma as an expression of symbolic power facilitates an understanding of how power relations determine the social positions of different migrant and non-migrant national groups, and whose interests are served by some of the particular distributions of symbolic power that are expressed through stigma.

Many studies have shown that Polishness is one of the most stigmatised national identities in the European context (e.g. Guðjónsdóttir 2014, Guðjónsdóttir and Loftsdóttir 2017, Pawlak 2018, van Riemsdijk 2010, 2013). Poles are associated with cheap manual labour (Dyrlid 2017, Friberg 2012, Friberg and Midtbøen 2019, 2017) that originates from the outskirts of Europe (van Heuckelom 2013), and they often experience racism, xenophobia, and discrimination in everyday life (Nowicka 2018a, Rzepnikowska 2019). In this article, I draw a link between national stigma and the lived experience of downward professional mobility.

Method and data

Analysis was based on 30 qualitative interviews with 18 females and 12 males of Polish origin aged between 24 and 59 who have been working below their qualifications since migrating to Norway. I defined 'qualifications' as the highest level of education achieved, professional experience gained, or professional certificates earned, enabling one to perform a certain job. The sample comprised Poles who, at the time of the interviews, had been living in Norway for at least 1 year. I recruited the study participants by publishing an invitation to participate in the study in relevant Facebook groups.

I conducted the interviews in the 5-month period between September 2017 and February 2018. Of the 30 interviews, 19 were face-to-face, taking place in Oslo,

Bergen, and Bodø, and 11 were conducted online via video conversations with study participants from various locations in Norway, including Tromsø, Stavanger, and Lillehammer, among others. The sample included 9 study participants in their 20s, 16 in their 30s, 4 in their 40s, and 1 who was over 50. The study participants have diverse educational and professional backgrounds with 5 holding a vocational degree or a professional certificate, 9 holding a bachelor's degree, 15 holding a master's degree, and 1 holding a doctoral degree. Almost all (27) entered the labour market in Poland or in other countries before migrating to Norway with 18 having performed jobs that corresponded to their educational levels and fields of study (e.g., 7 worked in their profession for more than 10 years before migrating), 3 having worked in jobs that were parallel to their studies, and 6 having performed jobs that did not correspond to their educational backgrounds. The study participants had been living in Norway for 1 to 15 years, including 17 participants who lived there for more than 5 years, indicating a rather long-term settlement pattern within the sample.

Characteristics	Category	Number of participants
Gender	Female	18
	Male	12
Age	24–39	25
	40–59	5
Education	Vocational	5
	Bachelor	9
	Master	15
	Doctoral	1
Length of residence in Norway (years)	1–5	13
	≥ 5	17

Table 1. Characteristics of the sample (N=30)

The average length of each interview was 1 hour and 40 minutes with durations varying from 50 minutes at the shortest to 2 hours and 40 minutes at the longest. The interviews were semi-structured. I had some questions and topics prepared; however,

I offered the interviewees a free space to share their experiences, thoughts, and perceptions. This approach resulted in rich and differentiated narratives, some of which were highly personal, emotional, and biographical in nature. The full-length interviews were then transcribed and analysed. Thematic coding enabled me to grasp the various manifestations of suffering that participants reported in relation to their downward professional mobility, and discern and analyse its links to other experiences. Given that all interviews were conducted in Polish, some interview excerpts that supported analysis were translated from Polish to English with care taken to preserve their original meanings.

Findings

Downward professional mobility and suffering

The interviews revealed the universality and gravity of the study participants' suffering. Many became emotional while discussing their experiences of downward professional mobility, and many described their mental condition as poor. The most commonly reported issues were feelings of depression, loss of self-esteem and self-confidence, weight loss, distress, a sense of shame and humiliation, and frustration. As the analysis proceeded, the link between post-migratory downward professional mobility and suffering proved to be more multidimensional than it initially appeared. The following sections aim to depict the processes, experiences, and performativities that are entangled in the social dimension of suffering. The following 3 excerpts introduce the problem of suffering as experienced by the study participants.

> I try not to think about the future, because when I do, I break down. I know that I won't stand working in the cleaning services for too long. Despite that, it's okay when it comes to wages. As far as my psychical condition is concerned, more and more often something besets me. Considerations. I won't stand

cleaning for a long time; maybe I'll be able to do it for one more year *(Iza, female, 3 years in Norway).*

I've reached such a stage now that my head is filled only with confusion. Because I've lost my self-confidence, I no longer know what I truly desire and what I'm able to achieve *(Piotr, male, 6 years in Norway).*

I know that if I hadn't made the decision to change my job at that point, I would have... Because during those 11 years [in Norway preceding the job change], I received antidepressant treatment twice because there were moments when I howled at the moon, moments when I was driving a car and I imagined what would have happened to me if I had driven right in front of that truck. And there were all these frustrations *(Ela, female, 13 years in Norway).*

The quotations uncover the psychological burdens that are related to low-skilled work. In Iza's case, these are the everyday struggles of performing an unsatisfying job. Meanwhile, Piotr experienced a loss of faith in his own abilities, and Ela described severe emotional suffering as a result of long-term low-skilled employment.

The following section discusses the different social processes that are involved in the experience of suffering due to downward professional mobility and migration. The results draw on a cross-case analysis of all 30 cases; however, for the sake of transparency and depth, I have focused this article on 3 cases that I consider the most representative in terms of showing the different aspects of habitus mismatch. Specifically, the case of Dawid highlights the subjective experience of downward class mobility and stigmatisation while Ewa's case is the most instructive for analysing the mismatch between national identification and the meaning that is attached to this identity. In addition, Dalia's case best represents the divergence between the professional identity that is shaped during education and the performance of work that does not correspond to this education. I will also use some quotations from other participants to support the main arguments.

Dawid: the subjective experience of downward class mobility and stigmatisation

Dawid, who is a male in his 20s, has a bachelor's degree in construction engineering. He moved to Norway to seek employment soon after graduation so that he could save money to put towards a car or a flat in Poland. At the time of the interview, Dawid had been working as a wall painter at a Polish company for 1.5 years. Before migrating, he had never considered working in his profession in Norway. As he explained, working as a wall painter in Norway enabled him to save more money than would have been possible if he had worked as a novice engineer in Poland. What has changed significantly since Dawid's migration is his attitude towards using his education to work in Norway. Although he was initially ready to work exclusively as a wall painter, he started learning Norwegian after spending some time in Norway, and after a year, he decided to start applying for construction engineer positions. When he discussed his work as a wall painter, Dawid guided his narrative towards his Polish, male co-workers. As is evident in the quotation below, he first referred to his pre-migratory acquaintances, subsequently contrasting them with his current colleagues.

> It is a nice feeling to recognise the value of the people I knew before, during my studies. I was surrounding myself with–I was aware of it [at that time], but now I appreciate it–really valuable, very intelligent people; it was possible to discuss anything with them. And now–construction workers, well, the boys' lives revolve around work. Work, what to eat, where to go fishing, what to drink, smoking, and work. And for me, it was, as I jumped into it from the outside, an overwhelming lifestyle. I was trying to organise my free time as well, to take a trip to the mountains or to sightsee in Oslo or something like that. They don't have this kind of attitude. They are, I don't know, so insular towards Norway, so hermetic.

Apart from drawing a contrast between his school acquaintances' characteristics and those of his co-workers in Norway, Dawid juxtaposed his own lifestyle and attitudes towards passing free time with those of his co-workers in Norway. According to Bourdieu, possession of a set of common properties is

embodied as class habitus and its capability of generating similar practices and lifestyles that characterise individuals who are placed in a certain social class (Bourdieu 1984: 101). Dawid's experience of downward class mobility, as expressed in the above quotation, recalls what Bourdieu calls a 'double isolation'; that is, isolation from both the current class and the 'class of origin'. The latter is typically accompanied by nostalgia for the group that was left behind (Bourdieu 1996: 107). Although he was surrounded by people, both at work and in his place of residence (Dawid shared a flat with some of his co-workers), the sense of mismatch was constantly making Dawid feel lonely, and he stated that, for him, 'The loneliness was the hardest difficulty'. In a study on undocumented Polish migrants in Brussels, Grzymała-Kazłowska (2005) found that migrant networks not only play a crucial role in getting a first job abroad, they also serve as fundamental emotional support for coping with a new life situation. The case of Dawid shows that the feeling of difference between his and his colleagues' habitus meant that he did not perceive them as people who could provide him with emotional support, making it even more difficult for Dawid to cope with the difficulties he was facing.

Dawid's narrative distinguishes between his and his co-workers' class habitus and perceives theirs as lacking the attitudes that feature in his. His class habitus results in an open attitude towards culture while his co-workers' attitudes are culturally hermetic. Dawid clearly distinguished himself as not belonging primarily to this class by defining his position in terms of 'jumping outside' into his co-workers' mode of life. In the following quote regarding his relationship with his boss, with whom he has developed a close friendship, Dawid guided his narrative away from the subjective experience of class mobility and towards his professional identity.

> I don't want to insult anyone, as it's being recorded, but fine, without giving any names, I don't know, I can talk to him about some things, like going fishing or... I don't know, I won't discuss the theory of relativity or evolution with him. You get it, right? That there is a gulf between us, like, ah... it's hard to talk about it. We are kind of different in terms of intellect. At a certain point, I also started to

reflect on myself and came to the conclusion that instead of broadening my horizons, fine, it's okay, I have a job, I earn money, but I'm taking a step backwards in terms of intellectual development. Because I've been losing a grip on the strictly engineering industry, I've been forgetting those things that I learnt at university, and I'm surrounded by people who are a little bit different than those with whom I used to spend time before I came here.

Dawid's narrative illustrates that it was the experience of feeling isolated from his own class that induced him to reflect on his professional development. Working below his qualifications began to seem problematic to him when it intersected with social degradation. Although he was initially eager to work as a wall painter, his subjective experience of downward social mobility and deskilling, which he called a 'step backwards in terms of intellectual development', resulted in such heavy losses that he could not continue working in low-skilled employment because, as he said, 'My self-esteem has suffered a lot throughout this year'. Consequently, at the time of the interview, he was motivated to secure a job as an engineer, and he was markedly hopeful that he would be successful in doing so.

The study participants often showed an awareness of being reduced to a one-dimensional identity, that is, being a Pole, which, in their perception, equates to being a low-skilled employee in Norway. One of the participants, Kinga, who holds a master's degree in law and works as a waitress, said, 'I rarely say anymore that I'm educated as a lawyer; I just say that I'm from Poland, and then everything becomes clear, like, "Okay. From Poland? So let's work in a hotel," right? It's so strongly considered Polish work.' Like Kinga, many participants indicated that low-skilled and low-prestige jobs in Norway are particularly ascribed to Poles, and thus being Polish has a specific meaning. The difficulty study participants face is that they do, in fact, work in low-skilled jobs that seem to match the stereotypical image; however, performing these jobs does not correspond with their aspirations or self-image. They instead identify with the professions for which they were educated and in which, in many cases, they also have professional experience. These perceptions of Poles as

particularly low-skilled manual workers impact Poles' interpersonal encounters and relations. In his interview, Dawid also pointed to the experience of stigmatisation. The following quotation shows that he experienced being reduced to a one-dimensional Polish identity in everyday encounters.

> I share housing with a Spanish guy, and a Norwegian female moved in a week ago; she asked where we come from. He replied, 'From Spain.' 'Oh, from Spain! Football, beaches, parties!' Her reaction was so positive. 'And where are you from?' 'From Poland.' 'Well, you build here, you work hard, you get the job done so thoroughly, you're hardworking.' And you can feel a distance.

Dawid emphasised the difference he sensed in his flatmate's reaction to his origin as opposed to his friend's, pointing to the distance he felt when he revealed his Polish nationality. He added that there were several occasions on which he met women at parties and suffered their withdrawal of interest upon being asked where he comes from and replying that he is Polish. It is understandable, then, that he has come to believe that revealing his nationality has explicit negative impacts on others' attitudes towards him.

Ewa: national identification and the meanings attached to nationality

Ewa, who is a female in her 40s, holds a master's degree in physiotherapy with a specialisation in neurology. During her career, she travelled worldwide to take professional courses in both physiotherapy and management of healthcare services. She has over 20 years of professional experience, including in physiotherapy and health centre establishment and management. Ewa is a self-described 'accompanying' migrant. She explained this by stating 'I moved here [to Norway] to accompany my husband'. She obtained her first job and arranged accommodation through her network of Polish contacts. Employed through a Norwegian agency, she became a personal assistant to a disabled girl in a Polish family. Her responsibilities included housekeeping, such as cleaning and laundering. Together with her husband, Ewa

moved into a basement apartment in a house that was owned by another Polish family who lived on the upper floors. Like Dawid, Ewa surrounded herself exclusively with co-nationals, both at work and at her place of residence. In this respect, Dawid's and Ewa's cases not only reflect the role migrant networks play in steering migratory movements in specific directions, they also demonstrate to what extent sharing a common nationality may affect migrants' choices and actions in the contexts of accommodation and job seeking which is an interdependence that is widely recognised by migration studies (e.g. Grzymała-Kazłowska 2005). Although, at the time of the interview, Ewa had been living in Norway for 1.5 years, the first post-migratory year left a clear mark on her life, as described in the following quotation:

> That year was one of the most difficult times in my life, I would say. Not only because of the work and the fact that I found myself in a totally different world, but also because of the conditions in the flat I was living in at first. (…) A lot of people were living there, different kinds of people, which is the other side of the coin.

Ewa clearly pointed to the 3 intersecting aspects that played a role in the difficulties she experienced after migration, namely work, 'moving into a different world', and living conditions, especially flatmates. In sociological terms, her difficulties were attributable to the intersection of downward professional mobility, migration, and the social environment she entered. Although a sense of commonness based on shared nationality initially guided her actions, over time, she acutely felt the difference between herself and the people around her, both at home and at work, which she described as follows:

> I witnessed such pathological situations I had never experienced before over the 40 years of my life. And it was difficult, the most difficult thing was not to coarsen, to stay classy. Do you know what I used to do just after arriving in Poland? My son would pick me up from the airport, and I used to tell him, 'Daniel, just don't forget to bring my high heels'. It didn't matter that I was in a tracksuit; I was just putting on my high heels right away at the airport because

to me, high heels are a symbol. Once, I had a teacher from Israel; she was a very wise woman, a doctor, and she always kept saying, 'Ewa, remember, the worse, the higher'. The worse the situation is, the higher the heels you should wear to feel better. (…) These high heels were so symbolic, it was like they were saying, 'hey, you! Listen, jump out of these gumboots, leave this straw behind, and come back to life!'.

Manifest in behaviour is an integral part of embodied habitus (Jenkins 2002: 75). Immediately after arriving in Poland, Ewa's habitus was 'back to its field' and in need of manifestation and embodiment. According to Bourdieu (1990), both a body and a language are stores of thoughts that are able to release themselves independently of time and space by 're-placing the body in an overall posture which recalls the associated thoughts and feelings, in one of the inductive states of the body which, as actors know, give rise to states of mind' (Bourdieu 1990: 69). By wearing high heels, Ewa repositioned her body in a posture that recalled the status, social position, and identity that had been suppressed due to her life events. This embodiment of habitus mismatch also draws a picture of how Ewa constructed her social spaces. Like many other study participants, she positioned herself differently in the social space in Poland as compared to in Norway. In their social fields in Poland, many participants felt a sense of 'being somebody' with many differentiated social identities and relationships whereas, after migrating, they became 'just a Pole' or simply 'nobody'. For instance, one participant stated 'I came to a foreign country, and I really became nobody here. And I clean the flats and clean the offices, and my profession was not about me cleaning up somewhere, right?'.

For Ewa, the content and meaning of Polish identity became uncomfortable. She related the symbolic dimension of the high heels she wore at the airport to this topic. As evidenced by the following excerpt, she referenced the stereotypical picture of a Pole in Norway.

Thus, these high-heels are the other side of these Poles. I mean "these"… I'm a Pole, too, but these Poles in Norway, a large percentage of Poles, who, I don't

want to name it, but we know what it is. On the whole, they give this nasty picture of a Pole abroad, not only in Norway, and I lived in it, and I saw it. I was close to it.

Interestingly, given her experiences, Ewa, in a way, justifies the stereotypical picture of Poles in Norway. Wearing high heels after arriving in Poland was an embodiment of Ewa's need to construct her identity as different from that of the Poles. The move to Norway, where being a Pole bears specific meaning, contributed to the experience of mismatch between sensed national identity and its meanings. As a result, study participants like Ewa tended to construct their narratives in order to differentiate themselves from other Poles. The content of social identities and the specific meanings of groups from their members' perspectives both powerfully impact psychological conditions (Cruwys et al. 2014). The following quote represents how Ewa talked about her suffering as a result of multiple habitus mismatches:

> During that time, it felt as if the real "me" was standing somewhere next to my body. I wasn't present there myself at that moment. I had to cut myself off from my own identity. I had to. (…) Between October and January, I lost 25 kilograms; now I've put on weight again, but I had lost 25 kilos. Due to the stress. (…) I think that in the time following that—January, February, March—I think that it was depression, severe depression. I was just coming back to this apartment and covering myself with a duvet and sleeping in order not to see it, not to hear, not to see or hear anything at all. I didn't eat; sometimes I didn't even feel like taking a bath. I was moving myself into a state of non-existence.

The habitus mismatches Ewa experienced led to suffering that was so severe, it prevented her from functioning as usual in her everyday life. Vianello (2014) found that highly educated Ukrainian women who work as domestic help and caregivers in Italian households struggled the most when their employers (the family members living in the households) were poorly educated. However, the higher employer educational levels were, the better self-evaluation these women expressed. Ewa was a caregiver to a disabled girl in a Polish family that she described as pathological and primitive. The girl's parents had lower educational levels than Ewa, but Ewa was their

146

subordinate. This relation strengthened Ewa's experience of habitus mismatch. The subjective experience of social class mediates differentiated outcomes for the mental and physical health of upper- versus lower-class individuals. The lower-class individuals are at a higher risk of chronic psychological stress because they are less able to control their environments and therefore experience uncertainty, helplessness, and a lack of freedom (Chen et al. 2013, Simandan 2018, Whitehead et al. 2016). Downward social mobility is a case where individuals are particularly liable to experiences that entail a range of negative physical health outcomes (Alcántara et al. 2014).

Dalia: educational background, work, and identity

Dalia moved to Norway after completing 5-year studies in psychology and gaining her first 6 months of professional experience as a personal consultant at a large company. While studying in Poland, she accepted seasonal work during the holidays picking strawberries in Norway. Through the Erasmus programme, she also spent a semester at a Norwegian university. She quickly 'got fascinated by Norway', and she dedicated much of her interview to describing the positive experiences she had at the Norwegian university, partly to justify her decision to move to Norway after graduation. Her plan was to secure a job at a human resources company before learning Norwegian with the ultimate goal of working as a psychotherapist. However, after migrating, Dalia quickly realised that securing her desired job in recruitment with knowledge of English but no knowledge of Norwegian would not be as easy as she had expected. At the time of the interview, Dalia had been living in Norway for 3 years. Given that she needed to earn money to finance her stay, she decided to start working as a domestic cleaner. She commented on the subject as follows:

> D: I was working as… I don't want to use the word 'cleaner', but I was cleaning those houses, those two houses.
> A: Why don't you want to use that word?

D: Because it doesn't suit me. I don't see myself in this profession, so…

A: You don't identify with it?

D: Yes, I don't identify with it at all. I understand that there's nothing bad about… If it's fine by someone and it's adequate for someone's ambitions, then okay, but for me?

During the interview, Dalia avoided calling herself 'a cleaner' by using alternative phrases such as 'working in cleaning'. Acknowledging that professions have statuses and they indicate people's positions in the social space, it is clear that the status and social meanings that are associated with working as a cleaner were unacceptable to Dalia's identity. Later in the interview, Dalia described how the experience of working below her qualifications has influenced her self-esteem:

> I would say that my self-esteem lowered drastically. I had such low self-esteem that… I had never had such low self-esteem before… It's like, you know… It's hard when you used to go to school, you were always a top student at primary school and secondary school, you used to have the best grades and diplomas with honours, and then you studied and you also graduated with the best grades and so on, and suddenly you work as a cleaner or a waitress. It was like hitting a wall.

Dalia pointed to the educational results that have shaped her self-perception, namely being a top student, achieving the best grades, and earning diplomas with honours. These educational outcomes have structured her habitus and identity. By juxtaposing these habitus attributes with the reality of working as a cleaner or waitress, Dalia's narrative offers a vivid picture of the experience of habitus mismatch. Setting aside their educational backgrounds to accept low-skilled work was difficult for the majority of participants, one of whom said, 'Lowering my qualifications, it was a painful blow, a very painful blow'. Dalia's words, which are quoted as follows, communicate the everyday psychological burden of performing a job for which she is overqualified:

I remember, I was scrubbing a bathroom [at the client's home], and I started to cry. I was scrubbing this bathroom and thought 'Geez, Dalia, what are you even doing? You are here and instead of sitting, I don't know, going back to Poland, where, in Warsaw or Krakow, you would find a job at once in human resources because your friends found jobs in human resources after graduation, so why are you even here at all? ... What are you doing here? Are you really scrubbing someone's bathroom!?'

What is interesting about this excerpt is that Dalia introduces an inner dialogue between the part of her that is cleaning a bathroom in someone's private home in Norway and the part that is a psychology graduate with superior career prospects in Poland. As Bourdieu pointed out, habitus destabilisation leads to a double perception of the self (Bourdieu 1999). Dalia's case highlights that the experience of habitus mismatch can trigger a moment of consciousness with regard to one's own habitus.

Conclusion

This article has shed light on the experience of habitus mismatch that underlies the difficulty and suffering that are associated with experiencing post-migratory downward professional mobility. Outlining the multiple habitus mismatches that migrants face enables an exploration of how downward professional mobility influences migrants' wellbeing and increases their vulnerability. The most common manifestations of self-reported poor mental health among the study participants were feelings of depression, loss of self-esteem and self-confidence, weight loss, distress, and frustration. These negative outcomes should be of particular concern since migration is increasing while research indicates that migrants are simultaneously more susceptible to underemployment than non-migrants.

By analysing experiences of class mismatch, the conflict between valued and stigmatised national identity, and the divergence between the habitus shaped by education and the performance of low-skilled work, this article has shown that multiple mismatches are intertwined with downward professional mobility and are

common among Poles who have worked below their qualifications in Norway. These experiences negatively influence their wellbeing in everyday life. Class mobility leads to the experience of 'double isolation'; that is, despite being surrounded by co-nationals with whom they work and live, participants felt different and isolated. At the same time, they reported a sense of longing and nostalgia for the 'class of origin' that they left behind in Poland. Stigma reduces them to one-dimensional Polish identities that are equated with low-skilled manual workers. From the study participants' perspective, the stigma they experience during everyday encounters places them in a disadvantageous position and categorises them exclusively as low-skilled workers. Moreover, they experience a mismatch between their professional identities and the status that is concomitant with the low-skilled jobs they perform. Drawing on Bourdieu's notion of cleft habitus, I propose to extend the concept to habitus mismatch in order to cover the habitus destabilisation that results from the multiple mismatches that have been introduced and discussed. As this article has shown, the notion of habitus mismatch facilitates the analysis of migrants' lived experiences of downward professional mobility and its associated suffering.

References

Alcántara C., Chen C.N. and Alegría M. (2014). Do Post-Migration Perceptions of Social Mobility Matter for Latino Immigrant Health? *Social Science & Medicine* 101(1): 94-106.

Ashforth B. E. and Kreiner G. E. (1999). 'How Can You Do It?': Dirty Work and the Challenge of Constructing a Positive Identity. *The Academy of Management Review* 24(3): 413-434.

Barbalet J. M. (1992). A Macro Sociology of Emotion: Class Resentment. *Sociological Theory* 10(2): 150-163.

Barbalet J. M. (1998). *Emotion, Social Theory, and Social Structure: A Macrosociological Approach*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Beaverstock J. V. (2011). Highly Skilled International Labour Migration and World Cities: Expatriates, Executives and Entrepreneurs, in: B. Derudder, M. Hoyler, P. Taylor, F. Witlox (eds), *International Handbook of Globalization and World Cities,* pp. 240-250. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing.

Bourdieu P. (1977). *Outline of a Theory of Practice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bourdieu P. (1984). *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Bourdieu P. (1987). What Makes a Social Class? On the Theoretical and Practical Existence of Groups. *Berkeley Journal of Sociology* 32: 1-18.

Bourdieu P. (1990). *The Logic of Practice*. Oxford: Polity Press.

Bourdieu P. (1991). *Language and Symbolic Power*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Bourdieu P. (1996). *The State Nobility: Elite Schools in the Field of Power*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Bourdieu P. (1999). *The Weight of the World: Social Suffering in Contemporary Society*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Bourdieu P. (2000). *Pascalian Meditations*. Oxford: Polity Press.

Bourdieu P. (2007). *Sketch for a Self-Analysis*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Cerna L. (2016). The Crisis as an Opportunity for Change? High-skilled Immigration Policies across Europe. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 42(10): 1610-1630.

Chen E. and Miller G. E. (2013). Socioeconomic Status and Health: Mediating and Moderating Factors. *Annual Review of Clinical Psychology* 9(1): 723-749.

Cruwys T., Haslam S. A., Dingle G. A., Haslam C. and Jetten J. (2014). Depression and Social Identity: An Integrative Review. *Personality and Social Psychology Review* 18(3): 215-238.

Djundeva M. and Ellwardt L. (2019). Social Support Networks and Loneliness of Polish Migrants in the Netherlands. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 1-20.

Domański H. (1991). *Klasy społeczne, grupy zawodowe, organizacje gospodarcze: struktura społeczna w krajach rozwiniętego kapitalizmu*. Warsaw: PAN.

Duemmler K. and Caprani I. (2017). Identity Strategies in Light of a Low-Prestige Occupation: The Case of Retail Apprentices. *Journal of Education and Work* 30(4): 339-352.

Duvander A. Z. E. (2001). Do Country-Specific Skills Lead to Improved Labor Market Positions? An Analysis of Unemployment and Labor Market Returns to Education among Immigrants in Sweden. *Work and Occupations* 28(2): 210-233.

Dyrlid L. M. 2017, *Transnasjonalisme mellom stolthet og stigma: polske migranters narrativer om arbeid, tilhørighet og posisjonering,* PhD diss., Trondheim: Norwegian University of Science and Technology.

Egge-Hoveid K. (2017). Utdanning in: S. Vrålstad, K. S. Wiggen (eds), *Levekår blant innvandrere i Norge 2016,* pp. 93-101. Oslo: SSB.

Esses V. M., Dietz J. and Bhardwaj A. (2006). The Role of Prejudice in the Discounting of Immigrant Skills in: R. Mahalingam (ed.) *Cultural Psychology of Immigrants,* pp. 113-130. Mahwah: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers.

Friberg J. H. (2010). Working Conditions for Polish Construction Workers and Domestic Cleaners in Oslo: Segmentation, Inclusion and the Role of Policy, in: R. Black, G. Engbersen, M. Okólski, C. Panţîru (eds), *A Continent Moving West?: EU Enlargement and Labour Migration from Central and Eastern Europe,* pp. 23-50. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.

Friberg J. H. (2012). Culture at Work: Polish Migrants in the Ethnic Division of Labour on Norwegian Construction Sites. *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 35(11): 1914-1933.

Friberg J. H. and Eldring L. (2011). *Polonia i Oslo 2010: mobilitet, arbeid og levekår blant polakker i hovedstaden*. Oslo: Fafo.

Friberg J. H. and Midtbøen A. H. (2017). Ethnicity as Skill: Immigrant Employment Hierarchies in Norwegian Low-Wage Labour Markets. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 44(9): 1463-1478.

Friberg J. H. and Midtbøen A. H. (2019). The Making of Immigrant Niches in an Affluent Welfare State. *International Migration Review* 53(2): 322-345.

Goffman E. (1968). *Stigma: Notes on the Management of Spoiled Identity*. Harmondsworth: Penguin.

Goul Andersen J. and Jensen P. H. (2002). Citizenship, Changing Labour Markets and Welfare Policies: an Introduction, in: *Changing Labour Markets, Welfare Policies and Citizenship,* pp. 1-13. Bristol:Policy Press.

Grzymała-Kazłowska A. (2005). From Ethnic Cooperation to In-Group Competition: Undocumented Polish Workers in Brussels. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 31(4): 675-697.

Guðjónsdóttir G. (2014). 'We Blend in with the Crowd but They Don't': (In)Visibility and Icelandic Migrants in Norway. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research* 4(4): 176-183.

Guðjónsdóttir G. and Loftsdóttir K. (2017). Being a Desirable Migrant: Perception and Racialisation of Icelandic Migrants in Norway. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 43(5): 791-808.

Hudson D. L. (2015). All That Glitters is Not Gold: Social Mobility, Health and Mental Health among African Americans, in: M. S. Sherraden, N. Morrow-Howell (eds), *Financial Capability and Asset Holding in Later Life: a Life Course Perspective,* pp. 27-45. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Jenkins R. (2002). *Pierre Bourdieu*. London: Routledge.

Jenkins R. (2008). *Social Identity*. London: Routledge.

Jetten J., Haslam A. H., Cruwys T. and Branscombe N. R. (2017). Social Identity, Stigma, and Health, in: B. Major, J. F. Dovidio, B. G. Link (eds), *The Oxford Handbook of*

Stigma, Discrimination, and Health, pp. 301-316. New York: Oxford University Press.

Link B. G. and Phelan J. (2014). Stigma Power. *Social Science & Medicine* 103: 24-32.

Loftsdóttir K. (2017). Being 'the Damned Foreigner': Affective National Sentiments and Racialization of Lithuanians in Iceland. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research* 7(2): 70-78.

Major B., Dovidio J. F. and Link B. G. 2017. The Oxford Handbook of Stigma, Discrimination, and Health. New York: Oxford University Press.

Major B., Dovidio J. F., Link B. G. and Calabrese S. K. (2017). Stigma and Its Implications for Health: Introduction and Overview, in: B. Major, J. F. Dovidio, B. G. Link (eds), *The Oxford Handbook of Stigma, Discrimination, and Health,* pp. 3-28. New York: Oxford University Press.

Man G. (2004). Gender, Work and Migration: Deskilling Chinese Immigrant Women in Canada. *Women's Studies International Forum* 27(2): 135-148.

Nowicka M. (2014). Migrating Skills, Skilled Migrants and Migration Skills: the Influence of Contexts on the Validation of Migrants Skills. *Migration Letters* 11(2): 171-186.

Nowicka M. (2018). Cultural Precarity: Migrants' Positionalities in the Light of Current Anti-immigrant Populism in Europe. *Journal of Intercultural Studies* 39(5): 527-542.

OECD (2018). *International migration outlook 2018*. Paris: OECD Publishing

Patzelt A. (2017). 'A Totally New World Has Been Opening up for Me' – Experiences of Older German Migrants Who Are Actively Involved in the German-Speaking Community in Ottawa, Canada. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 43(2): 218-234.

Pawlak M. (2018). *Zawstydzona tożsamość. Emocje, ideologie i władza w życiu polskich migrantów w Norwegii*. Kraków: Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Jagiellonskiego.

Prasad P., D'Abate C. and Prasad A. (2007). Organizational Challenges at the Periphery: Career Issues for the Socially Marginalized, in: H. Gunz, M. A. Peiperl (eds), *Handbook of career studies,* pp. 169-187. Los Angeles: Sage.

Revold M. K. (2017). Arbeid og arbeidsmiljø, in: S. Vrålstad, K. S. Wiggen (eds), *Levekår blant innvandrere i Norge 2016,* pp. 102-119. Oslo :SSB.

Rich Madsen K., Trab Damsgaard M., Smith Jervelund S., Christensen U., Stevens G. G. W. J. M., Walsh S., Koushede V., Nielsen L., Due P. and Holstein B. E. (2016). Loneliness, Immigration Background and Self-Identified Ethnicity: a Nationally Representative Study of Adolescents in Denmark. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 42(12): 1977-1995.

Rzepnikowska A. (2019). Racism and Xenophobia Experienced by Polish Migrants in the UK Before and After Brexit Vote. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 45(1): 61-77.

Salmonsson L. and Mella O. (2013). Cultural Demands on Skilled Immigrants, a Devaluation of Human Capital. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research* 3(1): 3-9.

Sert D. (2016). From Skill Translation to Devaluation: the De-Qualification of Migrants in Turkey. *New Perspectives on Turkey* 54(54): 97-117 (accessed 10.09.2019).

Siar S. (2013). From Highly Skilled to Low Skilled: Revisiting the Deskilling of Migrant Labor. Online: https://www.econstor.eu/handle/10419/126949 (accessed 10.09.2019).

Simandan D. (2018). Rethinking the Health Consequences of Social Class and Social Mobility. *Social Science & Medicine* 200: 258-261.

Simpson R., Slutskaya N., Lewis P. and Höpfl H. (2012). Introducing Dirty Work, Concepts and Identities, in: R. Simpson, N. Slutskaya, P. Lewis, H. Höpfl (eds), *Dirty Work: Concepts and Identities,* pp. 1-18. Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan.

SSB (2018), *Innvandrere og norskfødte med innvandrerforeldre*, Online: https://www.ssb.no/befolkning/statistikker/innvbef (accessed 10.09.2019).

Syed J. (2008). Employment Prospects for Skilled Migrants: A Relational Perspective. *Human Resource Management Review* 18(1): 28-45.

Tajfel H. and Turner J. C. (1986). The Social Identity Theory of Inter-Group Behavior, in: S. Worchel & W. G. Austin (eds), *Psychology of Intergroup Relations,* pp. 33-47. Chicago: Burnham Inc Pub.

Thompson E. N. (2000). Immigrant Occupational Skill Outcomes and the Role of Region-Specific Human Capital. Online: http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.465.3476&rep=rep1&type=pdf (accessed 10.09.2019).

Trevena P. (2013). Why Do Highly-Skilled Educated Migrants Go for Low-Skilled Jobs? A Case Study of Polish Graduates Working in London in: B. Glorius, A. Kuvik, I. Grabowska-Lusinska (eds), *Mobility in Transition - Migration Patterns after EU Enlargement,* pp. 169-190. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.

van Den Broek T. and Grundy E. (2017). Loneliness among Polish Migrants in the Netherlands: The Impact of Presence and Location of Partners and Offspring. *Demographic Research* 37: 727-742.

van Heuckelom K. (2013). Londoners and Outlanders: Polish Labour Migration through the European Lens. *The Slavonic and East European Review* 91(2): 210-234.

van Riemsdijk M. (2010). Variegated Privileges of Whiteness: Lived Experiences of Polish Nurses in Norway. *Social & Cultural Geography* 11(2): 117-137.

van Riemsdijk M. (2013). Everyday Geopolitics, the Valuation of Labour and the Socio-Political Hierarchies of Skill: Polish Nurses in Norway. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 39(3): 373-390.

Vianello F. A. (2014). Ukrainian Migrant Workers in Italy: Coping with and Reacting to Downward Mobility. *Central and Eastern European Migration Review* 3(1): 85-98.

Wacquant L. (2013). Symbolic Power and Group-Making: On Pierre Bourdieu's Reframing of Class. *Journal of Classical Sociology* 13(2): 274-291.

Whitehead M., Pennington A., Orton L., Nayak S., Petticrew M., Sowden A. and White M. (2016). How Could Differences in 'Control over Destiny' Lead to Socio-Economic Inequalities in Health? A Synthesis of Theories and Pathways in the Living Environment. *Health and Place* 39: 51-61.

ARTICLE 3.

DOWNWARD PROFESSIONAL MOBILITY, CULTURAL DIFFERENCE, AND IMMIGRANT NICHES:

DYNAMICS OF AND CHANGES TO MIGRANTS' ATTITUDES TOWARDS INTERPERSONAL COMMUNICATION AND WORK PERFORMANCE

Abstract

Immigrants' labour market participation is a crucial indicator of their assimilation within the host societies. The workplace is a key site of intercultural transmission, where migrants receive opportunities to recognise, evaluate, and prospectively adapt to the norms, values, and standards of the new socio-cultural field. Drawing on 30 in-depth interviews with Polish migrants working below their skill level in Norway, this article analyses two work-related areas where cultural difference is encountered: (1) interpersonal communication and (2) work performance and attitude. Migrants take jobs in niche economies, thereby working below their qualifications. Degradation has an effect on their encounters with non-migrants, not only limiting their opportunities to encounter non-migrants, but also hindering meaningful contacts. This, in turn, hinders immigrants from recognising the cultural codes typical for the host community. A purely occasional contact with non-migrants, who usually decide the future of immigrants' careers, leads to numerous cultural misunderstandings and cultural distrust in the long-term. Those migrants who work outside of immigrant niches more easily comprehend cultural differences; as a result, they more effectively adapt in Norway. In the Bourdieu-inspired theoretical framework I propose to recognise 'moments of consciousness' of the habitus as key moments in the reflexive adaptation process, offering a new perspective on habitus change as an element of adaptation to a new socio-cultural working environment.

Introduction

As migratory flows steadily increase and societies undergo 'transition to diversity' (Alba et al. 2014: 266, Antonsich 2018), this transition abounds in processes related to experienced encounters with cultural differences, rendering these encounters a particularly interesting topic within the current debate on human mobility (Nowicka and Vertovec 2014, Berg et al. 2019, Amin 2002, Antonsich 2018).

Immigrants continue to face obstacles to equal participation in host labour markets and other dimensions of social life (e.g. Salmonsson and Mella 2013, van Riemsdijk 2013, Sert 2016). Compared with non-migrants, immigrants more often suffer from underemployment, precarious positions, and discrimination in host labour markets (e.g. Midtbøen 2019, 2015, Friberg and Midtbøen 2019, Bendixsen 2018, Sert 2016, Nowicka 2018a). These inequalities result in ethnic segmentation of labour markets and the emergence of immigrant niches (Waldinger 1994, Rath 2002, Bauder 2006b, Bauder 2008, Friberg and Midtbøen 2019, 2017).

The emergence of research on immigrant niches has introduced an important strand of literature to the discourse on ethnic segmentation of the labour markets. Scholars have considered the influence of various factors like migrant networks (e.g. Tilly 1990, Massey et al. 1993), labour market demand and employers preferences (Waldinger 1994, Rath 2002) in the formation of immigrant niches. In the Norwegian context, research on immigrant niches has paid particular attention to employers' perspectives (Friberg and Midtbøen 2019, 2017), showing that Norwegian employers ascribe certain stereotypes to particular national migrant groups. Both in the US and European contexts, studies on immigrant niches have been concerned with the formation of immigrant niches – the reasons and processes that underlie their emergence. In this article, I would like to move the discussion towards the topic of

migrants' cultural adaptation by analysing how working in immigrant niches influences migrants' adaptation to the new culture. I use the term 'immigrant niche' to address certain workplaces that cluster immigrants within and across occupations and industries; for example, specified restaurant chains operate both restaurants that exclusively employ Norwegians and restaurants that employ a majority of immigrants, as well as mixed ones. Further, such niche workplaces maybe more or less multinational, sometimes concentrating immigrants from a particular country, or employing migrants of different origins and few Norwegians.

While a workplace is a key site of intercultural transmission of values, norms, and cultural codes, organisations are one of the crucial actors in developing and implementing strategies that foster immigrants' socio-cultural inclusion (Syed 2008, Riemsdijk et al. 2016, van Tonder et al. 2014). As van Tonder and Soontiens (2014) note 'for those migrants who secure some form of employment relatively early in their settlement in the host country, the work setting becomes a proxy for "community" by virtue of its social character and dynamics.'. Investigating into immigrant niche workplaces thus helps to shed light on migrants' everyday encounters with others and the impact of working in immigrant niches on immigrants' perceptions of host society members.

Additionally, as van Riemsdijk et al. observe (2016: 22), adaptation into new places remains a major obligation for immigrants' who are often expected to accommodate to the host society and the workplace and not vice-versa. Thus, immigrants experience the adaptation as a one-sided process (Cederberg 2015: 40, Erdal et al. 2013: 869), with receiving country members seemingly exempt from adapting to immigrants (Riemsdijk et al. 2016, Cederberg 2015).

This article is particularly interested in the impact of working in and beyond immigrant niches on migrants' cultural adaptation to the new socio-cultural field. The analysis is guided by the following two research questions: (1) how does working in and beyond immigrant niches influences Polish migrants' adaptation in Norway?, and

(2) how do encounters of cultural difference influence Polish migrants' perceptions of interpersonal communication and their work attitudes? The article analyses the conditions that foster and hinder cultural adaptation and the capacities that migrants develop to tackle difference through the meaning-making processes in their encounters with Norwegians. The article analyses participants' struggles over the meaning of interpersonal conduct, their perceptions of differing cultural codes, and attitudes towards performing work. It shows how the experience of cultural difference influences transformation of their perceptions of interpersonal communication, work attitudes, and practices, depending on whether they remain in or escape from the migrant niche.

Relationship between organisational and national cultures

Comparison of the conditions that prevail in the fields of migrant origin and destination illuminates the background of migrants' experiences related to their intercultural encounters. When migrants seek to derive the benefits from their knowledge and capital acquired in another country, they may encounter barriers. For example, taking the initiative to perform additional tasks or working overtime are acceptable or even desirable behaviours in the Polish workplace, but may be uncommon or undesirable in countries to which Polish migrants immigrate.

In the early seventies, Dutch social psychologist Geert Hofstede (1980) analysed over 100,000 questionnaires from a cross-national database characterising organisations, and discovered that despite the high variety between organisations, the same ranking of answers could be observed by country. Departing from this observation, Hofstede has been developing his cultural dimensions theory to grasp and explain the relationship between organisational and national cultures. While his propositions have met with both credit and critique (e.g. Magala 2005, McSweeney 2009), the six dimensions characterising national organisational cultures proposed by Hofstede have gained wider recognition. Hofstede distinguished six dimensions on

which organisational cultures differed significantly across countries: 1) power distance, 2) uncertainty avoidance, 3) individualism and collectivism, 4) masculinity and femininity, 5) long- versus short-term orientation, 6) indulgence and restraint.

According to his data, Polish and Norwegian nationally-shaped organisational cultures differ in four of the dimensions in particular: power distance, uncertainty avoidance, masculinity and femininity, and indulgence and restraint. Comparison of the rates for these four dimensions for Poland and Norway provides a picture of differences between the organisational cultures typical for Poland and Norway. Organisational cultures typical for Poland are characterised by large power distance, which means that inequality in power distribution is much more expected and accepted than in Norway. Poland also has meaningfully higher values of masculinity and uncertainty indexes, indicating that gender roles are more distinct than in Norway, where they nearly overlap, and that Poles feel much more threatened by uncertain, unknown, ambiguous, or unstructured situations than Norwegians. Values of the last indicator imply that Norwegian society is characterised more by indulgence, while Polish culture more by restraint (Hofstede et al. 2013, Hofstede 1980). Although, differences amongst individuals from one country may be more pronounced than differences amongst individuals across countries, Hofstede's scales aim to outline patterns of thinking that are reflected in the meanings people in different countries attach to specified aspects of life (Hofstede and Minkov 2013, Hofstede et al. 2005).

As effective communication is crucial for cultural transmission (Suzuki 1997), the cultural differences that migrants face when entering workplaces in other countries may pose issues for some of them. Those who lack linguistic, cultural and social resources (Deeb et al. 2015) are disadvantaged in terms of being able to transfer their professional skills into the labour market and workplaces of the host country. This has a cascading effect, impairing their access to other forms of capital as well (Deeb and Bauder 2015).

The socio-cultural and political conditions that have been influencing the mentalities of people in Poland and Norway have differed considerably for the past few decades. During the decades of Soviet Union rule over Poland, the communist party aimed to construct a working-class society. Propaganda of the 'hero worker' and the discursive construction of a 'moral' working class enhanced the significance of work status and influenced workers' social lives (Thatcher and Halvorsrud 2016, Stenning 2005b). Although 30 years have passed since the collapse of communism, some authors agree that the impact of these measures has persisted in people's mentalities (Davies 2007, Stenning 2005b, 2005a, Neumann 1999, Young and Light 2001, Kuus 2004). A study conducted at the beginning of the new millennium, over a decade after the fall of communism, showed that Poles' attitudes towards work were characterised by uncertainty and competition, manifested by the emergence of a culture of long working hours and fear of taking holidays from work (Stenning 2005a).

The qualities ascribed to the Scandinavian work ethos, on the other hand, are informality, equality, and restraint, flat hierarchies and flat wage structure, and a consensual, participative, and inclusive approach to decision making and change implementation (Schramm Nielsen et al., 2004). Some authors characterise Scandinavian mentality as 'Jante mentality' (Cappelen et al. 2018, Gopal 2000), invoking Sandemose's (1936) novel 'A Fugitive Crosses his Tracks' in which he formulated the 10 rules of the Law of Jante, a fictional Danish town, to reflect the Scandinavian mentality. The main message in the rules is that no one should try to stand out, to be overtly personally ambitious, to be anything 'more' than others, to be different from others, or to consider themselves better or knowing more than others (Sandemose 1936, Gopal 2000). This ethos of modesty about one's successes and achievements is reflected in the organisational culture (Cappelen and Dahlberg 2018: 420).

The experience of cultural difference in regard to work attitudes was observed by Wolanik Boström and Öhlander (2015), who studied Polish physicians' experiences

related to their work in Swedish health care. The study participants, physicians with professional experience of working in Poland or other countries, indicated that prior to migration to Sweden they had become used to the individualistic approach to their careers and the need to take additional initiatives to achieve professional success and satisfactory earnings. They expressed disapprobation of the Swedish approach to work where the system dominates over individual initiative (Wolanik Boström and Öhlander 2015). The work attitude they perceived as desirable turned out not to apply in the Swedish workplace.

These different attitudes are also observed by employers. A study by Friberg and Midtbøen (2017, 2019) found that Norwegian employers in the fish-processing and hotel industries consider Polish workers to be singularly efficient and hard-working compared to Norwegians. Although this may seem like a positive opinion, it brings a great deal of disadvantage to employees of Polish and Eastern European origin: Norwegian employers compare them to horses, able to work physically for up to 14 hours a day, but not suited for intellectual work, service, or independent decision-making (Friberg and Midtbøen 2017: 1472-1473).

Theoretical framework: intercultural encounters and moments of consciousness of the habitus as catalysts of change

Viewing workplaces as fields in Bourdieu's sense allows for scrutiny of how immigrants' habitus responds to the encountered field difference. Habitus is an acquired system of generative schemes, which shape thoughts, perceptions and actions inherent to the particular conditions of its production (Bourdieu 1990: 55). The analysis explores participants' reflections on the changes in their internalised perceptions of interpersonal communication and effective work as 'moments of consciousness' of the habitus. Although Bourdieu's initial conceptualisations of habitus (Bourdieu 1990, 1977) emphasise the unconsciousness of the habitus, his later work allowed for 'partially conscious' aspects of the habitus, which are especially

pronounced during new experiences (Bourdieu 2005: 45). This article analyses 'moments of consciousness' of the habitus as accelerators of change, while habitus change as an element of cultural adaptation. Through the intercultural encounters, migrants gain insight into their own internalised perceptions, behaviours, and dispositions, i.e. their habitus, and tend to reflexively renegotiate and reconstruct it as a result, in order to adapt to the rules binding in the new field. Defining an interpersonal encounter as intercultural draws upon participants' beliefs in their cultural foreignness, whereas the conduct of intercultural interaction represents an adaptation experience of greater scale (Ellingsworth 1988: 261, 264-265).

Although Bourdieu's theory has often been inequitably interpreted as a rejection of change, change is basically inscribed in the theory as an effect that emerges from the constant interaction between habitus and field (Bourdieu 2005) and change is particularly dynamic when the field changes abruptly as in the case of international migration. Migrants enter the new labour market, where the unknown 'rules of the game' in Bourdieu's terms are at stake and different forms of capital are valued. They cross the boundaries of fields where people use different sets of meanings and speech codes to communicate (Kotani 2017: 463). A speech code is a resource that members of a certain speech community share for conducting and interpreting speech. This article approaches migrants' recognition of speech codes common in Norway as a cultural competence that is necessary for the recognition of the unwritten rules of the new field (Bourdieu 1984, 1990). This recognition, in turn, allows migrants to 'move from primary stratum of the meaning' to the 'stratum of secondary meanings' (Bourdieu 1984: 2-3) of both verbal and non-verbal messages in interactions with Norwegians. The concept of speech code enables analysis of people's use of resources to interpret their own and others' actions and how their views of resources change in intercultural interactions (Kotani 2017). Unequipped with the ability to interpret the cultural codes used in the field, migrants lack the 'feel

for the game' that would not only give 'the game' a subjective sense, but also a direction and an orientation (Bourdieu 1990: 66).

Research design

This study is based on data collected through 30 semi-structured interviews with Poles who worked below their level of qualifications and professional experience after moving to Norway. The semi-structured interview is a method which allows interviewees to follow their own priorities and concerns (Morawska 2018: 115) and to actively shape the research inquiry (Fedyuk and Zentai 2018: 172). To elicit the most varied picture of study participants' experiences possible, the author applied maximum variation sampling (Patton 1990), including gender, age, place of residence, educational background, and performed profession. I interviewed 12 males and 18 females between 24 and 59 years old, living in different cities, towns, and villages in Norway. Prior to migrating to Norway, study participants had completed different levels of education (5 vocational, 8 bachelor's, 15 master's, and 1 doctorate) in various disciplines. Their migration to Norway was followed by downward professional mobility, meaning that they had undertaken jobs below their level of education and work experience.

The interviews were conducted in Polish and had an average length of 1 hour and 40 minutes. The presented quotes were translated into English, with particular attention given to preserving the original meaning of participants' accounts. The Norwegian words used by participants have been preserved, as their usage is itself subject to analysis. English glosses are provided in parentheses.

I conducted narrative and thematic analysis (Bamberg 2012, Byrne 2018), having regard to the purposes and circumstances of the participants' accounts. The cross-case analysis allowed me to identify and explore the differences, similarities, and relationships within the diversity. I remained sensitive to participants' own perceptions and remained flexible in light of unexpected discoveries (Castles 2012,

Charmaz 2006). In this way, participants' accounts and own categories became an integral part of the analysis. This study is a part of a larger doctoral research project interested in experiences of downward professional mobility after immigration. Issues relating to the impact of cultural differences in work-related experiences between Poles and Norwegians has been a salient feature in the migrants' narratives and have therefore been problematised in this study.

The following sections analyse the interpretations and responses to the cultural differences encountered at the subsequent stages of professional careers in Norway. The first part of the analysis focuses on meaning-making in the intercultural communication in the job-seeking process and at work. The second part explores the change of work attitudes in light of the encountered cultural differences.

Perceptions of cultural difference in interpersonal communication
Struggles over meaning: A false smile or ordinary courtesy?

Out of the 30 study participants, 25 had begun their work in Norway in immigrant niches. At the time of the interviews, 14 still worked in such workplaces; thus, 9 had escaped from such immigrant niches, although for 4 of them, this was achieved through self-employment, where contact with Norwegians remained limited to service provider–customer relations. This reflects the fact that very few migrants have the opportunity to work in predominantly Norwegian working environments at all and especially in the initial phase of migration.

As migration theories indicate, migrant networks play an important role when migrants first settle into a new country (Grzymała-Kazłowska 2005, Massey et al. 1993, Tilly 1990). This was also the case for the participants of this study, whose social interactions when they first moved to Norway were significantly or completely limited to those with other Poles. The majority of participants commenced job seeking only after migration to Norway and, for many, job interviews were one of the few direct encounters with Norwegians. The interpretations and meanings they attached to the

conduct of these encounters significantly shaped their perceptions about Norwegians (cf. van Tonder and Soontiens 2014).

In the interviews, many study participants referred to 'false smiling' which, according to them, is common among Norwegians. Participants provided numerous examples of situations in which they were misled by this so-called false smiling. Most often, these were experiences related to job interviews and work-related situations. In the following quotation, Kaja provides an example of such a situation. At the time of the job interview, she was working as a domestic cleaner:

> I was at the job interview at a geodesic company, and the guy said to me that everything was perfect, the conversation was held in English, he said that everything was so great and so on, he seemed to be really positive. Now I already know that it's just their Norwegian-Swedish nice talking. And then he told me that if I just learnt a little Norwegian, I could come back after the summer and try to do this job or, something like that, that we could talk again. I was so happy and went out so excited from there, with a feeling that it was going work out. And I quitted the job I had at that time in order to learn Norwegian at the summer language course. The classes were held every day, during typical business hours, so I chose this course instead of the job (…) Obviously, this man, with whom the interview was so cool, has never contacted me anymore. *(Kaja; female; Bachelor's of Engineering in Geodesy and Cartography; jobs in Norway over a three-year period: domestic cleaner, kitchen assistant, seller, customer service, surveyor)*

The meaning that Kaja attached to the character and content of the job interview influenced the actions she undertook immediately after it, including resigning from her then-current job in order to study Norwegian intensively. The enthusiastic character of the verbal and non-verbal communication during the job interview made Kaja feel that learning Norwegian would secure her this job by the end of the holidays. Kaja's reference to the manner of communication characteristic of Swedes and Norwegians, which she called '*just* their Norwegian-Swedish nice talking' indicates her disdainful attitude towards the meaningfulness of such communication. She also illuminates the ways in which she tended to interpret this

'nice talking' earlier and at the time of the interview, showing the reflexive learning process of the cultural speech codes and acquisition of cultural competence for more accurate interpretation of meanings. In her own evaluation, at the time of our conversation, she could understand the speech codes better than at the beginning of her stay in Norway. During the interview, Kaja reflected widely on the intercultural encounters and her numerous misinterpretations of the conduct of these encounters. A sense of discomfort resulting from the perceived discrepancy between the positive feedback she received during job interviews and lack of any further contact from the recruiters or potential employers' side was common among participants. This is how Piotr described his experiences:

> P: Once I applied for a job somewhere, as always, Norwegians were smiling at me, 'yes, great, you've great qualifications, you're flink (*EN: good*) bla bla bla', and then it turns out that you don't get an invitation to an interview follow-up. (…)
>
> *A: So if a conversation looks like that, when they are very kind, does it make you have such a feeling that something more can result from it?*
>
> P: Yes, sometimes, it depends. But in fact, very often, when at first glance they are so kind, they try to listen to you, they smile, then you think 'Fine, it'll be ok.', and then it turns out that, there is no reply at all and that's what depresses me. *(Piotr, male, Master's degree in Hospitality and Tourism; job during six years in Norway: cleaner)*

When describing the dissonance between the promising meanings they attached to the course of the encounters and the lack of any further contact from the recruiters' side, participants tended to use Norwegian words and phrases. They often spoke about these experiences ironically, often using the Norwegian word 'flink' (*EN: good*). The use of Norwegian phrases stems from their experiences, with the implication that saying 'you are so good' in Norwegian does not bear the same meaning or expected consequences as when used in Polish. When they heard this statement, participants had the feeling that the employer would definitely be

interested in their candidacy. Kaja summarised her experiences with job interviews in Norway as follows:

> I have been to many job interviews [in Norway], and each of them was so positive. (…) All of them were cool, pleasant, I kept hearing that I was so flink (*EN: good*) that I spoke Norwegian. When I hear it over and over again… I'd rather they didn't say anything. (…) how many times can you hear that you're so flink and so on, but 'thank you and lykke til videre' (*EN: good luck further*).

Kaja's case exemplifies the common pattern of transformation in participants' reception of job interviewers' conduct, from enthusiasm to frustration and distrust. Most commonly, at the beginning of their stay in Norway, participants interpreted such courtesy and smiling as expressions of sympathy and favourable prognosis for their future professional careers in Norway. Although initially interpreted as promising, job interviews, accompanied by subsequent failure, led them to perceive this courtesy as fake and having a second, dissembled meaning.

Cultural distrust

Multiple experiences of uncertainty towards the meaning of Norwegian courtesy led some participants to a sense of cultural distrust, manifested by perceiving Norwegians as duplicitous. This clearly involves a perceived homogeneity of Norwegians and generalisation regarding their cultural features. Blanka explains her perception of the difference in communication between Poles and Norwegians, with respect to the meaning of being nice to someone:

> B: For example, in Poland if you like someone, then you like him and you meet with him, and in Norway if someone is nice to you, he or she doesn't necessarily like you. If someone smiles at you, it doesn't mean that he or she likes you. (…) So here, there are some double standards, some official, the official level where you can talk and the one that can be [more appropriate] at home somewhere, not with everyone.
>
> *A: So this is such kindness, right? In these public places, because it is about situations at work?*

> B: In general about all their thinking, there are such two faces, the one for people, and the other at home. *(Blanka, female, Bachelor's degree in Social Psychology, job during five years in Norway: kitchen employee)*

This cultural distrust is particularly articulated by the use of the phrases 'double standards' and 'two faces', which illustrate that courtesy in everyday encounters is perceived as disjunct from what the interlocutors 'really think'. Like many other participants, Blanka perceived being nice to someone regardless of one's real feelings to comprise a double standard and to be insincere. In reference to the experiences which Blanka shared with me, I asked her whether she had experienced any cultural clashes with her husband, who is Norwegian. She described extensively their negotiations over the appropriate and inappropriate ways of expressing feelings and emotions, stating:

> I always say what I think and he now teaches me that I can't say what I think because we'll have a child and it is safe for the child to talk appropriately what should be said, that some things are not proper to talk about, that certain issues are to be kept for ourselves.

Negotiations with her husband had led her to reflect on transforming her own perceptions of the 'natural' ways of expressing and communicating feelings and thoughts. I propose calling such reflections 'moments of consciousness of the habitus', bringing attention to the turning points for habitus change. The encounter with cultural differences facilitated Blanka's reflexive insights into her own, previously unconscious, culturally-shaped predispositions and perceptions. Although Blanka consciously reflected on her own attitudes, she simultaneously evinced cultural distrust towards the honesty of what she perceived as a more Norwegian way of communication (for example, restraint in expressing feelings). During the interview, it emerged that apart from contact with her husband, her relations with Norwegians were rather limited, although she had worked for five years in a company employing

dozens of workers. After Blanka had told me about the multinational character of her workplace, I asked her whether Norwegians also worked there. She replied as follows:

> B: There was one Norwegian guy, my husband, and one girl, and once there was an assistant who was Norwegian. While 70 people work there now so...
> A: *Do you have any idea why it's like that?*
> B: Because lots of immigrants work here, and that's why Norwegians don't work here.
> A: *But don't they take these kind of jobs or how it's like? Because they probably work somewhere right?*
> B: They just don't want to work with those [non-Norwegian] people, I don't know why. But there are other restaurants [operated by the same company] where exclusively Norwegians work.

Although Blanka had direct access to Norwegian culture, had a Norwegian partner and was a member of a Norwegian family, her contact with Norwegians at the workplace was only occasional.

Outside of immigrant niches

Those immigrants who do work among Norwegians demonstrate a greater appreciation of what they perceive as the Norwegian work style and way of communicating. Marlena was one of the few who had gained longer, desired work experience in Norway in a typically Norwegian working environment. At the time of the interview, she had lived in Norway for 10 years, performing the satisfying job of a bank advisor for 4 of those years. The following quotation demonstrates how attitudes towards differences in interpersonal communication and relations change over time. Marlena said the following:

> The working environment [in Norway] is another thing. Although you might do not like each other, nobody would do anything unpleasant to anybody, right? Everyone would create such an insincere atmosphere so that everything would be beautiful and nice. Although, as I said, someone at work might actually not like you, but you can get along just great anyway! It used to annoy me in the past as I used to think that it's better to be honest. Not like here; 'you have the

same smile for all the time', and one just doesn't know how to interpret it. But after some time, I came to the conclusion that it's better! I don't need to meet with him after work after all, I don't go to the parties with them, I just spend time at work with him, so actually, 'let's be humans' I thought, great! It's really cool. *(Marlena; female; master's degree in Economics; jobs during 10 years in Norway: domestic cleaner, banking apprentice, bank advisor)*

This quote shows the reflexive transformation of Marlena's attitude towards expressing her opinions and feelings. From perceiving the Norwegian way of relating and communicating in terms of insincerity and dishonesty, she changed her perception to view this as a more human way of relating at work. She pointed to her previous struggles with interpreting the meaning of Norwegian interlocutors' smiles in conversations, but the opportunity to work with Norwegians facilitated her recognition and adaptation to new cultural codes. Marlena's case shows how cultural distrust can change to appreciation. Working with Norwegians enabled her to achieve a different understanding of the cultural codes, and to adjust to the Norwegian speaking community. Learning new cultural codes is a valuable resource and contributes to accumulation of country-specific capital and cultural competence allowing for adaptation.

Work performance and work attitudes

Attempts to recognise the 'rules of the game'

The study participants struggled not only with the meanings of verbal and non-verbal communication as shown above, but also strived to comprehend the rules at work and to acquire recognition for their capital. Ola discussed her experiences working as a kitchen assistant in a restaurant as follows:

It was very difficult for me not to be able to guess or discover the rules that were binding at work. I mean that I feel that I could never understand what the Norwegian employer actually expected from me. *(Ola; female; master's degree in Human Resources; jobs during 4.5 years in Norway: kitchen employee, restaurant assistant and cleaner, self-employed Norwegian language teacher)*

In many cases, the boss was the only Norwegian in the workplace; thus, migrants had little opportunity to observe from co-workers the work attitudes that would be more common for Norwegian workplaces. Ola's experience of uncertainty regarding the expectations from the employer's side was not uncommon. The majority of participants reported that they struggled with the lack of recognition of the effort they put into performing tasks at work. Despite being overqualified for the jobs they performed, they attempted to perform their work as well as possible and expected those efforts to be noticed. The following quote illustrates how Ola continued to reflect upon her experiences and her disappointed expectations towards employers' response to her efforts:

> I came to conclusion that OK., maybe it simply works like this: there are some things required to be done and no one is going to be glad that I've done them, so I accepted this fact. But then I realised that no matter how good I was at fulfilling my tasks even if I worked my fingers to the bone, no one would note my effort, even if I had been reporting for work half an hour earlier every day, even if I had been taking the earlier train in order not to be late and if I had been starting my work half an hour earlier than I was supposed to and had been preparing and cutting and stuff, even if I had been doing really, really well, even if… just no way, forget it.

Lack of recognition of what Ola perceived as a desirable work performance led her to feel frustrated. Like many participants, Ola perceived being a hard-working employee as valuable capital. The features which participants tended to indicate as desirable in an employee were: taking the initiative to perform tasks beyond one's duties, willingness to work additional hours, and supreme productivity. These perceptions may stem from how attitudes towards work in the Polish work environment have been shaped from the legacy of the 'hero worker' propaganda (Thatcher and Halvorsrud 2016, Stenning 2005b, 2005a). However, as the further analysis will demonstrate, in favourable conditions, migrants changed their perceptions of what a 'good worker' is.

The study participants who had the chance to work beyond immigrant niches came to recognise not only the new cultural codes, but also the differences between their attitudes and what they perceived to be a more Norwegian work attitude. They then consciously adapted to the new work mode, either by redefining or preserving their capital, depending on whether their work attitude met with rejection or appreciation. Prior to his migration to Norway, Hubert had participated in an international project, performing a high-rank function and cooperating with Norwegian colleagues. At an employee meeting, employees were asked to write their reflections regarding a problem raised during the meeting and to send them to the leaders by Thursday (several days after the meeting). Hubert recalled this incident as follows:

> So I came back from this meeting, I sat down at the computer, wrote what I had to, and sent it. A moment later, one of the leaders came up to me and said 'Hubert, if we say that we'll do something by Thursday, then send it to me on Thursday morning, on Wednesday afternoon at the earliest, don't send it to me immediately'. And I did it in a Polish way, you know, I had the answer in my head, and in Poland, there was a saying, 'we do impossible things immediately, whereas for a miracle, we need less than 7 days', but the impossible we do at once. *(Hubert; male; master's degree in National Defence; jobs during 11 years in Norway: cleaner, handy man. Prior to migration, he performed highly skilled work in an international project in Norway)*

Hubert interpreted his attitude towards performing the given tasks as a collective and common feature of Poles, not as his own individual attitude. Although he perceived the immediate completion of the task as part of the capital of a hard-working employee, his attitude and behaviour met with disapproval and rejection. Thus, the capital that Hubert considered valuable, in the form of his approach to performing the job, went unrecognised and was even disapproved of. Immediate task realisation, promptness, and hard work also appeared in Kamil's narrative, who recollected his work performance as a kitchen employee as follows:

> I was doing a lot by myself, I was running back and forth, I was working hard like a fool to impress my boss, to make him see what I am able to do, dumb me right? (laughs) Let him appreciate me, and he kept telling me 'yes. I'll extend your contact', but he never really wanted to extend it. *(Kamil; male; master's degree in Political Science; jobs during five years in Norway: platform employee, kitchen employee, bus driver)*

Kamil treated hard work and making a special effort as means of improving the job contract, which indicates his perception of the right way to conduct work. In the quotation, he evaluates his previous work attitude as 'dumb', showing that his approach has significantly changed since then.

Adjusting to the field: change in work attitudes

When illuminating his current work attitude, Kamil expressed his appreciation of the Scandinavian work attitude on numerous occasions, as exemplified by his utterance:

> Well, all that [Scandinavian] laid-back attitude. I have already learnt it and I like it a lot. I stopped hurrying, at least at work. I remember when I started, when I came to work, and for example, how stupid I was running around this bus parking lot and looking for this bus, and then it turned out that it was somewhere at a service station or something. But wait, I came to work, I clocked in on time like always, I fulfilled my duty. Now, if someone parked the bus somewhere else, or that someone did something, it's simply not my business. (...) Now, when they tell me that there is no bus available for me, it's different, but at that time, 1.5 years ago, I would have been sitting there drenched in sweat and worrying about what I would be doing in two hours and that I would be late. Now [in such situation] I go out, take coffee and say to them: if you find [a bus], I'll be there and you can let me know. Really... One probably has to learn it or get used to it... I can tell you honestly, I feel that I fit in here in Norway, I feel good here.

Kamil's case exemplifies the gradual transformation of his habitus. He reflects in detail on the work attitudes that have changed due to self-reflection incited by 'moments of consciousness' of the habitus. The change does not, however, follow immediately. The change is a lengthy process, as the habitus does not automatically

adjust to the new field (Bourdieu 2005). Kamil already appreciated the Scandinavian work mode on the occasion of his first job in Norway on the oil platform, as illustrated below:

> I loved to work with Scandinavians, especially with Danes. It's not without reason that they are considered probably the happiest nation in the world according to some research, really. The work used to begin with drinking coffee. Yes. Then, we checked together what should be done, and then we had a coffee again.

The change of his own approach to work was not immediate. A change of internalised perceptions involves a long-lasting reflexive process and is related to whether migrants obtain the opportunity to become acquainted with Norwegian culture by working in the Norwegian or Scandinavian environment and whether their capital, or more precisely what they perceive to comprise the capital of a good worker, becomes recognised. As boasting and 'sticking one's neck out' are not appreciated in cultures that value equality like the Scandinavian culture (Smith et al. 2003, Cappelen and Dahlberg 2018), the initiatives Polish workers took in conducting additional duties met with disapproval and rejection in most cases. However, in a few cases, employers discerned the value in employees taking on additional duties and their high work rate. Marlena juxtaposed her and her co-workers' productivity as follows:

> I noticed at my workplace that I served 100-200 customers a day, while my Norwegian colleagues 20-30. I was raising the bar, it isn't cool, right? They had developed some deliberate work mode and hadn't cared so much about the result, and suddenly someone came there, and she not only talk to customers, but also knows some ways to do it faster.

As she noted, her approach to work did not necessarily meet with the approval of all of her co-workers, but in the interview, Marlena widely discussed her boss's appreciation and commendation of her efficiency. This shows the tendency of

migrants to preserve what they perceive as the capital of a good worker when such capital receives recognition.

Conclusions

By examining downward professional mobility among Polish migrants in Norway, this analysis has focused on problems related to working in immigrant niche workplaces. Working in non-Norwegian working environments effectively hinders migrants from recognition of cultural codes and 'the rules of the game' prevailing in the new field. In many cases, the multiple intercultural misunderstandings lead to feelings of cultural distrust and uncertainty. This study proposes linking Bourdieu's concept of habitus change with cultural adaptation. Habitus change is reflected in participants' reflexive evaluation of their own internalised perceptions and dispositions regarding ways of communication and work performance.

The study is limited by its sample, as it only included Polish migrants who were experiencing downward professional mobility after their migration. However, the cases of those who eventually escaped immigrant niches and worked in jobs corresponding to their qualifications provided valuable insights into the outcomes for cultural adaptation in groups with different professional trajectories. Nonetheless, this investigation would undoubtedly benefit from further research investigating the link between cultural adaptation and differing professional trajectories (downward, upward and horizontal) among migrants.

References

Alba R and Foner N (2014) Comparing Immigrant Integration in North America and Western Europe: How Much Do the Grand Narratives Tell Us? *International Migration Review* 48: S263-S291.

Amin A (2002) Ethnicity and the Multicultural City: Living with Diversity. *Environment & Planning* 34: 959-980.

Antonsich M (2018) Living in Diversity: Going Beyond the Local/National Divide. *Political Geography* 63: 1-9.

Bamberg M (2012) Narrative Practice and Identity Navigation. In: Holstein JA and Gubrium JF (eds) *Varieties of Narrative Analysis.* Los Angeles: Sage, 99-124.

Bauder H (2006) *Labor Movement: How Migration Regulates Labor Markets.* Cary: Oxford University Press.

Bauder H (2008) Citizenship as Capital: The Distinction of Migrant Labor. *Alternatives: Global, Local, Political* 33: 315-333.

Bendixsen S (2018) Differentiation of Rights in the Norwegian Welfare State: Hierarchies of Belonging and Humanitarian Exceptionalism. *Social Inclusion* 6: 162-171.

Berg LM and Nowicka M (2019) *Studying Diversity, Migration and Urban Multiculture. Convivial Tools for Research and Practice.* UCL Press.

Bourdieu P (1977) *Outline of a Theory of Practice.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bourdieu P (1984) *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste.* Cambridge: Harvard University Press

Bourdieu P (1990) *The Logic of Practice.* Oxford: Polity Press.

Bourdieu P (2005) Habitus. In: Hillier J, Rooksby E and Habitus (eds) *Habitus: A Sense of Place.* 2nd ed. Aldershot: Ashgate, 43-49.

Byrne B (2018) Qualitative Interviewing. In: Seale C (ed) *Researching Society and Culture.* 4th ed. London: Sage.

Cappelen C and Dahlberg S (2018) The Law of Jante and Generalized Trust. *Acta Sociologica* 61: 419-440.

Castles S (2012) Understanding the Relationship between Methodology and Methods. In: Vargas-Silva C (ed) *Handbook of Research Methods in Migration.* Cheltenham: Edward Elgar.

Cederberg M (2015) Embodied Cultural Capital and the Study of Ethnic Inequalities. In: D'Angelo A, Ryan L and Erel U (eds) *Migrant Capital: Networks, Identities and Strategies.* 1st ed. London: Palgrave Macmillan

Charmaz K (2006) *Constructing Grounded Theory: A Practical Guide through Qualitative Analysis.* London: Sage.

Davies N (2007) *Europe East and West.* London: Pimlico.

Deeb S and Bauder H (2015) Breaking through the Glass Ceiling: Intercultural Communication and the Career Experiences of Skilled Immigrant Managers. In: D'Angelo A, Ryan L and Erel U (eds) *Migrant Capital: Networks, Identities and Strategies.* 1st ed. London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Ellingsworth H (1988) A Theory of Adaptation in Intercultural Dyads. In: Gudykunst WB and Kim YY (eds) *Theories in Intercultural Communication.* Newbury Park: Sage.

Erdal MB and Oeppen C (2013) Migrant Balancing Acts: Understanding the Interactions between Integration and Transnationalism. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 39: 867-884.

Fedyuk O and Zentai V (2018) The Interview in Migration Studies: A Step Towards a Dialogue and Knowledge Co-Production? In: Zapata-Barrero R and Yalaz E (eds) *Qualitative Research in European Migration Studies.* Cham: Springer, 171-188.

Friberg JH and Midtbøen AH (2017) Ethnicity as Skill: Immigrant Employment Hierarchies in Norwegian Low-Wage Labour Markets. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 44: 1463-1478.

Friberg JH and Midtbøen AH (2019) The Making of Immigrant Niches in an Affluent
Welfare State. *International Migration Review* 53: 322-345.

Gopal K (2000) Janteloven - Modviljen Mod Forskellighed. *Tidskriftet antropologi* 42:
23-43.

Grzymała-Kazłowska A (2005) From Ethnic Cooperation to in-Group Competition:
Undocumented Polish Workers in Brussels. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration
Studies* 31: 675-697.

Hofstede G (1980) *Culture's Consequences: International Differences in Work-
Related Values.* Beverly Hills: Sage.

Hofstede G and Hofstede GJ (2005) *Cultures and Organizations: Software of the
Mind.* New York: McGraw-Hill.

Hofstede G and Minkov M (2013) *Values Survey Module 2013 Manual*. Available at:
https://geerthofstede.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Manual-VSM-
2013.pdf.

Kotani M (2017) Dynamic Nature of Boundaries of Speech Communities: Learning
and Negotiating Codes in Intercultural Communication. *Journal of
Intercultural Communication Research* 46: 463-477.

Kuus M (2004) Europe's Eastern Expansion and the Reinscription of Otherness in
East-Central Europe. *Progress in Human Geography* 28: 472-489.

Magala S (2005) *Cross-Cultural Competence.* London: Routledge.

Massey DS, Arango J, Hugo G, et al. (1993) Theories of International Migration: A
Review and Appraisal. *Population and Development Review* 19: 431.

McSweeney B (2009) Dynamic Diversity: Variety and Variation within Countries.
Organization Studies 30: 933-957.

Midtbøen A (2015) Etnisk Diskriminering I Arbeidsmarkedet. *Tidsskrift for
samfunnsforskning* 56: 3-30.

Midtbøen A (2019) Discrimination at Work: The Case of Norway. In: Vassilopoulou J, Brabet J and Showunmi V (eds) *Race Discrimination and Management of Ethnic Diversity and Migration at Work.* Emerald Publishing Limited, 153-173.

Morawska E (2018) Qualitative Migration Research: Viable Goals, Open-Ended Questions, and Multidimensional Answers. In: Zapata-Barrero R and Yalaz E (eds) *Qualitative Research in European Migration Studies.* Cham: Springer, 113-131.

Neumann IB (1999) *Uses of the Other: "The East" in European Identity Formation.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Nowicka M (2018) Cultural Precarity: Migrants' Positionalities in the Light of Current Anti-Immigrant Populism in Europe. *Journal of Intercultural Studies* 39: 527-542.

Nowicka M and Vertovec S (2014) Comparing Convivialities: Dreams and Realities of Living-with-Difference. *European Journal of Cultural Studies* 17: 341-356.

Patton MQ (1990) *Qualitative Evaluation and Research Methods.* Newbury Park: Sage.

Rath J (2002) A Quintessential Immigrant Niche? The Non-Case of Immigrants in the Dutch Construction Industry. *Entrepreneurship & Regional Development* 14: 355-372.

Riemsdijk M, Basford S and Burnham A (2016) Socio-Cultural Incorporation of Skilled Migrants at Work: Employer and Migrant Perspectives. *International Migration* 54: 20-34.

Salmonsson L and Mella O (2013) Cultural Demands on Skilled Immigrants, a Devaluation of Human Capital. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research* 3: 3-9.

Sandemose A (1936) *A Fugitive Crosses His Tracks.* New York: Knopf.

Sert D (2016) From Skill Translation to Devaluation: The De-Qualification of Migrants in Turkey. *New Perspectives on Turkey* 54: 97-117.

Smith PB, Andersen JA, Ekelund B, et al. (2003) In Search of Nordic Management Styles. *Scandinavian Journal of Management* 19: 491-507.

Stenning A (2005a) Post-Socialism and the Changing Geographies of the Everyday in Poland. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 30: 113-127.

Stenning A (2005b) Where Is the Post-Socialist Working Class?: Working-Class Lives in the Spaces of (Post-)Socialism. *Sociology* 39: 983-999.

Suzuki S (1997) Cultural Transmission in International Organizations Impact of Interpersonal Communication Patterns in Intergroup Contexts. *Human Communication Research* 24: 147-180.

Syed J (2008) Employment Prospects for Skilled Migrants: A Relational Perspective. *Human Resource Management Review* 18: 28-45.

Thatcher J and Halvorsrud K (2016) Migrating Habitus: A Comparative Case Study of Polish and South African Migrants in the Uk. In: Ingram N, Ciarán B, Abrahams J, et al. (eds) *Bourdieu: The Next Generation. The Development of Bourdieu's Intellectual Heritage in Contemporary Uk Sociology.* London: Routledge.

Tilly C (1990) Transplanted Networks. In: Yans-McLaughlin V (ed) *Immigration Reconsidered: History, Sociology, and Politics.* New York: Oxford University Press.

van Riemsdijk M (2013) Everyday Geopolitics, the Valuation of Labour and the Socio-Political Hierarchies of Skill: Polish Nurses in Norway. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 39: 373-390.

van Tonder CL and Soontiens W (2014) Migrant Acculturation and the Workplace. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 143: 1041-1047.

Waldinger R (1994) The Making of an Immigrant Niche. *International Migration Review* 28: 3.

Wolanik Boström K and Öhlander M (2015) Renegotiating Symbolic Capital, Status, and Knowledge: Polish Physicians in Sweden. In: Cervinkova H, Buchowski M

and Uherek ZK (eds) *Rethinking Ethnography in Central Europe.* New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Young C and Light D (2001) Place, National Identity and Post-Socialist Transformations: An Introduction. *Political Geography* 20: 941-955.

APPENDIX A. INFORMED CONSENT TO PARTICIPATE IN A RESEARCH STUDY

Request for participation in research project

"Professional Degradation among Poles working in Norway"

About the project

The objective of the project is to describe a problem of professional degradation among Polish men and women working in Norway consisting in experiences of persons, who work or had been working in a profession inappropriate to their qualifications and/or education after migration. The main subjects, which will be raised in the publication will be related to career paths and work life of Polish migrants. The research is realised within the framework of doctoral dissertation in Sociology at Nord University in Bodø, Norway.

Persons of Polish origin, living in Norway for at least one year, who after migration has been working in an occupation they were overqualified for, are invited to participate in the research.

What does participation in the project imply?

Participation in the research implies giving 60-90 minutes interview: answering open questions concerning story of moving to Norway, stages of search for a job and a course of the career path on the Norwegian labour market. The interview will be recorded as an audio file, so only the soundtrack will be registered and used in the further stages of the study.

What will happen to the information about you?

All personal data will be treated confidentially, it means that I will be the only person, who will have an access to the information about your name, contact data and other, which you could be directly identified through. These data will not be published. Narrated stories and quotations from the given interviews may be published in the doctoral dissertation. Information, which also will be used includes age, gender, Polish origin and the town in which you leave in Norway. Your name can be changed, if you wish.

An access to the recorded interviews will be secured and limited to three persons: me, the supervisor of the project and transcription service provider. Transcription service provider is a person who writes down a content of the interview in a form of electronic written text. This form of data will be used as the main source of analysis in the study. The recordings will be kept in a file protected by password, separately from the list of names of persons, who will give interviews.

The project is scheduled for completion by March 31th 2020, then the data will be anonymised and identification of the research participants will not be possible. I plan to store the interviews recordings in the password protected file for own scientific use for two years from the project closure, after this time all files will be deleted.

Voluntary participation

It is voluntary to participate in the project, and you can at any time choose to withdraw your consent without stating any reason. If you decide to withdraw, all your personal data will be made anonymous.

If you would like to participate or if you have any questions concerning the project, please contact me:

> Project leader: Anna Przybyszewska
> Tel.: 902 87 999
> Email: anna.przybyszewska@nord.no

The study has been notified to the Data Protection Official for Research, NSD - Norwegian Centre for Research Data.

Consent for participation in the study

I have received information about the project and am willing to participate

………

………………………………………………………

 (Signed by participant, date)

APPENDIX B. INTERVIEW GUIDE

What kind of education do you have?

What is your profession?

What kind of work do you do in Norway?

What were the motives for moving to Norway? The main goals?

What were the circumstances of moving?

- Had the job been already organised before moving?

- Did you move with anyone or on your own?

- Where in Norway did you move to?

When and how had the process of search for a job started?

Tell the story of finding and getting a job in Norway, what were the succeeding stages in the search for a job

- What kind of experiences were attached to them?

Are you able to compare what happened to the expectations which you had had before migrating and seeking a job? What had been your idea about work here before you moved?

How do you assess the effort and time you put into getting a job?

What do you think about the Norwegian labour market? How do you evaluate possibilities of getting a job? Both in your profession and generally.

Do you think that Polish nationality played any role during the search for a job?

What differences and similarities do you see between Polish and Norwegian style of work?

Could you compare

- Polish and Norwegian working environment

- Professional relations between colleagues in Poland and Norway?

How do you feel in the Norwegian working environment?

What is/was the most difficult about working in Norway?

What are the main advantages of working in Norway?

What kind of feelings and experiences were related to the subsequent stages of your professional career in Norway?

Which of your professional competences and skills would you like to pursue professionally?

How are these competences assessed on the Norwegian labour market?

Do you think that tenor of your professional career would be different in Poland? What would be the difference?

From today's perspective, would you do anything in other way? Would you start the process of seeking a job differently?

What are your professional plans for the future?

APPENDIX C. NSD APPROVAL

NSD

Anna Przybyszewska
Universitetsalleèn 11
8026 BODØ

Tilbakemelding på melding om behandling av personopplysninger

Vi viser til melding om behandling av personopplysninger, mottatt 27.07.2017.
Meldingen gjelder prosjektet:

55193	Professional Degradation among Poles Working in Norway
Behandlingsansvarlig	Nord universitet, ved institusjonens øverste leder
Daglig ansvarlig	Anna Przybyszewska

Personvernombudet har vurdert prosjektet, og finner at behandlingen av personopplysninger vil være regulert av § 7-27 i personopplysningsforskriften. Personvernombudet tilrår at prosjektet gjennomføres.

Personvernombudets tilråding forutsetter at prosjektet gjennomføres i tråd med opplysningene gitt i meldeskjemaet, korrespondanse med ombudet, ombudets kommentarer samt personopplysningsloven og helseregisterloven med forskrifter. Behandlingen av personopplysninger kan settes i gang.

Det gjøres oppmerksom på at det skal gis ny melding dersom behandlingen endres i forhold til de opplysninger som ligger til grunn for personvernombudets vurdering. Endringsmeldinger gis via et eget skjema. Det skal også gis melding etter tre år dersom prosjektet fortsatt pågår. Meldinger skal skje skriftlig til ombudet.

Personvernombudet har lagt ut opplysninger om prosjektet i en offentlig database.

Personvernombudet vil ved prosjektets avslutning, 31.03.2020, rette en henvendelse angående status for behandlingen av personopplysninger.

Dersom noe er uklart ta gjerne kontakt over telefon.

Vennlig hilsen

Marianne Høgetveit Myhren

Dokumentet er elektronisk produsert og godkjent ved NSDs rutiner for elektronisk godkjenning.

This thesis uncovers the logic, dynamics, and meaning-making that underlie the downward professional mobility of Polish migrants in Norway. Drawing on data analysis of 30 qualitative interviews conducted with Poles working below their level of qualification in Norway, the study answers the following research question: *How do Polish migrants perceive and respond to their downward professional mobility in the Norwegian labour market?*

The study finds that perceptions of and responses to underemployment intersected with migration are strongly marked by national identity, with Polish migrants' positionality occupying an unfavourable position within the field of national hierarchies. I argue that the national component of migrants' habitus drives them into specific, low-skilled jobs, which they perceive as available to Polish migrants in Norway. Simultaneously, Polish migrants are highly aware of being discriminated against and racialised in the job-seeking process in Norway (article 1). The majority of migrants begin their professional careers in Norway in immigrant niches. The study demonstrates that working in or beyond the immigrant niche has a crucial impact on migrants' adaptation capacities (article 3). By analysing the psychosocial burdens and sociocultural mismatches related to underemployment and migration (article 2), the thesis reveals and emphasises the human side of the experiences related to downward professional mobility.

I bridge Bourdieu's concepts of habitus and field with hierarchies of desirability of national migrant groups to conceptualise the transnational field of national hierarchies (article 1). Furthermore, I develop the notion of habitus mismatch to conceptualise the conflict between valued and stigmatised identities, and the emotional dimension of this conflict (article 2). I also propose the notion of cultural distrust to address the process whereby multiple cultural misunderstandings lead to migrants' distrust towards the host community members (article 3).